

Book Reviews

—

I Have Lived Here since the World Began: The Illustrated History of Canada's Native People. arthur h. ray. Toronto: Key Porter Books 1996. Pp. 416, illus. 45.00

Not many years ago, teachers of undergraduate surveys of Canadian Aboriginal history had little choice when it came to selecting a suitable textbook. That began to change with the publication of J.R. Miller's *Skyscrapers Hide the Heavens* (1989) and Olive Dickason's *Canada's First Nations* (1992). Arthur Ray's *I Have Lived Here since the World Began: An Illustrated History of Canada's Native People* is the newest entry in this field, but prospective teachers of Native history courses may be misled by the book's subtitle, which suggests that it is a lavishly illustrated, 'popular' book of the coffee table variety. It is not; it is a first-rate survey that deserves serious consideration.

Charging that 'the economic history of Aboriginal people is still essentially ignored,' Ray promises that his text will examine the 'fascinating story about the many ways in which Native people took advantage of new economic developments or resisted those that offered them no benefits or degree of control' (xvii). As might be expected from Canada's leading historian of the fur trade, this aspect of the Aboriginal past is covered especially well, but Ray's treatment of the cultural, legal, and political dimensions of the Native experience should also meet with the favour of most academics.

Ray may have chosen an economic emphasis to counter 'notions such as the idea that "Indians" were by nature economically conservative and had no conceptions of commerce or systems of land and resource ownership and management' (368). In fact, he has convincingly demonstrated the flexibility and capacity for innovation in Native cultures, which, clearly, have faced obstacles perhaps greater than those of any other element of Canadian society. In this regard, Ray believes it is only through an understanding of the Aboriginal past that non-Native Canadians can begin to understand the reasons for present-day Native actions. At a time when there is a danger of a growing backlash against Native

'demands,' this book is especially relevant. Euro-Canadians who are disturbed by what might appear to be Native 'intransigence' about land claims in disputed, mineral-rich areas such as Voisey's Bay, Labrador, are well advised to read this text. Similarly, for those Canadians to whom the confrontation at Oka was a frightening surprise, Ray's survey explains the long train of provocations that drove the Mohawk to armed resistance. Native concerns are also well addressed in the case of British Columbia, where disputes over the fishery and the land claims process have frayed the nerves of Natives and non-Natives alike.

Remarkably, for a one-volume work, Ray has managed to survey thoroughly - in clear, direct language - the major contours of Inuit, Indian, and Métis history. Chronologically, the work is balanced, beginning with a brief treatment of pre-contact Canada and ending with an extended and enlightening treatment of the Delgamuukw (1991) case in which Chief Justice Allan McEachern of the British Columbia Supreme Court disallowed almost all the oral tradition painstakingly provided over the months by Gitskan and Wet'suweten hereditary chiefs and elders. The resulting decision, which concluded that 'aboriginal interests did not include ownership or jurisdiction over the territory' (364), ran against the direction of the overwhelming majority of the historical and anthropological scholarship of the past thirty years.

Ray's text is a useful corrective to the sort of thinking exemplified by the Delgamuukw decision, and one hopes it will find a wide audience. Although the colour plates are beautiful and the maps clear and relevant, too many of the small black-and-white photographs are murky. As well, the book's usefulness for academics would be enhanced by a more comprehensive bibliography. Because only a selection of book-length entries is provided, much of the recent anthropological and archaeological literature, which is in the form of journal articles, is excluded.

ralph pastore Memorial University of Newfoundland

New Worlds for All: Indians, Europeans, and the Remaking of Early America. colin g. calloway. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press 1997. Pp. xxi, 229, illus. \$24.95

The 'brave new world' that millions of immigrants were looking for when they came to the Americas after 1492 was a goal that fragmented into the multiplicity of national worlds that today makes up the Western Hemisphere. Although the basic experience throughout the two American continents and the Caribbean was similar - that of Europeans taking over from indigenous Amerindian populations - the result has been a kaleidoscope of nations at least as individualistic as the replaced Amerindian

societies. Instead of a new Europe overseas, what emerged were new American nation-states, each with its own distinctive identity. If they all speak European languages – the majority Spanish, but also English, Portuguese, and French – this feature does not reflect their national characteristics, which vary from each other even as they differ from their European models. In all these nation-states, indigenous Americans have left their imprint, to a greater or lesser degree.

In his detailed account of this process in the United States, Colin Calloway points to the active interaction that marked early relations between immigrants and indigenous peoples: although the original English settlers came with the idea of creating a new and better England, what in fact emerged was a mixed society that became a new nation. As Calloway observes, 'Human influences were as important as environmental ones in shaping the new America' (3). In spite of attempts to squeeze them out of the picture, 'Indian ways of life remained a part of the national experience' (196).

In the beginning that was not always the case; in fact, quite the opposite occurred at the outbreak of the American War of Independence, when colonists sought the support, or at least the neutrality, of Native Americans by assuring them that Americans and Indians were 'as one people, and have but one heart.' As Calloway sees it, this was 'council-fire rhetoric'; most of the founding fathers, he continues, were interested in Indian land, not in a shared Indian identity' (1). Amerindians were aware of this attitude, yet many of them supported the British Crown.

The new nation that emerged did not develop a uniform social pattern across the land. Exchanges were more extensive in the early contact period, and even today archaeologists sometimes experience difficulties in determining whether a post-contact site is Amerindian or European. Location also played a part: the Amerindian imprint is more evident in New Mexico than in New England. In these northeastern states, the Europeans prevailed, as they took over Amerindian towns such as Agawam, which became Ipswich, and Shawmut, which became Boston. Geographical features received new names, often alongside surviving Amerindian ones. Yet throughout the country as a whole, according to Lakota scholar Vine Deloria Jr, 'the basic sacred geography of the Indian remains virtually untouched' (12), though ecological relationships, such as those of sun, land, vegetation, and fauna, changed, as well as those of humans to the land. Where once hunters had prayed to the animal spirits for success in the hunt, 'now animals could be regarded as a form of property' (13). In Calloway's scenario, the final outcome is clear: Amerindian trails became bridle paths, then wagon roads, and finally motor highways. However, if today's American society resembles the European model more closely than the Amerindian, its Amerindian roots run deep.

Book Reviews 331

In this comprehensive survey of the process in the United States over three hundred years, Calloway has synthesized a wide range of scholarship. As he acknowledges, he is not giving new information so much as organizing existing knowledge within a national framework, providing a more complete picture of the development of the United States than has hitherto been readily available. Although he touches on the Canadian experience here and there, he does not develop it; his focus is American. In line with this approach, although some Canadian events are included in the introductory chronology, two key ones are missing: the 1763 Treaty of Paris by which Great Britain took over from France in North America, and the 1793 crossing of the continent by Alexander Mackenzie.

As might be expected in a work of this scope, there are points in need of clarification. Beavers were not new to Europeans but had been trapped out in northern Europe and Russia before they became the staple of the North American fur trade (14). The statement that the Amerindians taught the Europeans how to hunt and fish needs qualification (55). Similarly, the statement that 'Indians and Frenchmen created a complex and dynamic world that was new to everyone' from the mouth of the St Lawrence to that of the Mississippi (118) needs to be put in the context of France's previous Brazilian and contemporary Caribbean experiences. The French failure to forge alliances with the Iroquois was in no way related to their successful alliances with the Amerindians of the Great Lakes region, but was a product of their decades-old hostilities with the Five Nations (119). The kidnapping of Amerindians to serve as guides did not begin with Cartier and Champlain (136), but was a continuation of French practice in Brazil. The same can be said of sending French boys to live with Amerindians to learn their languages and customs (162). The maps drawn by Amerindians were 'accurate' in a different way from those drawn by Europeans; they were conceived in terms of travel time rather than proportionate distances (137). The list goes on.

In sum, Calloway's book is a good synthesis of the interaction between Amerindians and Europeans in the formation of the United States. It touches on some of the social and political issues involved, but does not deal with ethical or legal questions. Within the limits that Calloway has set himself, this is a good introduction to the dynamics of the making of a nation. It will be much appreciated by students of North American history.

olive patricia dickason University of Ottawa

A History and Ethnography of the Beothuk. Ingeborg Marshall. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1996. Pp. xxiv, 640, illus. \$45.00

Destined to dominate the Beothuk section of one's bookshelf, this six-centimetre-thick tome consists of separate parts on history and ethnography, each the result of exhaustive research. In the history of publications on the Beothuk, Ingeborg Marshall's effort, which draws on extensive work over two decades and shows a deep knowledge of Beothuk archaeology and history, is unprecedented.

History comes first as a 250-page exploration, based largely on published and unpublished documentary sources, of the Beothuk, from European contact in the sixteenth century to the early nineteenth century. Shanawdithit, the last Beothuk whose name was known, died in 1829. Traditional Beothuk life is the subject of the book's second half, in which Marshall discusses archaeology, demography, clothing, social organization, subsistence, housing, transportation, mortuary practice, fighting, language, and other aspects of life and culture – all in 200 pages. The historical ethnography draws mainly on the same documentary sources as the first part as well as on archaeological evidence.

The two-part structure – the fact that this is really two books in one – presents problems, including repetition and omission of needed background. The reader of the first part has questions about what kind of people the Beothuk actually were, as well as about their 'prehistory' before the sixteenth century, when they spoke a language that seems to have been distantly related to that spoken by people on the mainland. The reader wants to know about their gathering and hunting practices, as they looked for fish, shellfish, crustacea, birds, sea and land mammals, and plants for subsistence; as they lived out their lives in Newfoundland in social groups, fought most of their neighbours, and made sense of their world in culturally determined ways. Beothuk society and culture surely determined Beothuk actions, and one can argue that this way of life deserves a thorough airing before the relations between Beothuks and European immigrants are considered.

Reflecting the awkward relationship between these two parts is the separation of two of the appendices, which appear after the history section, from the other three, which appear in the usual place at the end of the book. In appendix 2 (to history), the name of Shanawdithit, whose drawings, artifacts, word lists, and memory provide significant insight on the Beothuk, is not among the Biographies of Major Informants. But her name does appear in an appendix to ethnography dedicated to Beothuk names. Surely, Marshall would not want us to conclude that the Beothuk, with the exception of a single individual, are relegated to non-history.

Marshall reduces Beothuk 'history,' rooted in documents, largely to the history of European-Beothuk relations. The book's structure signals unequivocally that history arrived with literate European people, not that it existed for the Beothuk before that period. Curiously, however, history is not even in the sagas or artifacts of

the tenth-century Norse who lived at l'Anses aux Meadows and left Newfoundland as victims, perhaps, of 'scraelings' who were ancestors of the Beothuk. Marshall wants to present (and is convinced that she does) an 'authentic' history of the Beothuk. But what, precisely, does that mean? Her history begins (and ends) largely with the written record and assumes that there is a story awaiting release in a certain narrative structure. This approach is understandable, but it deserves discussion in a day when, for many, the history of indigenous peoples embraces and often privileges indigenous sources. Those hoping for acknowledgment of interpretive debates, in which many who write the anthropological history of Native people are currently embroiled, will be disappointed. Marshall is simply not interested in larger disputes over historiography. An alternative history, however, might begin with the Beothuk idea that they were related to mainland people like the Innu and with what has been relegated here to ethnography as prehistory. It might underscore Beothuk stories for discussion as authentic or problematic.

It is unfortunate that the portrait on the jacket and frontispiece of this book is identified as Shanawdithit, because the book contains contrary evidence that it is a Beothuk woman named Demasduit. In 1819 Lady Hamilton painted Demasduit's portrait, and others subsequently appear to have made three copies of it. In hair style, facial features, clothing, and pose, the copies differ from the original in small details. A mouth slightly opened in Lady Hamilton's watercolor, for example, becomes a mouth closed in the copies. For some reason, Marshall ignores the only clearly original portrait of a Beothuk - that by Lady Hamilton - which shows, in Marshall's words, a 'sensitive young woman with a mild and pleasing expression and a spark of liveliness,' for a copy said to be a 'stolid and slightly older' woman, with 'broader facial features' and a 'penetrating and reproachful look.' The latter she identifies as Shanawdithit, who has supposedly 'internalized the tragedy of her tribe' (505). Not only is Marshall's argument unconvincing but her choice of language is telling. Without getting into the thorny problem of exactly what one reads into any portrait (for which an art-historical literature exists), is there nothing more to the history of the Beothuk than reproach and tragedy?

The history of the Beothuk is undeniably tragic. Through violence and consumptive diseases, these people disappeared within a short time span. The human loss was the greatest calamity, but the loss of knowledge of Beothuk language and culture is also distressing. From the sixteenth century on, the odds were against a people whose abhorrence of guns signalled their doom when they were pitted against armed Europeans who became superior in number, competed ruthlessly for salmon and other resources, and refused to countenance others unless they played by European rules. It is a

sorry tale, but it need not be dull. Where are the Beothuk who ochred their bodies and became prototypical Red Indians, who took angularly decorated artifacts in angular, seagoing canoes, and who constructed massive fences to entrap migrating caribou? Where are the people who fought enemies tenaciously, including the Norse, whom they may well have driven off? Perhaps they celebrated afterward, as they did in later centuries, around decapitated heads of their defeated foe. These Beothuk were not just victims. Their full story awaits a different kind of historian, but, despite the reservations expressed above, *History and Ethnography* will be the necessary starting point for future efforts.

shepard krech iii Brown University

Les saints martyrs canadiens, vol. 5: *Le martyre de la nation huronne et sa défaite avec Dollard des Ormeaux*. Guy Laflèche. Laval: Singulier, 1995. Pp. 412. \$40.00

Guy Laflèche's fifth volume in his major work, *Les saints martyrs canadiens*, appeared seven years after its first volume. In spite of the author's own statement that 'ce volume achève mon travail d'édition' (349), the inside jacket announces a sixth volume, to be published in 2005. *Le martyre de la nation huronne* consists of seven chapters selected from three different volumes of the Jesuit relations: those of 1653–4 (signed by François-Joseph Le Mercier and published in 1655), 1656–7 (Jean de Quen, 1658), and 1659–60 (Jérôme Lalemant, 1661). A modern edition of these texts is already available in American historian Reuben Gold Thwaites's *Jesuit Relations* (vols. 41, 43, 45, 46), but not yet in Canadian Jesuit historian Lucien Campeau's *Monumenta Novae Franciae*. This is not a new edition from a diplomatic standpoint, but a 'régularisation éditoriale' that blends the orthography of classical French with a modern graphic environment.

The title of the book explains the reason behind the selection of texts. According to Laflèche, the real martyrs of the years 1650–60 were the Huron. After the removal of the few survivors to the vicinity of Quebec in 1650, the Huron were massacred in 1656 by an Iroquois war party, were forced to emigrate and disperse amongst the Iroquois (especially Mohawk and Onondaga) in 1657, and were eventually involved in the Long-Sault battle in 1660. In a pioneering essay in 1981, Canadian historian John A. Dickinson had shown the mythical nature of Adam Dollard des Ormeaux's last stand. Laflèche now maintains that forty Huron, along with seventeen Frenchmen and four Algonquin, were sacrificed in an utterly useless expedition motivated only by the Jesuits' selfish commercial interests.

Technically, the book is poorly organized and cumbersome to use. The actual text is 51 pages and must be read alongside 277

small-print pages that include endnotes, an annotated list of textual variants, a glossary, and a chronology. There are several repetitions. Major interpretive issues are hidden by dozens of analyses of points of lesser significance which deflect the reader's attention and make it necessary to turn to the final chronology to place the events in a more logical sequence. More substantially, Laflèche is often blinded by his personal battle against the Jesuits. Campeau is viciously attacked for his 'hypocrisie' and accused of being a racist. The Sulpician Gabriel Thubières de Levy de Queylus is extolled, with no explanation, as 'le premier grand ecclésiastique de la Nouvelle-France.' Bishop François de Laval is downgraded to the role of 'créature' of the Jesuits, something he certainly was not. Lastly, there was no Jesuit theocracy in seventeenth-century New France, because the concept itself implies a conflict between church and state (the latter providing a viable alternative) that never existed during the French regime.

