



## The American Society for Ethnohistory

---

Review

Author(s): Colin G. Calloway

Review by: Colin G. Calloway

Source: *Ethnohistory*, Vol. 36, No. 2 (Spring, 1989), pp. 206-208

Published by: [Duke University Press](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/482282>

Accessed: 28-07-2015 16:55 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Duke University Press and The American Society for Ethnohistory are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Ethnohistory*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

groups of Northern Potosí. Using a structural approach, Platt analyzes material on binary logic and the quadripartite model (the organizational model of Cuzco and the empire) among the Macha.

Part 5 deals with the impact of the Spanish conquest in very specific terms in the first two articles. Wachtel discusses the Uru, and Saigned the people of the Valley of Larecaja near Lake Titicaca. The section ends with a short article by Molinié-Fioravanti on Andean communities today.

The collection's wide scope and variety of articles provides something of interest for all readers. Students of the area will find themselves in agreement with some articles and not with others, depending on their particular interests and biases. The collection shows how rich the areas covered are for research, both contemporary and archival. It also points the way toward new avenues of investigation. As a result of this and other publications on the Central and Southern Andes, we are developing a comprehensive view of the Inca and the ethnic groups within their empire.

**A Narrow Vision: Duncan Campbell Scott and the Administration of Indian Affairs in Canada.** By E. Brian Titley. (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1986. x + 265 pp., acknowledgments, introduction, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$19.95 cloth.)

Colin G. Calloway, *University of Wyoming*

Duncan Campbell Scott (1862–1947) is best known as a man of letters. As joint editor of the *Makers of Canada* series, he espoused its “great man” theory of history and national development. As one of the circle of “Confederation poets,” he portrayed noble Indians doomed to tragic disappearance. As a civil servant, however, he demonstrated little sympathy or understanding for Indians. E. Brian Titley's study reveals a man who saw real Indians as little more than an impediment to administrative uniformity and balanced account books.

Entering the Indian Department as a clerk at seventeen, Scott worked his way up through the bureaucratic echelons, culminating his career as deputy superintendent of Indian affairs from 1913 to 1932. That career spanned a period in which Canada's Indian peoples suffered disease, restricted hunting and fishing rights, land loss, acculturation by coercion, and bureaucratic control over their lives. But Scott shared the paternalistic, assimilationist, and ultimately racist views of his times. He accepted without question the wisdom of the government's Indian policy, the assumption of white supremacy, and the certainty of Indian disappearance, rationalizing the subjugation of native peoples and the suppression of their cultures as part of “the white man's burden” and a necessary stage on the road to “civilization.”

A cold and somewhat austere individual, Scott was a capable, efficient, and honest administrator (though not above resorting to manipulation and collusion to secure his ends). But his vision in Indian affairs was limited to implementing policy. Speaking in 1920 on Bill 14, a measure that would enfranchise Indians against their will and compel Indian children to attend school, Scott's sentiments echoed the goals of his government:

I want to get rid of the Indian problem. I do not think as a matter of fact, that this country ought to continuously protect a class of people who are able to stand alone. . . . Our objective is to continue until there is not a single Indian in Canada that has not been absorbed into the body politic, and there is no Indian question, and no Indian Department. (P. 50)

Before he became deputy superintendent, he served as a commissioner in the treaty-making process that deprived Cree and Ojibway Indians of some ninety thousand square miles of land and opened northern Ontario to exploitation by mining, lumber, and paper industries. Appointed superintendent of education in 1909, he took some measures to eradicate glaring abuses and improve conditions in Indian schools, but was much more energetic in using compulsory education as an instrument of social control and assimilation. He was hostile to emerging Indian political groups such as the League of the Indians of Canada, and he regarded Mohawk F. O. Loft's vision of a nationwide Indian organization as dangerously subversive and worthy of police vigilance. He opposed the Six Nations' claim to sovereign status, even interfering with hereditary government on the Grand River reserve in an effort to undermine Chief Deskeheh's authority. In an era of soaring western land values, he consistently dismissed Indian claims to aboriginal title, and the petitions of the Allied Tribes of British Columbia received equally short shrift in Ottawa and Victoria. He supported the suppression of Indian dancing and traditional rituals on the west coast and prairies. He ignored Indian opinions and dismissed as troublemakers those who protested his policies—whether the imposter Chief Thunderwater or the Six Nations delegates to Geneva. Scott preferred his Indians to disappear quietly while he lamented their passing in bland verses.

Despite an opening quotation from *National Lampoon*, this is a fairly dry study of Indian *policy* and shares the qualities and shortcomings of such studies. Titley is more concerned with the careers and ambitions of Indian Department personnel than with the Indians at the receiving end of their administration. Indians who became politically active feature in the story, but the book would benefit from more information on the effects of government policies in Canadian Indian communities and more

insight into what life was like in those communities during the era of Scott's administration.

In drawing attention to a neglected period of Canadian Indian policy, Titley makes a significant contribution. The book provides parallels with United States Indian policy and adds appreciably to our understanding of twentieth-century Canadian Indian affairs. In concentrating on administration, Titley leaves the field open for future studies and alternative perspectives on this critical period of Indian relations. The challenge for those studies will be to incorporate views and material from Caughnawaga, Grand River, and Duck Lake, Saskatchewan, as well as from Ottawa.

**A History of the Navajos: The Reservation Years.** By Garrick Bailey and Roberta Glenn Bailey. (Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 1986. xx + 360 pp., preface, acknowledgments, introduction, photographs, figures, charts, maps, tables, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$30.00 cloth.)

Laura Graves Allen, *Northern Arizona University*

Garrick Bailey comes to Navajo history through the generosity of a colleague who needed research on Navajo occupation in the Farmington, New Mexico, area. At that time Bailey had "little research interest in the Navajos" (p. xv). His qualifications were limited to one semester as David Aberle's research assistant and having lived with two Navajo students while at the University of Oklahoma. Roberta Bailey's knowledge came from having been raised in Arizona. As Garrick Bailey admits, he was not what one would call a Navajo specialist, but he "was an ethnohistorian" (p. xv). Whether *A History of the Navajos* was intended to be an ethnohistory of the Navajos or whether being an ethnohistorian was justification for Garrick Bailey's involvement in the initial project is not clear. The product is not an ethnohistory as defined by Edward Spicer in *The Yaquis: A Cultural History* (1980). Spicer defined ethnohistory as the "interpretation of documented events in the past by means of the knowledge of situations which anthropologists have gained through direct study of living societies" (p. xiii). The insights from the Baileys' fourteen months of fieldwork during a two-year period are difficult to ascertain. This book is a very narrowly focused economic history of the Navajos who live in the San Juan River valley. Because they focus their attention almost exclusively on this small region of the nation's largest Indian reservation, their conclusions are limited and narrowly focused. There is little discussion of the economics of the western reservation or explanations for such puzzles as the cultural and political conservatism of the Monument Valley Navajos.

Relying on secondary sources and some very limited primary ma-