It is a pity that Laflèche has brought these negative comments upon himself, because his book is well researched, in line with recent historiography, original, and innovative. As for historiography, the Iroquois wars seem increasingly to have been motivated by both economic and commercial aims and by their desire to adopt the Huron ('ne faire qu'un peuple'). The negative Jesuit attitude towards Indian cultures is rightly placed in a worldwide context and compared with the order's experience in China. Laflèche's originality consists in his careful re-examination of the available sources and in his use of the methods of textual analysis. Very convincingly, he is able to dissect every single sentence of the printed relations, to tell the reader who wrote it, what sources were used, how the material was edited, and what the motivations were of both the authors and the editors. For example, Laflèche's main thesis is that, under the leadership of Paul Ragueneau and Lalemant, the Jesuits knowingly sacrificed the Huron because they feared the military conquest of the colony by the Iroquois and wanted to open a new mission among the Five Nations. As supportive evidence, Laflèche shows how the convoluted and inconsistent prose of some of their less able confrères, such as de Quen and Le Mercier, unwittingly betrays them and unveils the strategy that the Jesuits had attempted to hide in their relations.

Lastly, a quick review of some of Laflèche's statements about a number of key characters whose writings are the staple of historians of seventeenth-century New France will exemplify his contribution. Marie Guyart de l'Incarnation's correspondence is among the documents 'les plus trompeurs' of the history of New France, lacking only 'une motivation économique' to be used verbatim by modern historians - a motivation provided by the Jesuit Paul Le Jeune. Sulpician historian François Dollier de Casson's narrative has a hidden source in the Montreal devout, Jeanne Mance. As for the

Jesuits, who are depicted all too often as a monolithic, élite crash unit of highly motivated, well-trained, and self-effacing religious commandos, they were, in fact, persons of differing abilities whose strategies were often at variance. Le Mercier is 'le moins autoritaire de tous les missionnaire' and writes 'avec la poigne lui servant à diriger les travaux matériels qui sont habituellement sa responsabilité.' Simon Le Moyne is 'un personnage secondaire.' De Quen has 'la malchance d'être désigné supérieur,' but 'on n'aurait jamais dû [le] sortir ... de sa réserve de Saint-Joseph à Sillery.' Lalemant's sober writing style hides a 'profonde immoralité.' He is a liar, and he lies 'très franchement.' Although some of these statements, as well as Laflèche's general interpretation of the 1650s, can and will be challenged, future historians who are willing to make general statements about 'the church' or 'the Jesuits' will find it difficult to dismiss Laflèche's multilayer and in-depth approach and to ignore his important contribution to scholarship.

luca codignola University of Genova, Italy

The Canadian Iroquois and the Seven Years' War. d. peter macleod. Toronto: Dundurn Press/Canadian War Museum 1996. Pp. 248, illus. \$29.99

This brief, pioneering study offers a new perspective on the familiar events of the Seven Years' War. The Canadian Iroquois had settled in the four communities of Akwesasne (St Regis), Kanawake (Caughnawaga), Kanasetake (Oka), and Oswegatchie (La Presentation) at various times within the previous ninety years. Peter MacLeod reveals how much and, at times, how little can be reliably recovered about their involvement in the war that eventually conquered New France but did not conquer them.

Fashionable multicultural apologies and warnings introduce the reader to a respectful, consciously antidotal, and often partisan account. It is particularly discouraging that MacLeod feels the need to say 'they were people. Real people with human feelings and human failings, and possessed of private lives' (emphasis in original, 1). Perhaps this statement derives from his frustration in trying to learn more than is possible about individuals, though he has much of interest to say about a few people who should be more widely known. Atiatonharongwen, born in Saratoga, New York, in 1740 of an African-American father and an Abenaki mother, was captured with his parents in the Canadian raid on that town five years later. Family memories suggest that Kanawake warriors among the raiders saved the boy from his father's fate – enslavement in New France. Atiatonharongwen became a respected Kanawake warrior who fought for New France on the Ohio frontier. A brave Oswegatchie warrior, Ohquandageghte, is celebrated for single-handedly attacking and disarming an eleven-man garrison at

German Flats in 1758 and, with the help of two companions, taking all of them prisoner. This account is not a history of the Canadian Iroquois as victims.

MacLeod clearly describes Amerindian military objectives, and his theme demonstrates how these goals were adhered to throughout the war. The attack on Fort Bull is explored particularly effectively as a demonstration of this 'parallel warfare,' which occasionally worked well with French ambitions but, at other times, caused major problems. As an ethnohistorian, MacLeod reveals an admirable anthropological sensitivity and understanding towards the Canadian Iroquois, a sensitivity he seldom reveals towards that other tribe, the French.

Much of this book is a conventional narrative of major battles, derived predominantly from French sources and accompanied by some intriguing judgments, with emphasis on the contribution of the Canadian Iroquois. More frequently, MacLeod discusses the entire 'Seven Nations' together, combining the four Iroquois communities with the St Lawrence valley settlements of Abenaki, Algonquin, Nipissing, and Huron. Although this vagueness is sometimes a consequence of his sources, MacLeod could have been more specific. For example, an estimate of the populations of each community, even if derived only from the largest number of warriors counted at any time during the conflict, would be useful. The author uses the surviving documents on diplomatic relations among these communities, but scholarship on the Abenaki could have been exploited more fully. Perhaps MacLeod's future work will explain the people and protocols of the ritualized negotiations among the four Iroquois settlements and the intertribal communities. Where were the council fires? Who spoke for whom? To what extent did Six Nations' conventions apply? Did the Canadian governors treat the Seven Nations as a united group? Were the Abenaki, like the Ohio valley Amerindians, pushed into an anglicized 'Iroquois empire' after 1759? Until he provides greater detail, MacLeod's claims about Canadian Iroquois unity, independence, and autonomy in this period must be regarded as tentative.

Non-specialists familiar with the general context will be interested in MacLeod's last chapter, on how the Amerindians of the St Lawrence valley avoided defeat in 1760 and came to support the British during 'Pontiac's War.' British interests, Six Nations' influence, and Seven Nations' diplomatic skills all contributed to the Treaty of Kanawake of September 1760. MacLeod is too brief here, but his endnotes will introduce the curious to the primary sources from which a fuller analysis can be constructed.

This readable and thought-provoking supplement to existing literature prompts further inquiry. It immediately invites more detailed work from this perspective to test claims carefully, to place

the Canadian Iroquois in context, and to engage existing interpretations of Amerindian, Canadian, and military history more directly and fully.

ian k. steele University of Western Ontario

You Are Asked to Witness: The Stó:lō in Canada's Pacific Coast History. keith thor carlson. Chilliwack: Stó:lō Heritage Trust 1997. Pp. vi, 210, illus. \$26.95

There is an interesting story about *You Are Asked to Witness* that merits telling. The message is that First Nations of Canada have now assumed an active role in the production of scholarly knowledge and interpretation, and readers are being called, as in the title, to bear witness to this fact and to affirm it to others. This outcome conforms with Stó:lō ceremonial procedure. The Stó:lō Nation of the lower Fraser River valley in British Columbia is composed of some twenty bands and 5000 members. Two competing tribal councils provided political and social services to member bands until they merged in 1994. Now united as one, the Stó:lō Nation is in an astonishingly vigorous phase of growth. With headquarters on the site of a former residential school and Indian hospital, the nation now employs around two hundred people and provides an expanding range of educational, health, and social services. The Stó:lō face the task of preparing for treaty negotiations with the federal government and the province. Consequently, the Aboriginal Rights and Title branch of the Stó:lō government and its predecessors has carried out basic ground-breaking research, often engaging the help of University of British Columbia academics and graduate students, among others. This volume is a product of their work. Although aimed at high school curricula, the book includes articles by young scholars and Stó:lō intellectuals who form what is sometimes called 'Stó:lō University.'

First Nations of Canada are frequently said to be engaged in reclaiming their own story, a task usually done through courtroom representations, publication of volumes of transcribed oral material, coffee table picture books, or simplified curriculum material. The leadership of the Stó:lō Nation, however, is not interested merely in reclaiming history but, rather, in re-engaging in dialogue with the mainstream community. To this end, the nation staged an interdisciplinary conference in May 1997, inviting three hundred academics, community intellectuals, elders, and others. The nation also has two venues for the public airing of cultural practices and Stó:lō political perspectives: one is a longhouse school presentation, and the other the Xay:tem Interpretive Centre, a transformer stone site open to the public.

You Are Asked to Witness is a third element in this public

dialogue. The volume is edited by Keith Carlson, a doctoral student at the University of British Columbia, but in this context he is more clearly identified as a historian who, for six years, has been in the employ of the Stó:lō. Carlson, together with other staff, has arranged for the production of a beautifully produced, colourful, and well-illustrated volume. Collectively the chapters make a penetrating commentary on the Stó:lō experience. More specifically, sections provide an introduction to the Stó:lō in the form of an interview with Siyemches (Frank Malloway), a current chief and spiritual leader; descriptions of early encounters with non-aboriginals; the history of government coercion; ways in which the Stó:lō have entered the world of the Xwelitem ('hungry people' or whites); and a discussion of the current legal régime concerning land and resources.

The most penetrating chapter, however, is the last, which concerns the 'relevance of oral traditions to contemporary society.' Much of the chapter, and indeed the entire volume, bears the intellectual imprint of Albert 'Sonny' McHalsie, a Stó:lō chief and researcher, who has attempted over several years to sensitize the various contributors to the underlying concepts of Stó:lō epistemology, to the nuance of history. McHalsie's careful, path-breaking research into Stó:lō place names reveals Stó:lō understandings of place, events, and relationships among groups and ultimately provides the beginnings of a history from the Stó:lō viewpoint. Yet *You Are Asked to Witness* is not informed by Stó:lō concepts of history and has not taken the big step imperfectly attempted by Georges Sioui in his work, *For an Amerindian Autohistory*. This volume, which the Stó:lō Nation has called upon the mainstream society to witness, is not fully of their own making. With time, they may produce such a book.

bruce g. miller University of British Columbia

Homeland to Hinterland: The Changing Worlds of the Red River Métis in the Nineteenth Century. gerhard j. ens. Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1996. Pp. xv, 268, illus. \$55.00

This book is a revised version of Ens's doctoral dissertation for the University of Alberta in 1989, supervised by the late John Foster. For the record, I became aware of Ens's work while he was still a graduate student. I invited him to work with me on a consulting project for the federal Department of Justice, and we went on to publish an article together. If our previous relationship colours this review, the reader can take it into account.

Rivers of ink have flowed over Métis history, and on many topics there is little new to be said, but this book is genuinely innovative. For the first time, an author has systematically applied the statistical methods of demography and economic history to the study of the

Red River colony. Ens's main technique is family reconstitution. Focusing on the two largest Red River parishes – St Andrew's (English) and St François Xavier (French) – he uses his database to integrate family information taken from parish registers with census data on land occupancy and cultivation. Ens has also used North-West scrip records to compile a database about Métis who left Red River before 1870, thus fashioning a tool to study migration.

Weaving these data together with the historian's usual primary sources, Ens gives a new and more precise version of Red River history. Up to about 1840, the Métis, both English and French, lived a peasant existence, combining subsistence agriculture and hunting. But in the 1840s, American trading posts were established in the Dakota Territory, making possible large-scale commerce in buffalo robes. The Métis, particularly the French, responded by entering a phase of proto-industrialization based on family labour, in which the men hunted buffalo, and women and children processed the meat and robes.

The demographic data show that, in the period from about 1840 to 1870, the French Métis of St François Xavier outstripped the English Métis of St Andrew's in both family size and infant life expectancy, even as the French were reducing their cultivated acreage. They were earning higher incomes from the buffalo-robe trade, which led to improvements in health and longevity. But the buffalo hunt also weakened their ties to Red River, because they had to pursue their quarry at ever greater distances, leading them to winter on the prairie and eventually to settle there. This tendency accelerated in the 1870s when the buffalo hunt shifted much farther west, causing massive emigration from St François Xavier and other French parishes. The half-breeds of St Andrew's and the other English parishes, less involved in the buffalo hunt, were more likely to remain in Red River.

In Ens's portrait, the Métis were not a primitive people, thrust aside by the expansion of civilization, as in George Stanley's account. Rather, they were rational actors and enthusiastic participants in the merchant capitalism of the mid-nineteenth century. They were not victims of a malign government that deprived them of their land, as D.N. Sprague and others would have it. Ens argues convincingly, backed with plenty of data, that those Métis who sold their lands in the 1870s did so not because they were tricked by speculators, but because they wanted to raise money to pursue their commercial avocations further west.

While debunking Frits Pannekoek's theory that there was great hostility between the English and the French Métis, Ens also shows that the French Métis were split during the events of 1869–70, with the division falling along class lines. The more prosperous landowners and plains traders, both English and French, were the ones who opposed Riel. Although the younger and poorer boatmen

Book Reviews 341

and tripmen supported Riel, the better-off buffalo hunters did not.

There are many other interesting tidbits in the book. For example, Ens shows that the data do not support Jennifer Brown's theory about a rise in infanticide in Red River during the 1850s and 1860s. Also, recalling William McNeill's classic book *Plagues and Peoples*, he makes a start on writing the disease history of Red River in relation to population movements and economic development, although more needs to be done on this subject.

Overall, this is an extraordinarily worthwhile book. It shows how much can be done by combining systematic data analysis with a coherent, theoretical perspective. Requiesce in pace, John Foster, and take pride in your student's work.
tom flanagan University of Calgary

Copying People: Photographing British Columbia First Nations, 1860-1940. daniel francis. Saskatoon: Fifth House Publishers 1996. Pp. viii, 152, illus. \$19.95

Proclaiming the Gospel to the Indians and the Métis: The Missionary Oblates of Mary Immaculate in Western Canada, 1845-1945. raymond j.a. huel. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press 1996. Pp. xxviii, 388, illus. \$29.95

The True Spirit and Original Intent of Treaty 7. treaty 7 and tribal council and dorothy first rider, with walter hildebrand and sarah carter. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1996. Pp. xx, 408, illus. \$44.95 cloth, \$18.95 paper

Historians of Aboriginal Canada will welcome all three of these titles, as each introduces a 'new' source of information on the First Nations of western Canada. To date, few anglophone historians have ventured far beyond the existing primary source materials available in English. These three books open up new vistas. Dan Francis has unearthed many original, 'fresh' photographs of First Nations people in British Columbia between 1860 and 1940. In his critical study of the Oblate order's first century of Indian missionary work in what are now the Prairie provinces, Raymond Huel introduces valuable French-language materials. The volume produced by the Treaty 7 Tribal Council in southern Alberta is based primarily on Blackfoot (Siksika), Blood, Peigan, Sarcee (Tsuu T'ina), and Stoney (Nakoda) elders' oral narratives of the important treaty signed in 1877.

In his beautifully illustrated *Copying People* (from the Haida words for camera), Francis includes nearly 150 photos from all parts of British Columbia, as well as from each of the different First Nations groups. The Vancouver historical researcher and writer presents at least one example of the work of all the important photographers in British Columbia from 1860 to 1940. Wonderful

group shots appear, as well as portraits of individuals such as George Hunt, the anthropologist Franz Boas's Native field assistant; Captain John, the first of the Chilliwack people to convert to Christianity; and Chief Joe Capilano, the Squamish leader who in 1906 led a delegation of First Nations people to Britain to present their grievances to the king.

Throughout his short text, Francis strives for the greatest accuracy possible. For instance, he introduces the new names in English for several First Nations groups, such as Stó:lō for Chilliwack, Seewepemc for Shuswap, and Nuu-chah-nulth for Nootka. He also cautions readers about the value of the photographic evidence he presents. Photographs must be used with great care, because the context is not known: 'The viewer never knows what is just outside the frame, or how the photographer has selected and posed the contents of the image to convey a particular feeling or point of view' (2).

Huel includes a number of photographs in his valuable history, *Proclaiming the Gospel to the Indians and the Métis*. The photos, while very poorly reproduced, complement the author's account well. Although a number of the shots of Indian students are perfect examples of 'staged' photographs, they convey the Roman Catholic missionaries' sense of order and control. A photo such as that of the Dunbow Industrial School men's hockey team reveals another reality. It shows seven big Indian men who could easily have challenged any attempts to control them.

Although respectful of the Oblate Fathers, Huel, a professor of Canadian history at the University of Lethbridge and director of the Western Oblate History Project, maintains a critical, secular approach. He speaks frankly in his preface and in the text. Under the direction of a Roman Catholic Church as yet unaffected by the ecumenical attitudes of Vatican ii (1962-5), the Oblates exported a Christian model to the Northwest 'based on the norms, values and cultural traditions of western Europe' (xxv). After their first century on the prairies, they failed to construct 'indigenous churches that reflected the needs and aspirations of the people they served' (xiv).

Huel completed the research for his book during a year's study leave in which he lived in Oblate residences in Ottawa and Edmonton. Although most familiar with the Fathers' work, he recognizes that the female religious orders who taught in their schools, as well as the Oblate Brothers, both provided invaluable assistance. If the book has one shortcoming, it is the author's unwillingness to probe deeply into the individual personalities of the Oblates. He seems more comfortable with detailed discussions of the order's relationship with the Hudson's Bay Company, and later with the federal government, which had jurisdiction over the Indians with whom it signed treaties in the Northwest. The order's constant struggle to obtain financial support, initially from France,

also receives considerable attention. This topic is important, but it makes for dry reading.

One wishes that the author had provided additional personal details on the more important Oblates, such as the future bishops Taché and Grandin and the beloved Father Albert Lacombe. Once in a while the more human face of the operation emerges, when, for instance, the author comments on jealousy in the ranks: the Quebec-born Lacombe's 'success as a missionary engendered envy among his fellow Oblates especially the ones who came from France and who alleged that Bishop Taché favoured him because he was a native Canadian' (42). Or when Professor Huel mentions Father (later Bishop) Grouard's complaint against the nuns at the Fort Providence mission for using too much soap. He alleged that the sisters were 'constantly washing.'

The greatest revelation for Native historians is perhaps the emphasis in the Oblate records of the impact of epidemic disease on the Aboriginal population. An estimated one-third of the Natives in the North-West perished in 1869, and the incredible losses continued. Between 1884 and 1891, fifty Indian students died at the Qu'Appelle Industrial School at Lebreton and it was estimated that 'half of the students did not live to benefit from the education they received' (136). Huel writes that Father Henri Grandin believed in 1908 that the Native population in the Northwest was 'on the verge of extinction as a result of the numerous epidemics and diseases that decimated its ranks' (206). Only in the interwar period did the First Nations' population rise significantly.

In his final pages, Huel notes that the Oblates failed to create a Native Roman Catholic Church in the Prairie provinces. After ninety years of work, only four Métis, and not a single Indian, had become priests. Elsewhere, by the 1930s, most notably in Sri Lanka, Europeans worked under indigenous Oblate clergy.

But was the Oblate outreach to the First Nations in other respects a failure? The True Spirit and Original Intent of Treaty 7 contains a hint that some First Nations people think not. Lucy Big Plume, a Tsuu T'ina (Sarcee) elder, attended the Roman Catholic Dunbow Industrial School. When interviewed about Treaty 7 and its aftermath, she stated that the presence of the missionaries had been positive: 'They helped set up schools and helped educate Indians' (158). The editors of the book hastily add: 'But most others disagreed and were anxious to point out the overall negative impact of the missionaries on the Tsuu T'ina' (158). Yet Lucy Big Plume's comment rings true: the fact that the First Nations now know their rights means they can no longer be denied them.

The True Spirit and Original Intent of Treaty 7 offers insight into the elders' resentments today about the treaty. Clearly, the interpretation provided from English into the First Nations languages was inaccurate. What a challenge it was to translate from

English into Blackfoot. Even to this day there is still no word in Blackfoot for 'reserve.' They simply say 'our lands' or 'Native lands.' The Blackfoot had no word for 'surrender,' for surrendering or relinquishing of title to land. They had no word for 'title.' The Treaty 7 peoples left the four days of discussion at Blackfoot Crossing believing they had signed a peace treaty with the newcomers.

Constantine Scollen, an Oblate Father present at the signing, realized the translation problem. Huel points out in *Proclaiming the Gospel to the Indians and the Métis* that two years after the signing, Father Scollen wrote Major Irvine of the North-West Mounted Police, pointing out that the Indians had not understood the implications of the treaty on account of the lack of competent interpreters. They had signed on account of their trust in the NWMP and in the expectation that the authorities would provide them with food and clothing as the need arose. In Father Scollen's words, the Indians' signatories of Treaty 7 had no 'intuitive comprehension of what they were called upon to do' (204).

The *True Spirit and Original Intent of Treaty 7* is divided into three parts: The first presents the testimony, recently recorded, of more than eighty Treaty 7 First Nations elders; the second provides an analysis of academic writing on the Canadian treaty system in general and makes specific reference to Treaty 7; the third includes short biographies of the elders, interviewers, translators, and treaty review project researchers. Of greatest interest are the interviews in Part One. Details such as the comment of Stoney elder Lazarus Wesley that the Stoney's expression for half a mile was the phrase 'as far as one can hear' (143) are fascinating. The unanimity of the elders that Treaty 7 was 'first and foremost a peace treaty' (111) reinforces the findings of the Indian Association of Alberta's interviews with Treaty 7 elders in the mid-1970s, reported in *The Spirit of the Alberta Indian Treaties* edited by Richard Price.

donald b. smith University of Calgary

Indians at Work: An Informal History of Native Labour in British Columbia, 1858-1930. rolf knight. Vancouver: New Star Books 1996. Pp. xiv, 397. \$24.00

Rip Van Winkle-like, Rolf Knight's 1978 *Indians at Work* has re-emerged - after nearly two decades - still flogging the unrepentant Robin Fisher, whose own 1977 *Contact and Conflict* was reissued in 1992, still flogging Rolf Knight.

The Knight and Fisher books were exciting, seminal books in the 1970s. Now their debate seems a bit unreal, even quaint. Fisher wrote that, with the gold rush of 1858, 'Vancouver Island and British Columbia were changing from colonies of exploitation, which made use of indigenous manpower, to colonies of settlement where the Indians became at best irrelevant.' It was a forceful statement,

capturing one of his themes: that the gold rush irrevocably changed British Columbia. As Knight's book shows, it is one of the few irredeemably wrong sentences in Fisher's Macdonald Prize-winning book.

Knight challenged a belief, more current in the 1970s than it is now, that, with the coming of settlement, Aboriginal people were shuffled off to reserves, where they sat hunting, trapping, or collecting government handouts down to the present day. Knight broke free of the sources that had circumscribed scholarship in this field and found that reminiscences by Aboriginal people were full of references to work. He suggested that Aboriginal labourers may have entered the industrial economy in large numbers and that wage labour might have been an important source of income for them as late as the Great Depression. In the end, however, he was unable to arrive at firm conclusions, at least partly because his sources were not systematically examined. Characterizing his own work as an 'informal study,' he admitted to its preliminary nature: 'It will be evident that much of the data for a complete labour history of Indian people in British Columbia is missing here. The present account raises more questions than it answers.'

The present revision is equally 'informal' and is more reorganized than revised. What used to be an appendix, 'Historical Background to Indian Labour,' is now, lightly revised and expanded, chapters 2-5. It has toned down its deliberately anti-academic informality, omitted many of the qualifiers, and dropped the odd references to 'girlfriends' picked up by Native workers on their trips. His main rethinking focuses on the Department of Indian Affairs, which he no longer sees as entirely evil. The asides and expansion add about sixty pages to the original 269-page length. These additions thicken description, but except in the case of a few paragraphs on Native liquor manufacturing, they do not add to its breadth.

The revised text makes passing reference to a few of the studies that have appeared since the original, and it adds some anecdotes taken from them. In terms of the Fisher-Knight debate, the new literature strongly supports Knight, but the literature around Aboriginal/non-Aboriginal relations has moved on since the 1970s and Knight has not. Knight is convinced that Aboriginal workers were just like other workers, and does not ask questions about the role of wage labour in Aboriginal life.

'Informal' also applies to the focus. Ostensibly concerned with Native wage labour, Knight has a fascination with Aboriginal spokesmen and travelling cultural troupes, with lengthy asides on each. Although it is primarily about British Columbia, the book also includes a fifty-page look at Aboriginal labour in the rest of the country. If the BC section is informal, this section is downright casual. Knight has missed important studies (Gonzalez on the Micmac, Waisberg and Holzkamm on northeastern Ontario, for

example). In one of the cases where he has acknowledged post-1978 writing – Sarah Carter's work – he takes issue with it, though it supports his main contentions.

In addition to making the point that Aboriginal people worked for wages, Knight plays up, in both editions, the fact that Aboriginal people were workers with class interests in common with other workers. Whatever part of their cultural heritage they retained (and Knight believes this to be less than most writers believe), their 'racial' identity did not affect their desire or their ability to get work. This leaves Knight in the awkward position of not being able to explain why Aboriginal people had considerably less success keeping jobs than others, and requires the problematic assumption that they joined the workforce for reasons identical to non-Natives.

Knight's emphasis on class over race is, however, consistent with his contemporary concerns. In his epilogue, he characterizes pending land claims settlements as 'almost inexplicable madness.' Because Indians are workers, and capitalists control government, he sees the drive for Native rights as further dividing the working class and as a smokescreen for the growing social injustices in this country. If his evidence is no longer fresh, his interpretations are still surprising.

john lutz University of Victoria

Dissonant Worlds: Roger Vandersteene Among the Cree. earle h. waugh. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press 1996. Pp. xiv, 344, illus. \$39.95

Roger Vandersteene was an Oblate missionary who worked among the Cree of northern Alberta in the years after the Second World War. Vandersteene, or 'Steentje' as he was known to his friends and colleagues, was born in Belgium of Flemish ancestry and arrived in Canada in 1946, where he spent the next three decades ministering to the northern communities of Grouard, Wabasca, Little Red River, Trout Lake, Jean d'Or, Garden River, and Fox Lake. By the time of his death in 1976, he had attained a remarkable status among the people of these northern villages. His role as a Cree medicine man (an honour conferred on him at Trout Lake in 1960), his intimate knowledge of Cree language and culture, his attempts to integrate Cree spirituality with Christian traditions through a revision of the Catholic Mass based on the *wikokewin*, along with his art, poetry, and other writings, all contributed to Vandersteene's ambitious attempt to build, in the words of the author, 'a new religious reality: a strong spiritually powerful Cree Church, a magnificent Cree formation of Christian life' (264). It was a remarkable career that brought the Flemish missionary much attention in Canada and elevated him to almost celebrity status in his native Belgium.

Dissonant Worlds is more than simply a biography of Vandersteene and his work. Earle Waugh, a professor of the history of religions at the University of Alberta, takes the reader through an in-depth analysis of 'Steentje's' roots and influences, his appreciation of Cree spirituality, and his cultural conversion to a Cree world view. Within a loose chronological format, Waugh focuses on the complex ideas, historical themes, and psychological underpinnings that informed Vandersteene's teachings, poetry, and art, as well as his understanding of the place of spirituality in everyday life at a time of tremendous social and political upheaval among Aboriginal communities in the north.

Dissonant Worlds is aptly titled, for it is the theme of dissonance that best describes Vandersteene's life. Well aware that the incongruity between Aboriginal spirituality and traditional Catholicism had contributed to the marginalization of the Cree, Vandersteene believed that the pursuit of a new religion that united Cree traditions and Catholicism beyond anything proposed by earlier missionaries constituted a dramatic revision of Catholic ritual. In his mission work and in such books as *Wabasca*, an account of his years among the Cree published in 1960, Vandersteene sought new forms of religious expression and ritual that, while rooted in Catholic dogma, incorporated Cree interpretive dimensions to such an extent as to constitute a new religious reality. But as Waugh points out, Vandersteene's quest created considerable dissonance within the missionary's life, forcing him continually to evaluate his own directions and transitions. Determined to promote a new religious reality at such traditional and isolated hunting and trapping communities as Trout Lake, Vandersteene was later to become despondent when his work took him to the Peace River missions that were characterized by poverty, alcoholism, and the loss of a traditional Cree identity.

Ultimately, Waugh concludes, Vandersteene's noble attempts to synthesize a genuinely Cree Catholic Church based on traditional Cree spirituality and a ritual encounter with Cree ancestors 'found no lasting expression.' Vandersteene's vision, he suggests, was more suited to the Cree of the 1760s than of the 1960s, and created an isolationist, ghetto church that both underestimated Cree connections to the religious lives of other Canadians and did not take into account the way the Cree 'see themselves as an essential ingredient of the country's soul' (301).

Dissonant Worlds is solid biographical writing, strongly felt and carefully reasoned. Waugh is no standoffish biographer, and he has endeavoured to get as close to his subject as he can. His prose conveys a deep and sincere attempt to discover the many sides of the Flemish priest, this 'religious Ernest Hemingway' whose deeply personal poetry and art could question faith while celebrating nature. (Many of Vandersteene's paintings and drawings are

reproduced in the book, a number in colour.) Waugh's research over a dozen years led him beyond a strictly narrative account of Vandersteene's life to a search for the philosophical and social roots of the Flemish missionary's life and theology – a search that is readily apparent in the wide variety of historical, anthropological, linguistic, and theological sources that are cited in the biography and in the extensive list of informants interviewed by the author. A number of Vandersteene's Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal friends and colleagues, as well as members of his family, provide revealing evaluations of the missionary in appendix 2 of the book.

At times, the reader might become confused in comprehending the chronology of certain events in Vandersteene's life. Still, the analytical and thematic tone of *Dissonant Worlds* provides a fully realized and integrated portrait of a complex individual who played a significant role at a time of momentous change in Aboriginal life in Canada.

robert coutts Parks Canada, Winnipeg

Marguerite Bourgeoys and Montreal, 1640–1665. patricia simpson. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1997. Pp. xxvi, 247, illus. \$49.95 cloth, \$19.95 paper

Patricia Simpson effectively reminds us of links between past and present in Marguerite Bourgeoys and Montreal, 1640–1665, as she traces the career of the seventeenth-century religieuse in the founding of the *Congrégation de Notre-Dame* of Montreal, an uncloistered community dedicated to the education of children in New France. The author, herself a member of the Congregation, offers an understanding analysis of her subject and of other young French women who committed themselves to the Christian life during the Counter Reformation. Their devotion to the Roman Catholic Church and to its teachings led them from their provincial towns to the wilderness of the Saint Lawrence valley.

Because little writing remains in the hand of Marguerite Bourgeoys (1620–1700), Simpson has written her book primarily from printed sources – seventeenth-century accounts, nineteenth-century biographies, and more recent histories. In addition, she brings to light a few new documents found in the French archives on the Bourgeoys family and on Marguerite's early life in her birthplace, Troyes, in Champagne.

The author situates her subject between 1640 and 1665 – from Bourgeoys's religious conversion in Troyes to the end of the early colonizing period in Montreal. She argues that '[t]he Montreal that evolved after 1665 was not the settlement of which the founders had dreamed' (10). Not daunted by the paucity of Bourgeoys material, Simpson has woven a history rich in the contextual detail of early modern Troyes and the *Congrégation de Notre-Dame*, where

Bourgeoys became a member of the 'extern,' a group of secular women who lived outside the cloister but were devout and committed to teaching young girls and to aiding the poor. Much later, Bourgeoys wrote, 'I joined the lay Congregation where I learned that a settlement had been made in Canada and that the religious hoped to go there' (56). In 1652 she met Paul de Chomedey de Maisonneuve, a founder of Montreal, who was in France looking for a schoolmistress. Within months, on 20 June 1653, she and de Maisonneuve set sail for the colony. Five years later, 'the religious community of women that "God had not willed in Troyes" had its birth in an abandoned stable in Ville-Marie on the island of Montreal' (10).

The author sensitively highlights Bourgeoys's early years, her conversion, and her commitment to teaching within the context of women's religious orders. Moreover, in a careful balance between imperial and colonial forces, she explains the conception and establishment of Montreal. For instance, she skilfully interprets key events such as the political and ecclesiastical wrangle between Bishop François de Laval and Gabriel de Queylus over jurisdiction of the island colony. Additionally, she sets right several historiographical errors, such as those found in earlier biographies, and many written by hagiographers intent on seeking 'in the childhood of the subject evidences of future sanctity' (24). Simpson's text is enlivened with rich descriptions of seventeenth-century overland and transatlantic travel, and with intimate portraits of Bourgeoys's associates, particularly de Maisonneuve and Jeanne Mance, founder of Montreal's Hôtel-Dieu and Hospitallers of Saint Joseph.

The book succeeds in setting the scene for Bourgeoys's life in this period by providing context and supporting players. It falls somewhat short, however, in bringing Bourgeoys onto centre stage. One is left wanting to know more about her Montreal community of women and their instruction of colonial and Native children – unfortunately described in only a few pages. More work in the French archives, perhaps those of the mother house of the *Congrégation de Notre-Dame*, and the Seminary and National Archives of Quebec (particularly in the personnel files), might yield some important information, as might Roger Magnuson's work on education in New France.

Although the book has some excellent illustrations, two maps are needed for the travel sections: one of the French provinces, with delineation of Paris, Troyes, and the west-coast ports; and the other of Montreal and the Saint Lawrence region.

In sum, for students of Canada in the French colonial empire, the history of women, and the history of religion, Marguerite Bourgeoys is an important book for its rendering of a French woman's spiritual commitment and experience. Simpson creatively links her own

present with the past by bringing to her work a sympathetic treatment of her subject and a contemporary appreciation of the Congrégation de Notre-Dame of Montreal.
kathryn a. young University of Manitoba

Histoire populaire du Québec, tome 3: 1841-1896. Jacques Lacoursière. Sillery: Les Éditions du Septentrion 1996. pp. 496, illus. \$29.00

The third volume of Jacques Lacoursière's *Histoire populaire du Québec* covers the period from the Act of Union to the ascension of Laurier (1841-96). As with the two previous volumes, it is essentially a reprint of those textual portions of the *Nos Racines* series of the early 1980s that dealt with the political history of the period (numbers 79-109), with a few words changed and a few paragraphs (and one entire issue) omitted. The portions of *Nos Racines* dealing with the socioeconomic history of the period (numbers 110-16) have been dropped, along with the illustrations and the anecdotal sidebars. The result, as with the previous volumes, is not a history of the people of Quebec, but a traditional political history. There is virtually no discussion of such fundamental transformations of Quebec society as urbanization or the rise of industrial capitalism; of the experiences and actions of social groups such as industrial workers, women, agricultural colonists, immigrants, or Natives; or, with a few exceptions, of the changes in institutions such as the church, the educational system, or the law.

Even taken simply as narrative political history, the work is flawed. First, as a reprint of a text prepared in the late 1970s, it fails to reflect more recent developments in political historiography. For example, a major debate of the last two decades concerns the thesis that, rather than being increasingly dominated by a conservative-clerical ideology, Quebec politics in the second half of the nineteenth century preserved a healthy dose of liberalism. Lacoursière's text provides no sense of this historiography: references to liberalism serve mainly to chronicle its demise, such as its abandonment by the Liberal Party, thereby perpetuating the old stereotypes of Quebec politics from the 1840s to the 1950s which are still popular among certain journalists and politicians today.

A more fundamental issue concerns the subject of the work itself. 'National' history in Quebec was long an uneasy amalgam of Quebec history and the history of selected portions of French Canada. Over the last two or three decades, reflecting the concurrent political evolution, there has been a move towards redefining 'national' history as that of the geographical entity now known as Quebec. From its title, one would expect the *Histoire populaire du Québec* to exemplify this trend. But the original work, *Nos Racines*,

reflected the earlier view, and so does its reprint. For example, six of the thirty chapters deal with the Métis – and not simply the reaction in Quebec, but detailed accounts of the Rebellions themselves, more appropriate to a history of Canada, or of the West, than of Quebec. Other sections detail the confederative process in the West and the Maritimes, the New Brunswick and Manitoba schools question, and so on, favourites of the old-style 'national' history in Quebec, but largely absent from newer studies of Quebec history. This fudging of the 'national' entity being studied is not unique to Lacoursière; it is reflected, for example, in the teaching of the current compulsory high school course, *Histoire du Québec et du Canada*. But it is particularly confusing in a work whose subject is purportedly Quebec.

Finally, the level of political analysis is wanting. The preface by André Champagne makes clear his view on a half-century of political evolution: 'on voit profiler le malentendu, pour ne pas dire l'impossibilité qu'ont ces deux peuples de vivre ensemble' (8). Lacoursière's text is more nuanced, but Quebec and federal politics are still presented according to the three traditional dichotomies: between French and English, between the two dominant political parties, and between ultramontanes and liberals. Absent, for example, is any discussion of the disagreement within the francophone élite over economic development and industrialization, and there is only one brief mention of the conflict between the working classes and the bourgeoisie (regardless of their ethnicity or voting habits) over labour and social legislation.

As with the previous volumes, this is certainly a useful source of political anecdotes. For example, the many accounts of election violence will undoubtedly serve to enliven my survey lectures. But the history that it presents is far from 'popular,' and largely out of step with current historiography. Sales of the *Histoire populaire du Québec* have, nevertheless, been brisk, and its limited, dated view of Quebec history informs large numbers of Quebec citizens today. Academic historians, who regularly decry the lack of historical awareness among the general population, are themselves partly to blame. Though they have presented their views in other popular venues, such as museum exhibits, magazines like *Cap-aux-Diamants*, and television series (often in conjunction with Lacoursière himself), they have produced no popularized, in-depth survey of nineteenth-century Quebec history. The last was *Nos Racines* twenty years ago; hence, the popularity of this partial reprint.

donald fyson Université Laval

Le Théâtre à Québec au début du xxe siècle: Une époque flamboyante! christian beaucage. Québec: Nuit Blanche Éditeur

1996. Pp. 320, illus. \$24.95

À l'instar de Jean-Marc Larrue, professeur de théâtre au Collège de Valleyfield, qui s'est particulièrement intéressé à l'activité dramatique de Montréal et qui a publié plusieurs ouvrages de fond sur le sujet, Christian Beaucage, qui enseigne la littérature au Cégep de Limoilou, s'est penché sur l'industrie théâtrale mais celle de la ville de Québec. Ses principales sources documentaires ont été *Le Soleil* et *L'Événement*. Ces quotidiens qualifiaient les débuts du vingtième siècle, période couverte par l'étude, d'âge d'or du théâtre à Québec, surnommée alors l'«Athènes du Canada». Plus précisément, l'auteur circonscrit son étude entre l'incendie de l'Académie de Musique (the Academy of Music) en 1900 et celui du Théâtre Populaire en 1911. De là peut-être le sous-titre de l'ouvrage.

Animé du feu sacré, l'auteur commence son livre en inscrivant l'activité théâtrale dans le contexte géographique particulier de la ville de Québec. Les anglophones fréquentaient davantage la Haute-Ville et les francophones la Basse-Ville, ce qui a provoqué un clivage de l'activité théâtrale dont Beaucage rend compte en mettant en regard les événements qui ont marqué l'industrie du spectacle dans les deux parties de la cité. En faisant revivre l'arrivée d'une troupe de 100 acteurs à l'Académie de Musique, le scandale qui a entouré la construction de l'Auditorium (actuel Capitole), l'implantation du théâtre francophone à la Salle Jacques-Cartier (qui deviendra le Théâtre Populaire), les troupes américaines qui ont visité le Grand Café National, le Patinoir Saint-Roch qui fut adapté en Théâtre des Variétés et quelques autres circonstances, Beaucage évoque des moments significatifs de l'histoire des arts de la scène dans la Capitale au début du vingtième siècle. Il nous rappelle en outre qu'il en coûtait alors fort peu pour aller voir une pièce dont les thèmes, facilement accessibles, s'adressaient à tous.

Puisque ce sont les artistes qui ont animé toute l'activité théâtrale de l'époque, Beaucage fait état de leur implication au sein de l'institution théâtrale. Il présente les étoiles locales tels Julien Daoust, Paul Cazeneuve, Blanche de la Sablonnière, et Bella Ouellette. Il s'attarde aussi aux vedettes étrangères comme Sarah Bernhardt, qui a provoqué plusieurs esclandres lors de son séjour à Québec en attaquant les Canadiens français lors d'une conférence de presse donnée au Château Frontenac, en 1905. Trois cents Québécois lui manifestèrent leur hostilité, mais leur attitude n'a pas semblé déranger outre mesure la «divine».

Par ailleurs, Beaucage aborde la question des genres et des formes des oeuvres théâtrales qui ont été proposées à la population québécoise dans la première décennie de ce siècle. Il dévoile les stratégies de production du mélodrame, des variétés, de la revue, du théâtre religieux et de la comédie, tout en tenant compte de la réception des oeuvres et de l'héritage théâtral européen et américain.

Enfin, Beaucage évalue l'impact de l'activité théâtrale francophone au sein de la société québécoise. Dans une perspective sociohistorique, il explique comment le théâtre a participé à l'essor de la vie culturelle, économique et sociale de la ville.

Facile à lire, l'ouvrage de Beaucage est écrit dans un style limpide et contient un précieux calendrier des spectacles mis à l'affiche selon les salles et les années ainsi que la liste des pièces françaises représentées entre 1900 et 1911.

julie boudreault Université Laval

Au pays des ennemis du cinéma: Pour une nouvelle histoire des débuts du cinéma au Québec. Edité par andré gaudreault, germaine lacasse, et jean-pierre sirois-trahan. Québec: Nuit Blanche Éditeur 1996. Pp. 216, illus. \$22.95

As a methodical analysis of the early showings and making of films in Quebec, this book is both useful and highly readable. Based on the premise that there is a dearth of scientifically presented historical material on Quebec cinema, this work – prepared by grafics – seeks to fill that lacuna. It is meticulously documented and carefully outlined. Though each chapter can be approached as an entity, the book is most impressive in its entirety.

The thrust of *Au pays* is to demonstrate that, in Quebec, cinema was a very popular form of entertainment. The Quebec Church was therefore opposed to it from the start. In demonstrating such fierce reactions, conservative forces at the beginning of the century gave Quebec a reputation for being the enemy of film. From 1913 on, the industry was subject to strict provincial censorship and a multitude of rules.

Au pays is divided into four parts. Part One deals with the arrival of Lumières's representatives on 27 June 1896, and with the impact of their work in Quebec. Part Two covers the making of motion pictures. Chapter 2 contains a fascinating account of the oldest moving picture that features Native people, the *Danse indienne*. Chapters 3 and 4 discuss showings of foreign films in Montreal and filmings by Ouimet, Giroux, and Mason, while chapter 5 concerns showings and filmings in Quebec City, the most photographed city of early cinema, one that in 1912 became a large open-air studio for six or seven fictional films, each lasting fifteen minutes. Though foreigners, especially Americans, liked to film in Quebec because of its exotic locale, the Québécois did not recognize either their country or themselves in these foreign interpretations, such as Ouimet's 1908 *Fêtes du tricentenaire de la fondation de Québec*. Chapter 6 deals with genres, and the analysis of documentary versus fiction, a distinction not made well at the time, is riveting. It includes

354 The Canadian Historical Review

descriptions of staged documentaries, or vues arrangées or actualités arrangées.

Part Three treats the reception of cinema in the province. Inevitably, chapter 7 details the censorship that brought about the label 'country of the enemies of cinema.' The role of L.-J. Lemieux as first president of the severe Bureau of Censorship of Motion Pictures of the Province of Quebec is carefully delineated. Chapter 8 tells what kind of welcome this new medium (always written *nouveau media*) received from journalists, and chapter 9 demonstrates that the audience attending these films was not made up entirely of common people.

Part Four, the Exploitation of the New Medium, also containing five chapters, deals in chapter 10 with the *bonimenteur* (or explicator), a figure needed when no sound and shifts of the narrative made the film difficult to understand. Chapters 11 and 12 explain the use of recorded sound and colour in very early silent cinema. This angle may come as a surprise to some, but it is certainly familiar to most film scholars. Finally, chapters 13 and 14 tell of the experiences of early exhibitors of moving pictures. Here the point is made that Georges Gauvreau and his rival Ouimet built the first really large cinema halls in the world, proof of the popularity of cinema in French Canada.

Thus, the label earned by Quebec as the enemy of cinema (one given by Russia) was not a fair one, as is proved by all this activity, production, and attendance in the province. Sadly, it was censorship, particularly against foreign films, which was to blame, and some American studios and others refused to export their products to Quebec.

In addition, there are many documents from newspapers and elsewhere, as well as superb illustrations. 'Photogrammes' explain three foreign films that were made in Quebec City in 1912 because of its architecture and its exotic locale: *A Sailor's Heart*, *Pirate's Gold*, and *The Old Guard*.

This book is a collection of essays that have been published or presented elsewhere by their authors. They are only superficially integrated in the present book form, and there are sometimes lengthy repetitions of data. The editors should have avoided this problem by inserting a note to send a remiss reader back to the page where the data were first articulated. This suggestion is my only criticism of an otherwise deeply researched and indispensable tool for the study of early cinema in Quebec.

janis l. pallister Bowling Green State University, Ohio

Les intellectuels québécois: Formation et engagements, 1919-1939.
catherine pomeyrols. Montreal and Paris: L'Harmattan 1996. Pp. 537.
\$80.50

L'ouvrage, fruit d'une thèse de doctorat, est à inscrire dans le

courant de l'histoire révisionniste du Québec. L'auteure rejette en effet une certaine historiographie, «Issue des courants idéologiques de la Révolution tranquille» (448), laquelle contribuerait trop souvent à perpétuer l'image d'une société repliée sur elle-même et dont le principal point de chute serait l'année 1960, passage obligé vers la modernité. Bien qu'une telle interprétation puisse être nuancée, Pomeyrols aura eu raison, dans le cadre des interrogations révisionnistes, de s'intéresser à la question du nationalisme de droite d'inspiration groulxiste au Canada français; cela, afin de le considérer «dans une problématique plus large qui est celle du monde occidental» (448).

L'objectif de Pomeyrols est double: d'une part, renouveler la compréhension du nationalisme québécois de l'entre-deux-guerres au moyen d'un «fil français» (13), c'est-à-dire en mesurant l'influence des idéologies de droite françaises sur l'élite intellectuelle québécoise; d'autre part, s'interroger sur le type de modernité proposé par ces intellectuels. Elle offre parallèlement une intéressante étude prosopographique, doublée d'une réflexion sur le rôle des intellectuels dans la société québécoise et sur le lien qu'ils entretiennent avec le passé. On navigue ici entre une histoire intellectuelle et une histoire culturelle dont l'étude des idées ne peut que profiter.

Pomeyrols privilégie une approche comparative qui lui permet de nuancer non seulement l'état des connaissances sur le nationalisme de droite au Québec, mais aussi la propension de l'histoire révisionniste à rechercher la modernité à tout prix. Inspirée par les travaux d'historiens français qui ont étudié les caractéristiques de la droite en France, Pomeyrols accorde une importance toute particulière aux sens donnés de part et d'autre de l'Atlantique à la modernité. Elle défend ainsi l'idée que la méconnaissance des idéologies européennes a pu donner à penser que les demandes des intellectuels de la droite nationaliste canadienne-française en faveur d'ajustements économiques et de la laïcisation, ou encore l'utilisation, au fil de leur production, de mot tel que celui de révolution, pouvait être l'expression d'une volonté progressiste ou gauchisante, alors que l'expérience française démontre qu'il n'en est rien. Les leaders de la droite nationaliste au Québec font certes preuve d'ouverture face aux idées européennes, mais seulement après filtrage. Pomeyrols insiste pour rappeler l'importance des influences maurassiennes et des catholiques de droite chez les nationalistes de la droite canadienne-française, ainsi que la crédibilité accordée à la thèse de la psychologie des peuples ou aux positions raciales et antimatérialistes, signes d'une vision idéologique conservatrice dominée par l'idéalisation du passé. Sous les apparences trompeuses d'un vocabulaire aux allures progressistes, la production de la droite nationaliste au Québec

montre, selon Pomeyrols, que «la modernité peut aussi être éminemment réactionnaire» (37) et qu'elle n'est pas «forcément ... situé à gauche, surtout dans l'entre-deux-guerres» (42).

Dans une deuxième section abondamment documentée, Pomeyrols s'attache à faire la «généalogie des idées» de la droite nationaliste canadienne-française à partir d'un découpage chronologique. L'auteure y parvient en suivant pas à pas la construction d'un réseau bien structuré de vingt-trois intellectuels canadiens-français (nés entre 1895 et 1916) partageant une idéologie et un réseau commun de sociabilité dont les ramifications s'étendront jusqu'en France. Elle juxtapose ici le poids des idées françaises repérées dans l'enseignement qui leur est dispensé dans les collèges classiques et le monde universitaire. Pomeyrols insiste alors pour montrer comment les têtes dirigeantes des collèges classiques ont importé puis trié les influences françaises, pour ensuite enseigner ce qui servait leur discours sur la «construction d'une culture nationale» (121).

Pomeyrols jette un nouvel éclairage sur cet épisode au moyen de l'approche prosopographique, ce qui lui permet d'exposer les dénominateurs communs du bagage idéologique accumulé par une cohorte au cours de sa formation. Le traitement donne cependant au lecteur l'impression que ces intellectuels subissaient simplement l'influence de leurs mentors, sans que l'analyse ou la réflexion joue un rôle particulier dans ce processus. L'analyse de la documentation, constituée de cahiers de notes, d'articles tirés de revues et de journaux des collèges et des universités ainsi que de la correspondance des intellectuels étudiés, aurait sans doute permis de relever des interrogations indiquant ce qu'ils ont pu apporter de personnel au processus de définition de la culture nationale. On aurait aussi aimé savoir ce qu'eux-mêmes estimaient relever de la modernité dans leur définition du nationalisme.

Sans aucun doute est-ce le matériel du dernier chapitre de l'ouvrage (chapitre 5, «Engagements») qui s'avère le plus intéressant. Pomeyrols y retrace l'itinéraire des intellectuels hors des structures scolaires. Elle les confronte à «l'épreuve des faits» des années trente et constate que si certains y trouvent des raisons de renouveler leur allégeance au nationalisme de droite, d'autres sont confrontés à une crise de conscience qui les conduira à prendre leur distance face à cette idéologie. L'auteure souligne deux types d'événements en mesure de remettre en question les prémisses du nationalisme jusqu'alors défendu. Le premier est constitué par la mouvance typique de cette décennie: les répercussions de la Crise économique, la montée des fascismes en Europe, le développement du Fordisme, requièrent qu'ils s'ajustent à de nouveaux contextes et à de nouveaux discours. Le deuxième est le contact avec une littérature dont on leur avait jusqu'alors restreint ou refusé l'accès (la lecture de journaux français gauchisants, par exemple). Pomeyrols relate le

choc qu'auront certains intellectuels lorsqu'ils constateront l'étroitesse de leur bagage analytique et de leur lecture de la réalité. Pour ces derniers, le désenchantement sera souvent amer.

Cet ouvrage bien documenté brosse un portrait juste et nuancé des visages de la droite nationaliste au Canada française. Malheureusement, il s'est glissé de nombreuses coquilles qui viennent contrarier la lecture du texte.

sylvie renaud Université du Québec à Montréal

Les congrégations religieuses: De la France au Québec, 1880-1914, tome 1: Premières bourrasques, 1880-1900. guy laperrière. Sainte-Foy: Les Presses de l'université Laval 1996. Pp. x, 228, illus. \$29.00

Guy Laperrière livre le premier tome d'une série de trois consacrée à ce qu'il considère être « un des faits majeurs de l'histoire religieuse du Québec » (2): l'arrivée de congrégations religieuses françaises au Québec de 1880 à 1914.

Selon lui, il est essentiel d'analyser les circonstances et les conséquences de l'immigration dans la mesure où les congrégations religieuses « constituent l'un des leviers principaux utilisés par les autorités ecclésiastiques pour développer une société catholique » (3). En effet, l'implantation des congrégations religieuses françaises aurait été perçue par les autorités ecclésiastiques et par la population comme étant l'effet d'une politique républicaine libérale et anticléricale, favorisant du coup la cristallisation d'une idéologie de défense religieuse face à l'interventionnisme de l'État.

Dans cette optique, le premier tome « se veut d'abord une mise en scène, une mise en appétit » (7). Il concerne la période 1880-1900 qui va du début de l'ère républicaine en France, avec les premières expulsions de congrégations, jusqu'à la veille de l'adoption en 1901 de la loi sur les associations et les fermetures des congrégations.

Laperrière compare au départ l'évolution des congrégations françaises et québécoises avant 1880. Il ressort un parallélisme entre des contextes religieux caractérisés par les mêmes éléments: renouveau religieux, montée de l'ultramontanisme, dévotions et mouvements de piété. L'implantation de quinze congrégations françaises au Québec au cours de la période 1837-79 (neuf masculines et six féminines) serait redevable en bonne partie à l'archevêque de Montréal, Mgr Bourget. On constaterait dès lors une volonté de « rendre la société elle-même catholique » (25), entre autres par la venue de congrégations enseignantes.

Les quatre chapitres suivants permettent d'aborder le moment de rupture entre les situations françaises et québécoises. L'arrivée au pouvoir en 1879 d'un gouvernement français républicain et

anticléricale, le premier décret du 29 mars 1880 obligeant la fermeture de la Compagnie de Jésus, les lois scolaires de 1881, 1882, et 1886, la loi militaire de 1889, et les lois et mesures fiscales vont servir de trame principale à l'exil des congrégations françaises. Les congrégations masculines sont les premières visées parce qu'elles sont plus politisées et qu'elles font concurrence au clergé séculier.

Il apparaît que le Québec n'est pas nécessairement le premier choix des dix-huit congrégations (onze masculines et sept féminines) qui immigrent durant la période 1880–1900. Cependant, cette contrée éloignée possède au moins les avantages d'être catholique et francophone et offre de bonnes possibilités de recrutement, rendant ainsi possible une meilleure réalisation de la mission d'éducation chrétienne « essentielle aux fins religieuses de l'Église et de la société » (89).

Le premier tome se termine par un chapitre situant globalement le contexte religieux au Québec de 1880 à 1900 par le biais des principales luttes politico-religieuses. L'auteur démontre toute l'importance de l'éducation. « Sur l'objectif général d'améliorer l'éducation, tout le monde s'entend. C'est sur le rôle spécifique de l'État que deux grandes positions s'affrontent » (190).

Laperrière adopte toutefois une approche novatrice en atténuant l'impact de la dynamique oppositionnelle entre libéraux et ultramontains. Il existe des idéalistes républicains mais ils sont minoritaires, tout comme les ultramontains d'ailleurs. En fin de compte, l'Église réussira à démontrer sa capacité à maintenir un certain type d'ordre établi par le biais notamment d'un imposant personnel religieux tandis que l'État, trop conscient de l'importance de pouvoir compter sur une main-d'œuvre abondante et peu coûteuse, conservera son autonomie tout en cherchant à éviter les conflits.

La table est donc mise; l'arrivée des congrégations religieuses françaises viendrait aviver les craintes et justifier les réactions pour contrer le libéralisme, le laïcisme et la franc-maçonnerie. Les autorités religieuses et politiques auraient alors un argument de taille leur permettant de poursuivre avec plus de vigueur l'atteinte d'un objectif commun: « maintenir la province, et même le Canada, comme terre catholique et française » (203).

Laperrière a réussi le tour de force de produire à la fois un ouvrage spécialisé et une synthèse facilement accessible. Son ouvrage renferme une multitude d'informations et foisonne de pistes de réflexion. Le problème provient de cette division en trois tomes. Nous sommes dans l'attente du deuxième tome qui constitue « le cœur du sujet et qui sera abondamment nourri de pièces d'archives » (7). L'auteur nous met invariablement en appétit, lorsqu'il affirme que l'implantation des congrégations religieuses françaises est un fait majeur de l'histoire religieuse du Québec. Pour

l'instant, il est difficile de souscrire à ce postulat. En fait, on a du mal à saisir l'ampleur de cette étude entreprise il y a plus de quinze ans et qui a nécessité le dépouillement des archives de quarante-cinq congrégations religieuses.

eric vaillancourt Université du Québec à Montréal

Memory and Hope: Strands of Canadian Baptist History. Edited by david t. priestley. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press 1996. Pp. viii, 211, \$25.00

The articles in this collection were first presented as papers at the 1990 Baptist Heritage Conference in Edmonton, and represent yet another attempt to explore and explain the diversity and complexity of the Baptist experience in Canada. The publication of the papers of any conference presents special challenges to both the editor and the reviewer; this collection, with considerable strengths and obvious weaknesses, is no exception.

Other such volumes, the result of earlier Baptist conferences, have explored some of the major themes of denominational life and development in British North America and Canada.¹ The papers presented here tend to re-examine some of the more important topics, with some success, but the real significance of the collection is to be found in the

¹See for examples Jarold K. Zeman, ed., *Baptists in Canada: Search for Identity amidst Diversity* (Burlington, Ont.: G.R. Welsh 1980); Barry M. Moody, ed., *Repent and Believe: The Baptist Experience in Atlantic Canada* (Hantsport, NS: Lancelot Press 1980); Jarold K. Zeman, ed., *Costly Vision: The Baptist Pilgrimage in Canada* (Burlington, Ont.: G.R. Welsh 1988); David T. Priestly, ed., *A Fragile Stability: Definition and Redefinition of Maritime Baptist Identity* (Hantsport, NS: Lancelot Press 1995).

light it sheds on some largely unexplored areas and little-understood strands.

The settlement and survival of small groups of German Baptists in Ontario and the Prairies in the nineteenth century have hitherto received little scholarly attention. These topics are the focus of articles by David Priestley and Ernest Pasiciel, who also explore the role of American Baptist influence across the border. Here are mixed the issues of ethnic, denominational, and national identity as well as the resulting strains and stresses. Pasiciel's article is especially useful, as he examines the German-Canadian churches of the North American Baptist Conference, arguing that 'the sociocultural background, characteristics, and orientation of the denomination changed dramatically' in the period under review (69). He provides a useful charting of the changes in class, ethnicity, race, and gender roles within the churches. That the churches retained an identity distinct from other Baptist groups, in spite of such changes and the loss of linguistic distinctiveness, allows him to conclude that 'ethnicity, socioeconomic status, and regionalism are not necessary for the perpetuation of denominational divisions' (80).

Similar themes are pursued in Paul Wilson's paper on Old School Baptists in Ontario in the nineteenth century. It deals with Baptists of non-English origin - this time the Scots - and the relationship between church, community, and assimilation. Once again, connections across the border with American Baptist organizations form a subtheme to the piece. Wilson explores the way in which members' faith informed their daily life (political, economic, and social), as well as the influences of rural Ontario on their beliefs and attitudes. There is even a provocative, if too brief, analysis of the changing styles of their church buildings, which represented 'the blend of religious belief and an emerging set of rural Ontario utilitarian values' (90).

The collection's other area of strength is a more familiar theme: the impact of fundamentalism on the Baptist community of Canada. Here the most significant article is Mark Parent's exploration of T.T. Shields's theological shift from a Christ-centred to a Bible-centred approach. He argues, not entirely convincingly, that it was the First World War, during which Shields linked German biblical scholarship with German militarism, that propelled him down the road to biblical inerrancy and, thus, fundamentalism. Parent's extensive use of Shields's sermons provides strong evidence of this important shift in emphasis, though one might be left uncertain as to the cause. The relationship between the Great War and religious conservatism in Canada, so tantalizingly explored here, is clearly a subject worthy of further investigation.

If the strengths of the book are readily apparent, so, too, are its limitations. Included are several marginal papers, which add little, if

anything, to our understanding of the Baptist experience in Canada. Especially problematic are those articles that use the past selectively, only to provide a launching pad for a discussion of present or future directions within the denomination, or to urge a return to a (probably mythical) 'true' Baptist position, most often located in the nineteenth century. A more critical selection process would have resulted in a slimmer but much stronger volume.

Another problem is the absence of any articles on Baptists in the Atlantic region, where the denomination, and its historiography, are particularly strong. All the Baptist conferences of the past twenty years have yielded enough papers from this region to make up a separate volume. While there is a certain logic to this approach, it does mean that the resulting explorations of 'Canadian' Baptist development, such as the volume under review, end up representing only that experience west of the Quebec/New Brunswick border. In this case, an important part of the 'Strands of Canadian Baptist History' is missing. On balance, I would argue that the best of the papers from conferences representing all parts of the country should be collected into one volume, to convey a comprehensive picture of Canadian Baptist history.
barry moody Acadia University

The Chignecto Covenanters: A Regional History of Reformed Presbyterianism in New Brunswick and Nova Scotia, 1827-1905. eldon hay. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1996. Pp. xvi, 214, \$39.95

Hay's study of the Reformed Presbyterian Churches (Covenanters) of the Chignecto region is a stimulating, well-researched, and well-written examination of a little-known denomination in the border region of Nova Scotia and New Brunswick. By focusing on a restricted geographical area and a numerically small denomination, he is able to provide a useful case study, in which the forces of both the old and new worlds and the impact of specific individuals can be clearly seen.

From the beginning it is clear that this study is firmly rooted in the lives of individuals. The first chapter focuses on the decision of Alexander and Catherine Clarke to go from Ireland to New Brunswick as Covenanter or Reformed Presbyterian missionaries. The Rev. Alexander Clarke dominates the early chapters of the book, as he does the early days of the denomination in the Maritimes. Other ministers are given their place in the study as well, although to none does Hay ascribe the same central role - for good and ill - that he gives to Clarke. The part played by individuals in both the growth of the denomination and its ultimate destruction is clearly revealed. One could wish for a stronger voice for the laity in this

book, but one suspects that the records are not sufficient to make this possible.

A very useful chapter on the Scottish and Irish origins of this branch of Presbyterianism provides the necessary background for an understanding of the arrival of the first Covenanter missionaries, and for the subsequent problems that plagued the fledgling denomination almost from the beginning of its existence in the Maritimes. In the history of this microcosm being studied, it becomes all too apparent how difficult it was to translate intact to North America an old-world denomination based on a conviction of historic injustices dating back several centuries. Covenant principles, in the case of Clarke and others, did not survive the sea voyage in their entirety, something those who sent the missionaries out were never able to understand. The stumbling block for Clarke and many of his followers was the Covenanter 'distinctive' that forbade voting and standing for public office, since both acts recognized the legitimacy of the monarch as head of the state. By becoming directly involved and voting in the Nova Scotia elections of 1836 and 1847, Clarke revealed both his apostasy and the struggle between old-world grievances and new-world imperatives. That this action led to the severing of all ties between the missionary and his Irish parent body reveals both the strength of that sense of injustice and the difficulty of maintaining it intact in North America.

According to Hay, the disagreement with the Irish missionary board led directly to a second important phase of Covenanter growth in the region. Alienated from the mother country, Clarke did what so many other British North American denominational leaders did in the nineteenth century: he looked to co-religionists in the United States. Hay makes much of this point, seeing in the 1848 decision to join the New School General Synod of the Reformed Presbyterian Church in North America the seeds of the future dissolution of the denomination that Clarke sought to protect. During the rest of the century, 'Chignecto "Covenanterism" became little more than a wholly owned subsidiary of American General Synod Reformed Presbyterianism' (114). Participation in civic elections proved to be only the thin end of the wedge in the destruction of the distinctive position of the Covenanters and in the abandonment of old-world attitudes.

The last part of the study deals with the causes for the decline and disappearance of the denomination in that region. The impact of the Presbyterian Church union in Canada in 1875 is examined, and the author clearly shows how Covenanter decline was precipitated by the repeated defections that took place. The author touches only lightly on another important cause for ultimate failure: Reformed Presbyterianism was a movement with its eyes too firmly fixed on the past, especially the perceived wrongs done to early seventeenth-century Scotland. One is forced to conclude that the ease with which both clergy and laity of Chignecto jettisoned important Covenanter

Book Reviews 367

distinctives showed a lack of understanding of and commitment to their importance.

The only major problem with this fine study is its unfortunate brevity (116 pages of text). A number of events are passed over too quickly, and the understanding of some readers may suffer as a result. Better, fuller definitions of some terms would have been useful – session, synod, presbytery, for example. 'Communion tokens' are casually mentioned, with no explanation. In the last three pages of the book, the author deals with the impact on the Covenanters of higher criticism and the move from religion to religiosity in the late nineteenth century. There is no time, and certainly no evidence advanced, to examine these important themes. These are, however, minor criticisms, and come only from an Oliver Twist who is always asking for more.

barry moody Acadia University

Aspects of the Canadian Evangelical Experience. Edited by g.a. rawlyk. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1997. Pp. xxv, 542. \$55.00

The Contribution of Presbyterianism to the Maritime Provinces of Canada. Edited by charles h.h. scobie and g.a. rawlyk. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1997. Pp. xix, 267, illus. \$49.95

The late George Rawlyk prodded Canadian historians to integrate the Maritime region into Canadian historiography and accept the presence of an evangelical tradition in Canadian society. In his ongoing work on Henry Alline, in particular, these two themes came together. The fruits of Rawlyk's scholarship are demonstrated in these valuable collections.

In *Aspects of the Canadian Evangelical Experience*, the contributors adopt David Bebbington's influential definition of what comprises evangelicalism: emphasis on personal conversion, insistence on activism, belief in the Bible as the word of God, and attention to the meaning of Christ's sacrifice through the crucifixion. In this volume, religions as diverse as evangelical Anglicanism, the preaching of Aimee Semple McPherson, the Christian and Missionary Alliance, and Lutheranism are all considered under this evangelical umbrella. There is little discussion of whether the concept of evangelicalism is being applied too widely or broadly. Much like those who think the term 'secularization' should be put in the trash heap of historiography for being applied without reservation, the same case could be made for evangelicalism. Nevertheless, many religious traditions or movements that have been largely ignored in Canadian historiography are explored in this collection.

Debate on the question of evangelical religion's success and influence, especially in the twentieth century, does surface. John Stackhouse questions the image of a victorious evangelicalism by suggesting that it was the faith of a minority and that it made little impact on most Canadians. Andrew Grenville presents statistical evidence, based on polling data, to suggest that sixteen per cent of Canadians, including evangelical Catholics, can be included within the evangelical fold. Many essays focusing on the nineteenth century demonstrate the vibrancy of evangelicalism. Marguerite Van Die's essay on Methodism challenges the notion that evangelicalism declined as Methodists became more respectable and middle class. Instead, she argues that the new middle-class ethos that emerged in the 1850s revitalized Methodism through an emphasis on philanthropic and charitable activity. The Methodist faith represented a potent mix of evangelicalism and capitalism. On the opposite pole is the provocative essay by Barry Mack on Presbyterianism. He argues that there was a profound generational change in the early twentieth century. In leading Presbyterians into Church Union, the new leadership lost sight of the evangelical concern about sin, grace, and redemption. The result, Mack argues, is that Presbyterianism was characterized by a 'decay of traditional belief.' It was unable to 'withstand the secular wasteland of ... Canada.' The essays that concentrate on the crucial role that leadership plays in evangelicalism suggest a similar tension or ambiguity. In his exploration of the hugely successful Crossley-Hunter team, Kevin Kee wonders if they compromised too much of their message and methodology to the demands of entertainment. Perhaps fittingly, this conflict reflects an unresolved but central tension in Rawlyk's own scholarship. Convinced of the power of evangelicalism in Canadian society, he was also keenly aware of the corroding influence of modern consumerism on the evangelical tradition.

Other essays in this rich volume point to important new directions in scholarship. Bebbington argues that the standard view that the United States influenced Canadian religion through its enthusiasm and innovative brand of populist evangelicalism, while British influences moderated this American extremism, is inaccurate. Streams of British emigration and some evangelical leaders, Bebbington asserts, played a role in sustaining friction, innovation, and enthusiasm in Canadian religious life. Other contributions raise questions with regard to class, ethnicity, and gender. In discussing evangelicalism in various Mennonite traditions, Bruce Guenther and Robert Buckinshaw suggest that evangelicalism helped forge an identity that was North American instead of immigrant or ethnic. Evangelicalism may have been a powerful agent of acculturation. Gauvreau and Christie challenge working-class historians to take evangelicalism seriously by focusing on the Winnipeg workers in the period around the General Strike. The worker, they reveal, did

not want to hear sermons on social reform, but evangelical sermons on personal sin and redemption. This provocative essay suggests a religious fissure in Winnipeg along class lines. Finally, Sharon Ann Cook explores the ways in which evangelicalism informed women's attitudes to a constellation of important concerns, such as the family, gender relations, and social reform.

The *Contribution of Presbyterianism to the Maritime Provinces of Canada* also contains many valuable essays. Some sketch in certain aspects of Presbyterian history in the Maritimes, such as the role of Presbyterianism in education, the slavery question, social reform, and missions. Other essays raise important historiographical issues. Particularly important is Laurie Stanley Blackwell's article on 'holy fairs,' the open-air communion services on Cape Breton island. This essay provides superb descriptions of the rituals in revival meetings and discusses the significance of sacraments in religious life. The most provocative essay in this volume is Paul Bogaard's discussion of the teaching of science in Maritime universities. He uses the vantage point of scientific instruction by Thomas McCulloch and William Dawson to challenge the importance placed on the Baconian tradition and on natural history in Canadian thought and evangelicalism. Bogaard demonstrates that these Presbyterian educators emphasized Newtonian science, with its attention to natural philosophy and reliance on experimentation and abstraction. He shows that Newtonian speculation about the nature of the universe was consistent with evangelical religion. If nature revealed the glory and wisdom of God the Creator, then so did the laws of the universe. Bogaard's conclusions suggest that there is an important scientific tradition that has been largely overlooked by intellectual and religious historians in Canada.

Both these volumes are important additions to religious history in Canada, a field that George Rawlyk was instrumental in igniting out of the doldrums of ecclesiastical history. They are also fine testimonials to Rawlyk's cutting-edge scholarship and his considerable vibrancy and influence.

David B. Marshall University of Calgary

'Toil and Peaceful Life': Doukhobor Village Settlement in Saskatchewan, 1899-1918. Carl J. Tracie. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center 1996. Pp. 230, illus. \$24.00

Many aspects of Doukhobor history have sparked scholarly interest: persecution in Russia, pacifism, the struggle to establish communal agriculture in western Canada, conflicts with the Canadian government for refusing to comply with homestead and citizenship regulations, and the notorious demonstrations of nudity, arson, and farm animal liberation by the Sons of Freedom sect. In 1968 Ivan

Avakumovic and George Woodcock explored these themes in *The Doukhobors*, a highly praised book upheld by many as a model for the writing of ethnic history.

In *Toil and Peaceful Life*, Carl Tracie does not ignore the dramatic themes of that seminal study, but his attention is focused elsewhere. He investigates the impact of the Doukhobors on the Saskatchewan landscape. His specific target is fifty-seven centralized farm villages transplanted from the old world. Tracie marks their locations (and relocations), monitors their population changes, and scrutinizes their layouts, architecture, and building materials. He also charts their progress in cultivating surrounding farmlands, and inventories their livestock, implements, and cottage industries. To do so, he employs a technique favoured by many historical geographers: providing snapshots or 'cross-sectional' views of the cultural landscape in particular years. Tracie selected three years particularly rich in sources that marked significant phases in the development of Doukhobor settlements: 1899, when immigrants first arrived and established themselves on the land; 1905, when communal life under the leadership of Peter Verigin reached its zenith; and 1913, when decline was clearly evident due to conflicts with the dominion government and the migration of many Doukhobors to British Columbia. For each year, the author looks closely at each of the major Doukhobor reserves in turn, and provides transitional chapters on the intervening periods.

Tracie's methodology and organizational structure result in much unwelcome repetition, but there are compensating virtues. His fastidious attention to detail reveals tremendous diversity within Doukhobor society. He notes, for example, that some Doukhobors committed themselves fully to communalism, while others practised it in varying degrees, and still others remained wholly individualistic. Even among communalists, some rejected the leadership and vision of Peter Verigin and organized independent communes. The relative proportions of these various forms of economic cooperation varied from reserve to reserve, from village to village, and even within villages. This diversity sprang, in part, from differences among groups of Doukhobors that emigrated from various regions in Russia, and from the specific qualities of the lands on which they settled. But Doukhobor society also experienced repeated upheavals, and its diverse character changed over time.

Tracie cannot be accused of overgeneralization; at times, his meticulous research leads him to note so many exceptions, insert so many qualifications, and draw such fine distinctions that his generalizations almost fade away entirely. Nonetheless, he is able to demonstrate how the cultural landscape reflected this diversity. Economically independent Doukhobors, for example, combined house and barn into single structures, while communal Doukhobors constructed large cooperative barns and built separate houses. Many admirable features of the book guide the reader through the

Book Reviews 371

complexity of description and analysis: clear prose, plenty of excellent maps and photographs, the relegation of many statistics to tables, and the placement of notes at the bottom of each page. The return of the notes to their proper place, for which the publisher deserves high praise, is especially valuable here because many of them are explanatory.

For those interested in the religious-political history of the Doukhobors, the book refines, but does not supersede, the existing literature. Such readers may discover that they learn far more about Doukhobor settlement patterns than they ever wished to know. For those with a serious interest in cultural geography, however, the book makes a valuable and welcome appearance.

paul voisey University of Alberta

Mennonites in Canada, 1939–1970: A People Transformed. t.d. regehr. Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1996. Pp. xxxviii, 563, illus. \$29.95

This is the third and, for the present, final volume of a history of the Mennonites in Canada, the first of which appeared in 1974. The two earlier volumes were written by the late Frank H. Epp; Regehr, an established historian of Mennonite descent, has completed the trilogy. In the absence of many critical, scholarly studies of Mennonite life, Regehr has acted as primary researcher and synthesizer of a mass of unanalysed information. His research took him to Europe, the United States, and to numerous Canadian archives, Mennonite and non-Mennonite. He carried out oral history, and, in places, reflects on his personal experiences of people and events.

It is no easy task to link the history of Canadian Mennonites into a cohesive, comprehensible account. There are immense differences among Mennonite groups in Canada in terms of their historical origins, time and place of settlement, developing religious views, and interactions within and reactions to Canadian society. The fact that congregations have maintained a high degree of independence, even while provincial, national, and international Mennonite organizations have developed, merely adds to the complex task of writing any general Mennonite history.

Regehr deals with this complexity chronologically in sixteen chapters divided into five parts. Each part has a different emphasis, producing a more thematic approach to each period. Of immediate concern to Mennonites after 1939 was the Second World War, a challenge to a non-resistant people and one that threw into sharp focus the differences among Mennonite groups. Postwar economic prosperity, combined with rapid changes in Canadian society, produced new challenges for a voluntarist religious group that depended heavily on the continuity of generations, on language

differences, and on separation from the world to maintain its distinct identity and membership. The challenges of prosperity, education, language shift, changing authority structures in congregations and conferences, and Mennonite activism in Canadian and international affairs are all dealt with in detail. The book moves from the world of the farm cart towards the industrial urban complex illustrated on the cover of the book.

A central theme of Regehr's book involves this shift from rural-based religious communities to modern, urban society. However, in structuring his discussion, Regehr depends too heavily on the simple taxonomies and impoverished theoretical models of some Mennonite sociologists. This reliance prevents him from focusing on the diversity and complexity of regional and local developments. His understanding of the social forces at work in rural communities is weak, and he seems unable to analyse the rural/urban divide already present before 1914.

Although Mennonites were severely constrained by economic conditions, the interwar period saw the emergence of new forms of social differentiation within rural communities before there was any large Mennonite movement to the cities. In rural service towns, petit-capitalists exploited ties of kinship, religious loyalties, and community exclusiveness long before education, social and physical mobility, and bourgeois tastes moved people away from rural areas into the cities. In many rural areas, the old faith has been replaced by evangelical closed-mindedness that has retained and exploited local labour. In urban areas, conservative evangelical denominationalism and trendy religious experimentation often reflect the contrast between the two Mennonite worlds of small business and professional groups. Transformation is as much a rural as an urban phenomenon.

There is another problem that is not addressed in detail. In his earlier volumes, Epp had the luxury of dealing with Mennonites as a people defined primarily by religious values, with strongly inherited cultural traditions that maintained distinctive, although diverse, communities. Being Mennonite has always involved more than just religion, but religion inevitably lay at its centre. In Regehr's account of postwar Mennonite life, however, there are many 'missing' Mennonites. This group includes those who remain religious, but no longer as 'Mennonites'; those who reject 'Mennonite' as a religious label, but continue to identify themselves as ethnic, cultural Mennonites; and those who totally reject their ancestry. Although also a consequence of postwar tendencies, including secularization and multiculturalism, the origins of these changes lie well before 1939.

It is easy, however, to criticize a book such as this, without recognizing its virtues. This is no hagiography, and, like his predecessor, Regehr has not shied away from controversial issues. His approach is judicious, although, at times, enigmatic. The

Book Reviews 373

problem is one of audience: at times, Regehr appears to address only Mennonites, not a general readership. Some of his brief and most critical comments about people, events, and Mennonite values might go unnoticed by an uninitiated reader. For such a reader, however, Regehr's book provides an excellent, detailed, and scholarly introduction to recent Mennonite history.

James Urry Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand

The Work of Their Hands: Mennonite Women's Societies in Canada. Gloria Neufeld Redekop. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press 1996. Pp. xvi, 172, \$24.95

According to Gloria Redekop, Mennonite women's groups (Vereine) have 'functioned as a parallel church,' providing 'a context where women could speak, pray, and creatively give expression to their understanding of the biblical message' alongside their brothers in the faith. In some ways that approach is reminiscent of the early historiography of Canadian women's organizations, in which separate spheres was a guiding principle. Redekop calls this division the 'dual reality' of Mennonite women's experiences, pointing out that 'there was a life within the institutional church, predominantly male controlled, and another life within the context of women's societies' (18). Informed by recent historiographic trends (and a certain sympathy for her informants), the author does not automatically equate religion and oppression, as some feminists before her were wont to do. Instead, she sets out to explore female agency, to take female spirituality seriously, and to consider how gender and ethnicity intersect. She is clearly determined to make her account more than 'contribution history,' where women's experiences are recovered and added to the record, although she concurs with Marlene Epp that this corrective is badly needed in Mennonite historiography.

Redekop declares that her purposes were to be informed by the women's own voices; to understand from the women's points of view the meanings they attached to their membership; and to acknowledge that women were consciously compensating for their decidedly inferior status within Mennonite gender politics. This book is a feminist study, a revisionist consideration of groups which seem to ascribe decidedly traditional roles to women and which previously 'have been thought of in a disparaging way as contexts for women's "gossip"' (19).

Looking at thirteen decades of Mennonite women's group work, the author highlights 'the work of their hands,' such as mission projects, wartime sewing and knitting, and community mutual aid, activities that closely parallel the work of other women's groups, both within and outside churches. What sets these women apart

from their secular sisters is their spirituality. Redekop surveyed 188 women's groups of the Mennonite Brethren and the Conference of Mennonites in Canada and recorded the Bible verses they chose as group mottoes and the names they selected for the organizations. Based on this information, she argues that the Scriptures and the group names are proof of members' biblical motivation. She found that these motives fell into three categories: service, fellowship, and worship. It would be interesting to know if the three purposes were equally valued among the whole membership or whether those in leadership positions had different priorities than the members-at-large. Oral history might be helpful to explore whether hierarchies of power developed among the women, providing a further, though unintentional, parallel to the larger church.

Redekop notes how the experiences of Mennonite women sometimes reflected larger trends in Canadian society. For example, the postwar popularity of Mennonite women's groups was in keeping with renewed attention to domesticity throughout the country, and the 1970s decline in membership was tied to married women's increased participation in the labour force. She is interested in change over time, and the questions she raises about declining interest in women's organizations are intriguing, not just for this church, but for other traditional women's groups undergoing the same demographic trends. What were women demonstrating during the past twenty-five years by their aversion to membership? In part, it was a reflection of sociological change, because working women were more likely to donate money than time-consuming handwork or home baking, as their grandmothers had done. But it was also about feminism. Redekop titillatingly refers to an article published during the Friedan era which asked, 'Is there a Mennonite feminine mystique?' Did hesitation about joining up mean that some Mennonite women had begun to 'think in disparaging ways' about traditional women's groups, pushing for shared leadership inside the church rather than settling for gender exclusive parallels? As twentieth-century secularism advanced, it is also conceivable that these women were giving up more of their heritage than just the use of the German language. Redefinitions of work, feminism, and spirituality were under way, and expressions of mission, aid, and service could not remain static.

In only 130 pages of text, this ambitious book sweeps through almost as many years (1874-1995), often leaving the reader wanting more. The first chapter has interesting potential for classroom use because it is written like an itemized catalogue of recent historiographic developments. That discussion could give students a useful vantage point from which to explore the growing field of women and religion through the lens of this Mennonite case study.

linda m. ambrose Laurentian University

Book Reviews 375

For Home and Country: The Centennial History of the Women's Institutes in Ontario. linda m. ambrose. Guelph: Federated Women's Institutes of Ontario 1996. Pp. 256, illus. \$35.00

In her history of the Women's Institutes in Ontario, Linda Ambrose provides a fascinating glimpse into the workings of an established rural women's voluntary organization. A wonderful by-product of her research are insights into the changing female face of rural Ontario.

Ambrose documents and celebrates the work of the Federated Women's Institutes of Ontario (fwio) during its first 100 years. Beginning with the founders and ending with an exploration of the future of the Women's Institutes, Ambrose encounters a 'world of women's culture, a portrait of rural life' that urban academic historians seldom see. What an interesting picture it is.

The work of women's voluntary organizations in the formation of our rural communities must not be underestimated. Indeed, the founding of the Women's Institutes in 1897 at Stoney Creek, Ontario, launched a worldwide movement. In Canada, the Women's Institutes gave rural women opportunities to expand their homemaking skills and knowledge, develop their leadership potential, and work with other women towards common social and economic goals. Women's Institutes celebrations enhanced the social life of many communities, and the physical landscape was altered by the construction of branch meeting rooms.

An organization is never only one kind of accomplishment. My work on the Jubilee Guilds of Newfoundland and Labrador, the foremother of the Newfoundland and Labrador Women's Institutes, shows complex processes at work. Class and religious boundaries were breached, and traditional gendered divisions of labour challenged. Education programs promoted class-based ideologies of self-help and self-reliance. A Women's Institute motto from Ontario links homemaking and nation-building: 'A nation cannot rise higher than the level of its homes.' The upper-class women founders of the Jubilee Guilds used this motto to promote their work in the 1930s. Through thoughtful and deliberate practices, these women actively engaged in state formation long before Newfoundland became part of Canada.

The Federated Women's Institutes of Ontario is also more than one kind of organization. Ambrose finds that it is not fully traditionalist or feminist-activist, but varies greatly depending on the orientation of the women in the local branch. For many, the Women's Institute was the place they learned about cooking and sewing, or public speaking, while for others it was a 'social time,' a chance to meet and talk with other rural women. Still others joined because they saw the Women's Institute as a group 'committed to political activism.'

The photographs in this book clearly show the wide appeal of the Women's Institutes. Young and old have participated, and women are surrounded by friends, relatives, neighbours, and children. Program activities are visible: women knit, learn to sew, run milk and soup programs for children, prepare catered meals, and restore meeting rooms and heritage buildings. This multifaceted image remains central throughout the book.

Ambrose situates the founding of the Women's Institutes in the 1890s' reform movements that addressed scientific agriculture and improved domestic economy. Leaders of the Farmers' Institutes, Erland Lee, F.W. Hodson, and Dr G.C. Creelman, supported the inclusion of women in rural organizations. In a radical move, 'lady speakers' were sent forth to give public lectures on home economics to members of the newly formed Women's Institutes. The work of these itinerant lecturers and organizers, especially Bessie Livingston, Mary Miller, Laura Rose Stephen, and Alice Hollingworth, deserves more attention from historians.

The Women's Institutes adapted to changing times. During the Second World War, Ontario members pieced quilts, knitted socks, and packed 'comfort boxes' for soldiers. They shipped maple sugar, vegetable seeds, and thousands of pounds of homemade jam to the British Isles. Action went hand-in-hand with thinking, however, and women were urged to 'turn their attention to peace proposals and post-war plans,' thus maintaining a focus on a better world.

The end of government sponsorship in the late 1980s brought changes to the fwio. New rural women's organizations, intent on influencing agricultural policy, challenged the close relationship between the Women's Institutes and the Ontario Ministry of Agriculture and Food. Working across the increasingly diverse political positions of rural women has not proved easy for the fwio. Rural women recognize that their lives have altered considerably in the last 100 years. The challenge for the Federated Women's Institutes of Ontario is to find new means to support those new lives.

Extensive archival research and the collection of oral narratives are the foundation of this engaging book. Sources include statistical and financial records from the Ontario government, reports from fwio conferences, and local branch and area minute books. Branch records are especially valuable, since they usually chronicle the activities undertaken by local women, not simply the directives from headquarters. Many women's organizations lack this genre of records, and researchers are often left to speculate on the local application of provincewide programs. Interviews with members provide rich personal details on the women and work of the Women's Institutes.

A new archival collection of Women's Institutes' material was established during this project. It is a worthy legacy of this centennial history and a tribute to the years of commitment from the

Book Reviews 377

members of the Federated Women's Institutes of Ontario. This enjoyable book contributes greatly to our understanding of the important work of the Women's Institutes in Canada.

linda cullum St John's

'Other' Voices: Historical Essays on Saskatchewan Women. Edited by david debrou and aileen moffatt. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, University of Regina 1995. Pp. 166, illus. \$16.00

One of the defining characteristics of Canadian women's history is its attention to the specificity of place. 'Other' Voices: Historical Essays on Saskatchewan Women's History is the Saskatchewan contribution to a genre of provincial or regional women's history that now needs only a volume or two on Canada's northern regions to complete the set. For editors Dave DeBrou and Aileen Moffatt, producing such a collection demanded diversifying the cast of historical characters associated with Saskatchewan women's history. The result is a useful collection of essays presenting some evocative new historical scholarship.

To achieve their goal of 'multi-vocality,' many of the essays explore the interplay of gender and ethnicity. Articles by Lesley Erickson, Mathilde Jutras, and Anna Felman consider the Swedish, francophone, and Jewish women, respectively, who emigrated to Saskatchewan in the decades of agricultural settlement, 1880 to 1940. Jo-Anne Lee provides a welcome contribution on late-twentieth-century Asian migration in her analysis of three oral narratives of female immigrants from the Philippines and Sri Lanka. In one of the strongest contributions, Miriam McNab surveys the ways women from the northern Pinehouse Lake Aboriginal community have responded to the dramatic changes wrought by European colonization and the 'intrusion of southern cultural influences' (131). Pointing to the differential pace of change experienced by the province's southern and northern First Nations people, McNab argues that Pinehouse Lake women felt the impact of 'village sedentization' more keenly than their male counterparts. As a result, northern Native women are now seeking out the opportunities that cities offer, confident they can adapt to urban culture without losing either their traditional land or language.

Diversity is also documented through attention to class. Julie Dorsch's study of farm women in the post-1945 era reminds us of the many changes that have affected farm women in the second half of this century. Theresa Healey's fine essay explores Saskatoon women's mobilization to defend and improve relief programs during the early years of the Depression and addresses the themes of urban working-class women's political action. Nadine Small reinterprets the work of Saskatchewan's Imperial Order Daughters

of the Empire (iode) during the First World War by emphasizing how class and ethnic privilege defined those women's patriotic and community activities.

A central theme uniting many of these essays is that of exclusion: the authors hope to write these 'other' voices into a historical narrative that has ignored them to date. This analytic goal is articulated explicitly in Aileen Moffatt's very useful historiographical essay, 'Great Women, Separate Spheres, and Diversity.' Moffatt provides a comprehensive overview of the historical scholarship in Saskatchewan women's history, beginning with the limited references made to women in early provincial histories, through to suggestions for future areas of possible and productive research. In between, Moffatt argues, have been three stages of scholarship: compensatory or celebratory history (which focused on élite and notable women), followed by 'women's culture/separate spheres' (which emphasized the unique and common experiences of women), and, in recent years, diversity (of experiences and identity). This model is convenient, though one wonders whether the stages overlap so much as to be almost meaningless. Perhaps the concept of paradigms would be more accurate.

A similar problem plagues the editorial introduction. DeBrou and Moffatt offer an oddly repetitive model of three stages of Canadian women's history, in which only diversity produces analytic complexity. In addition to incorrectly characterizing earlier approaches to women's history as mono-causal (a substantial corpus of socialist-feminist scholarship was devoted to analysing the 'dual' and contradictory systems of patriarchy and capitalism), the editors miss opportunities to show precisely when knowledge of diversity creates new kinds of complexities and when it confirms earlier scholarly appraisals.

For instance, 'Other' Voices articles on turn-of-the-century migration reveal that, like the ethnic 'majority' women studied by Sundberg and Jackel, ethnic 'minority' women experienced agricultural settlement in gender-specific ways, some flourishing in their new homeland, others wilting. Frequent absences of male kin-folk prompted Swedish immigrant women to expand their spheres of activity, in contrast to francophone women who expressed la grande nostalgie for their homelands. The introduction needs to address how and why two groups of women, facing similar structures of loneliness and linguistic barriers, responded so differently. Was the difference truly the result of ethnically specific communities or a function of the different evidence bases the two authors used – one printed materials, the other oral histories?

Nor do the editors sufficiently question the fact that Euro-Canadian newcomers of all ethnic groups and of both genders were laying claim to Native homelands. The role of white women in the

Book Reviews 379

colonization process remains underanalysed by authors and editors alike. Greater critical attention to these broader questions is imperative if we are to hear in these 'other voices' the complexities diversity engenders.

kathryn mcpherson York University

I Bless You in My Heart: Selected Correspondence of Catharine Parr Traill. Edited by Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael A. Peterman. Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1996. Pp. xxi, 438, illus. \$39.95

Catharine Parr Traill is best known as the author of *The Backwoods of Canada*, and essayists have focused on her life as a pioneer and as a writer of cheerful, practical tracts of advice for prospective settlers in Canada. The publication of 136 of her letters in this volume reveals a more complex person who wrote on varied subjects and who became the matriarch of a large extended family. This is a work of impeccable scholarship, with letters carefully selected and introduced by informative biographical essays before each of the three sections covering Traill's long life.

The letters reveal several aspects of her world, which was nineteenth-century Canadian society in eastern Upper Canada. Hers was a strong community of friends and family, despite separations by distance. They shared food, clothes, seeds, gossip, and burdens. They boarded each other's children, assisted in births and deaths, and gave enormous support to each other out of necessity and convention. With little money and the constant threat of illness (they frequently broke out in boils), they exhibited the civility and graciousness of another era in often formally written correspondence. Within this community, Traill was both loved and admired, though she was not above expressing a frank opinion. Referring to an inheritance of a small amount of money, she lamented, 'We nor Aunt Moodie never got a single keepsake from the Reydon things which was rather mean I must say' (203). With this emotional support, and because of her deeply held Christian beliefs and a love of life, she was sustained through the deaths of her husband, three children (one was murdered), several grandchildren, and the trials and tribulations of her friends and family over three generations.

Like other women of her class and generation, in Upper Canada's early years she raised a large family, ran a household under difficult, impoverished conditions, and tried to help her severely depressed husband, who predeceased her by many years. She sewed, gardened, cooked, and was a teacher, midwife, and nurse when occasion demanded it.

What was distinctive and unusual about Traill was that she, being one of the literary Stricklands, wrote consistently, amid the din of family life, sometimes late in the evening by candlelight. There is a

suggestion that she separated her inner life of ideas from her domestic and social roles. She read literature and natural history, and later in life she met, conversed, and corresponded with leading scientists like botanist John Macoun, geologist William Dawson, and entomologist James Fletcher. However, as she wrote to a sister in England: in Lakefield, 'I never bring forward myself keeping quietly the even tenor of my way - without obtruding myself, or introducing topics of this kind among my friends in our little world - there are always little matters to talk about beside Books - those that interest me most on Botany and flowers - and natural History have not much charm for any out of our own - but here [in Ottawa] I find many friends among the Professors and we get on charmingly' (233). Her published work included non-fiction and literature for adults and children. She produced two important botanical studies, *Canadian Wild Flowers* (1868) and *Studies of Plant Life in Canada* (1886), for which in her final years she was recognized by both the Canadian and British governments as a distinguished botanist. Her fame bemused her, for when she was invited to a Saturday night fête in Ottawa by the governor general and found she was the subject of admiring stares and whispers, she wrote, 'The poor old lioness squeezed herself into a corner (I believe some people expected her to roar or wag her tail) not being accustomed to be gazed at in that way - it was a little oppressive' (238). Thus, she was part of a very small number of North American female naturalists whose intellectual lives and actions expanded the boundaries of traditional female culture and scientific knowledge.

Her love of the natural world and sensitivity to her environment helped her adjust to Canada more successfully and completely than did her sister, Susanna Moodie. In 1895 she wrote to author William Kirby that 'now for the last sixty two years' she was 'a Canadian by adoption, and I love the land - birthplace of my children and grandchildren and hallowed by the graves of my loved and dead' (372).

Trill was blessed in having a buoyant and optimistic temperament that eased her way through life. She was not a complainer. When she and her friend Ellen Dunlop accidentally picked up each other's 'specs,' she wrote that she would return them at once, though she could and did read with Ellen's as 'I have wonderfully accomodating [sic] eyes like an old pussy-cat' (232). Her letters consistently effused warmth, strength and, sometimes, humour.

Catharine Parr Trill was a remarkable woman in that she had nine children, wrote seventeen books, and lived to be ninety-eight years old. Her selected correspondence from about 500 letters has been reproduced in an informative way that is historically accurate and enlightening, so that readers not only can be introduced to this wonderful character but are reminded of the difficulties our forbears

endured before technology and modern medicine eased life's tasks and strains.

laurel sefton macdowell University of Toronto

Haven't Any News: Ruby's Letters from the Fifties. Edited by edna staebler. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press 1995. pp. x, 165. \$18.95

For some time now the 1950s have been fashionable. Historians, many of us boomer products of that decade, are among the most fascinated. Immersed in those years after the Second World War, we seek the roots of nostalgia or malaise, explanations for our postmodern condition. Fortunately, those who were adults during that transitional decade are often still around to set us straight about the complexities of the lives they led. Saved and edited by her sister, Ruby's letters do just that. While modestly titled, Haven't Any News, they challenge aware readers now, just as they must have Ruby's family earlier, to understand the limitations and the possibilities of life for a married, middle-class, white woman in Barrie, Ontario.

In her Afterword, Marlene Kadar, a scholar of 'life writing,' identifies as central to the narrative five primary 'story-themes,' those of love for and anxiety about food, childraising, women's work, animals, and personal appearance, as well as three 'covert themes' of longings for money, creativity, and companionship. Certainly these issues crowd the page and reveal that the 'letters are not only the site of communication, but of self-presentation and affirmation'(164). The distinctions between the two categories and among the eight themes appear artificial to this historian. As she tries to negotiate the various roles she has to play as daughter, sister, wife, mother, neighbour, and worker, Ruby's life seems, finally, all of a piece. Her letters move quickly from one subject or theme to another, as she juggles diverse responsibilities and tries to be more than their sum. Her boomer offspring, a daughter and a son, not to mention her insurance agent husband, are anchored in the middle-class community of Ontario by her labours, both paid and unpaid. As she grows older, entering menopause, Ruby writes to assert her own version of events, even if they can only be acknowledged by her mother and sisters. She did not want to be ignored in the 1950s. Nor, as revealed in the few words we have from her when she was eighty-four, does she want to be forgotten in the 1990s.

Access to this type of normally private commentary is an inestimable boon to the social historian. The physical, intellectual, and emotional work of making a life for oneself, one's family, and one's community are movingly laid out in details that few public documents preserve. Ruby's letters ultimately supply a salutary

382 The Canadian Historical Review

reminder of the past's, indeed our parents,' right to tell their own story in their own way. If we listen closely to Ruby and her contemporaries, we will learn that the generation of the 1950s represents more than mere creators of today's self-absorbed boomers.

veronica strong-boag University of British Columbia

Canadian Papers in Rural History, vol. 10. Edited by donald j. aken-son. Gananoque: Langdale Press 1996. \$49.50

This is the tenth and final volume of Donald Akenson's Canadian Papers in Rural History. In these volumes, Akenson has provided a forum for historians of the countryside to publish their works and, as he noted in the first volume, explore the lives of people who shaped this country while 'working the ground.' It seems appropriate, then, to comment on the history produced by this series. In this particular volume, with twelve virtually unrelated essays, exclusion should not be construed as commentary.

Volume 10 finds us in well-known territory, as well as on some less frequently trod ground. On the latter front, I very much enjoyed Roxanne Dunbar-Ortiz's piece on the antinomies of the 'Okies' from Oklahoma. She reflects on the wide range of political positions she has witnessed in her family's past three generations, from voting for Eugene Debs to voting for Ronald Reagan; from the Steinbeck-like trek that these Americans took across dust-bowl America to the neo-con suburbs of Los Angeles, a place (or more accurately a space and a history) that was variously socialist, exceptionalist, imperialist, and white supremacist. She situates this place in the history of the Ulster Scots who emigrated to both England and America. These 'foot soldiers of empire,' as she calls them, represent an underplayed element of the frontier: the broader bases of rugged individualism, rooted here in both early modern and modern colonialisms. Similarly, Clint Evans's discussion of 'weeds [as] cultural artefacts' is a fascinating discussion of a place where environmental history properly meets both people and nature. His overview of the role of the state, cultural transfer, and 'improvement' neatly illustrates how weeds, too, became the objects of conquest for the empires of European Christendom. R.W. Sandwell's innovative discussion of 'peasants on the [British Columbia] coast' strives for an application of Joan Scott's insights on the role of statistics in the construction of gender, and particularly the construction of 'woman.' Sandwell argues that the couplet urban/rural was constructed in a manner similar to that of man/woman. In effect, she maintains that there are correspondences in the way state-created statistics organized, and therefore authorized, the discursive production of 'rural.' Then, searching for moments outside that dominant framework, she

attempts to construct a kind of counter-history. This is a potentially important argument. The manner by which the rural was categorized and defined in nineteenth-century state documents is a significant avenue for research, because such constructions not only had important historical effects but continue to have equally important implications for historians' practice. At the same time, I was unsure of some of the evidence, particularly of lives lived outside that dominant framework. I would want to see more evidence of what lay outside that text.

Other essays take us into more familiar territory. William Marr, for example, offers us more data on farm production in mid-nineteenth-century Ontario. Disaggregating wheat figures from the 1851 census of Canada West by farm size and number of years under the plough, he finds that, despite significant variation, crop structure was 'very similar over farm sizes and levels of agricultural development' (202). From Marr's brief examination of census figures in one year, we move to Robert MacKinnon's remarkable overview of a century of Nova Scotian agriculture (1851-1951). MacKinnon's history lacks the kind of theoretical and political edge one might like to see in such a long-term assessment. Yet, at the same time, I was dazzled by the impressive coverage and the range of evidence offered. Still, having lived in Nova Scotia, I was left to wonder why, in the province that in the 1930s produced slightly less than half of the entire nation's apples, it is hard to find an apple not grown in Oregon, New Zealand, or British Columbia. A long-term view of agriculture in Nova Scotia could have better illuminated the broader bases of such radical changes. Finally, Jack Little's discussion of the folk poetry of 'Oscar Dhu' (the pen name of Angus MacKay) is a rich piece that highlights many of the pressures that older cultural forms experience in new contexts. I am often suspicious of arguments rooted in 'isolated' communities which invoke notions of 'traditional culture,' though Little makes a strong case for MacKay's work as representative of a 'culture in transition' and allows his subject a clear basis for such a reference.

Because this is the final volume of the CPRH, the series as a whole requires some comment. Elsewhere I have remarked, as have others, that CPRH's most notable feature is its variety, or, less generously, its eclecticism. Some of this variety is related to quality. A number of very important contributions to rural Canadian historiography have been published here. In particular, I am thinking of the contributions of Marvin McNinnis, and Donald Akenson's own piece on the Irish in Ontario. But, for the sake of comparison, remember that in half the time it took to publish CPRH's ten volumes, the *Canadian Historical Review* has published at least three major rural articles - by Catherine Desbarats, Gérard Bouchard, and Rusty Bittermann, Robert MacKinnon, and Graeme Wynn. *Labour/Le Travail*, too, is publishing noteworthy rural

pieces. CPRH has also published a number of solid pieces which will exert some influence. But there have been a remarkable number of weak articles, and many notable absences – in particular, by Quebec scholars. More significantly, far too much of this literature has missed entirely many of the major trends in rural social history as practised elsewhere. The biggest absence, however, is one of vision, of just what rural history is. Here it is not clear how exactly to apportion 'blame,' but one cannot help but look at volume 10 and wonder whether anyone knows what rural history is in Canada today, what its major issues might be, or where it might be going.

At the Montreal meeting of the Canadian Historical Association, a session on the 'new rural history' made it abundantly clear that there is no new rural history in Canada, unless we mean what us historians meant twenty years ago, and that there exists not even a loose consensus on what might be the major issues, if one were to develop. Can we blame this indecisiveness on the CPRH? No, of course, not. But CPRH does strike me as a missed opportunity, and an unfortunate one. In his preface to this volume, Akenson remarks that other journals are now picking up the slack, and rural history is now part of the Canadian historical mainstream. That is true, but is it enough? Akenson's endeavour has been to focus our attention on the rural majority, and that he has done. But we are no closer to understanding what is Canadian or rural about Canadian rural history. If we are going to stake a great deal on studying 'the rural majority,' then we owe it to ourselves to do so in such a way as to understand our mission clearly and not simply to spin 'rural' yarns. We have spent a great deal of time – and this goes beyond the CPRH – describing a lot of people and places that were, apparently, rural, without ever questioning that term. Few articles have advanced any such program, much less even outlined a vision of the field. Indeed, many of the articles in CPRH, including several in this final volume, have only the slightest connection to a patently obvious rurality; in far too many articles, the major criteria for rural seems to be 'not urban.' This is but one issue Canadian rural historians might tackle, and there are many more. Akenson says it is time to declare victory. This reviewer thinks not yet.

daniel samson Memorial University of Newfoundland

Winners: 150 Years of the Peterborough Exhibition. elwood h. jones. Peterborough: Peterborough Agricultural Society 1995. Pp. ix, 262, illus. \$30.00

Books about agricultural exhibitions often resemble agricultural exhibitions. The same long lists of winners' names are to be found, paying tribute to the noble livestock, mammoth roots, plump grains, elaborate embroidery, tasty preserves, and all the other productions

of town and country. They convey a great many facts, but in relative isolation: it is never quite clear what these animals and products stand for, or how accurately they represent the countryside. The typography, like some of the animals, is wont to stray from its usual confines. Such books are often produced by agricultural societies as an act of reverence, just as the exhibition itself is an act of reverence towards the community. Such a book is Elwood H. Jones's history of the Peterborough Exhibition, which was commissioned by the Peterborough Agricultural Society with the support of private sponsors. The society gave him a free hand, asking only for a history that 'the general public would find attractive and amusing.'

Perusing the society's records for the last half century and old newspapers for the century before that, Jones chronicles the day-to-day and year-to-year life of Peterborough's exhibition, from its origins in cattle and fancy fairs to its continuing existence as one of Ontario's favourite annual shows. He records the administrative history of the fair: the decisions about where to stage it, which buildings to erect, and the stratagems used to stave off an always imminent financial disaster. He also describes the visitor's experience of the fair, and loses himself in descriptions of its rich material life. The stock at the fair and the oddities to be found on the grounds are all affectionately described: from plough matches and horse races to rodeos and demolition derbies; from beautiful baby to dairy princess competitions; from Pawnees on bicycles ('black dodgers') and a 'Congress of Fat Ladies' to the modern midway that highbrow Robertson Davies dismissed as 'common.'

This book is emphatically a work of local history that is rescued from antiquarianism because, as Jones remarks, 'Peterborough was nearly always somehow Ontario's and Canada's average community.' It is also an institutional history that pays only token attention to such external influences as the rise of international exhibitions or the changing economic basis of the Peterborough community. Professional historians may be disappointed by the lack of context and of rigorous analysis. Most statements about the meaning of the fair are taken at face value. Terms like 'fair' are not adequately defined, while repetition makes it difficult to follow chronological developments. But a rigorously analytical and intellectual history of the fair would hardly do justice to it. Early organizers tried to make exhibitions intellectual, but financial considerations forced them to cater to popular taste by incorporating eclectic amusements. *Winners not only* describes but perpetuates within itself the complex, continuing dialogue between popular and professional culture. Jones's book successfully conveys both the benefits and the shortcomings of the conjunction of the popular, professional, and economic interests that resulted in the Peterborough fair. It also provides considerable insight into Ontario culture in the past and the present.

e.a. heaman Imperial College, London, England

Divergent Paths: How Culture and Institutions Have Shaped North American Growth. marc egnal. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press 1996. Pp. xvi, 300, \$26.95

This is a daring work that tackles the daunting task of analysing the reasons for economic growth since 1750 in three major regions in two countries: Quebec and both the American Northeast and South. Today, few historians attempt to study economic growth, and scholars in any field rarely attempt regional comparisons among countries. From his specialized base of early America, Professor Egnal has presented an important comparative challenge to other scholars.

Egnal sets out to show that culture (deep-seated beliefs or ideologies) and institutions (public and private) largely determined the path of growth in these regions. In 1750, residents in Quebec and in regions from Pennsylvania to Massachusetts and from Maryland to Georgia (including slaves) experienced similar material standards of wealth. Although the disparities in income in the South were great, the 'household economy' was delivering about 0.5 per cent economic growth per year.

Between 1750 and 1850, the North pulled far ahead of the other regions, and the divergent paths persisted until about 1940. The North industrialized, whereas the South did not. (After 1850 the Midwest, though not Ontario, is included with the North.) Although English-speaking Quebec followed the North's path, if more slowly, French Quebec largely failed to do so. Because of the differences in religion, mobility, education, entrepreneurial spirit, and labour and tenure relations already largely in place by 1750, the North forged ahead while the others lagged. The aggressive drive for money in the North was in contrast to the power of tradition in the others.

After about 1940 the paths in all three areas converged substantially, as measured by income. In the North, industrialization slowed as businessmen became complacent, while in the South new enterprises appeared. The Quiet Revolution brought French-speaking Quebecers improved standards along with control. Since 1975, paths have diverged somewhat again. The Northeast and some southern states gained, while Quebec's growth slowed, and other parts of the South still languished. The major region of mass production, the Midwest, slipped further.

I offer the following criticisms of this book. First, conditions, natural and social, are largely ignored in favour of values and organization. But conditions are just as important. Initially, the strong urge for making money, not tradition, created the fur trade in New France and the tobacco trade from the Chesapeake. These most

commercial of commodities set a pattern that inhibited development. Merchants on the other side of the Atlantic organized trade in both goods. By contrast, merchants in northern cities (after 1750 Baltimore included) were relatively autonomous actors, setting the stage for northern industrial development based on British antecedents.

Second, he separates French-speaking Quebec from English-speaking Quebec (and mostly ignores Ontario). This division denies that Quebec focused on its major urban centres as a region. Montreal and Quebec City could hardly be totally separate from rural Québécois districts. It is not hard to agree that many (but not all) parts of the northern United States were economically more advanced in the nineteenth century. But he has probably understated the degree of economic development among the Québécois. The work of Jean-Claude Robert, Serge Courville, and associates, who are more positive about development, are played down. Clerical injunctions warning the Québécois to shun Yankee extravagances may well have been issued because the people were tempted by them. Indeed, how could the Québécois have engineered the Quiet Revolution?

Third, the 'household economy' is, I believe, overstated. At least some northern farmers and millers were as keen to invest and take risks as urban merchants. Besides, few people today are serious, risk-taking capitalists. Egnal's view creates the awkward matter of trying to define the time of capitalism's emergence.

Fourth, government's role is downplayed, at least since 1940. Without question, regional incomes in both the United States and Canada have converged because of personal and intergovernmental transfers. Also, many places in the South - and West, but not the Midwest - have done better because of federal military spending, a point mentioned only in passing. Incomes in Maryland and Virginia have risen, as well-paid government workers (and lobbyists) took up residence in the suburbs beyond the District of Columbia, where incomes of the poor have fallen.

Fifth, in Egnal's most recent period, the Northeast, notably Connecticut and New Jersey, improved less because of high technology than because of the residency of highly paid stockbrokers and other financiers whose share of the income pie has skyrocketed even more than that of the skilled workers who have created the information highway.

Sixth, in his concluding note, Egnal advocates more 'quality education' as the key to regional economic growth through the information highway. Unfortunately, this advice has become the tired nostrum of the 1990s. The successful entrepreneurs past and present he discusses were dropouts.

Seventh, in the preface, Egnal asserts that Japan has been a success story without an abundance of resources. It succeeded

because of 'traditions that foster cooperation, loyalty, and hard work.' Cooperation and loyalty were hardly the virtues he found as the basis of economic development in the North after 1750, where the opposite – individualistic entrepreneurialism – has been the key.

This richly documented and very interesting book deserves a great deal of attention and should be a focus of critical debate.

James Lemon University of Toronto

Ni avec eux ni sans eux: Le Québec et les États-Unis. yvan lamonde. Quebec: Nuit Blanche Editeur 1996. Pp. 128. \$20.95

Yankee go Home? Canadians and Anti-Americanism. j.l. granatstein. Toronto: HarperCollins 1996. Pp. 320, \$28.00

A few days after the World Trade Organization in a preliminary ruling found Canada's excise tax on revenues from so-called split-run magazines to be in violation of international trade law, the Toronto Globe and Mail quoted an unidentified Canadian trade official: 'The u.s. negotiators' attitude is just classic nineteenth century white man's burden – they've got to bring us their ways and their language. They'll only be happy when we have drive-by shootings or something.'

That statement underlines how strong – and perhaps irrational – sentiment in Canada has been historically on the crossborder relationship. The statement also reveals what Jack Granatstein observes, that Canadian anti-Americanism is usually benign. The two volumes reviewed here provide us with in-depth analyses of the historical evolution of those perspectives, not all of which have, in fact, been anti-American in nature.

These are very different studies, united only by a common interest in relations between Canada/Canadians and the United States, as well as by a desire by both authors to provide personal reflection on their own experiences. Indeed, Lamonde's study ends with a brief autobiographical chapter, and Granatstein's is replete with personal asides. Yet they remain very different in scope and orientation.

Lamonde provides a brief overview of the largely political and intellectual impact of the presence of the United States on Quebec thought since the late eighteenth century. He draws on the extant secondary literature covering such aspects as the views of American republicanism by Louis-Joseph Papineau in the 1830s through the resurgence of French-Canadian nationalism with *L'Action française* and Lionel Groulx in the 1920s and André Laurendeau in the 1940s. As with Granatstein's volume, Lamonde is concerned with elite thought, although he does note that the majority of the French-Canadian population saw its future in the nineteenth and early

twentieth centuries in more practical terms than the élites; the former expressed their views by migrating to American mill towns in the Northeast. For intellectual and political élites, as the title of the volume suggests, there was ambivalence in French-Canadian thought, a tension between liberals, who were drawn to the American political example, and conservatives, who were troubled by the orientation of American religion and the materialism of American culture. At the same time, as Lamonde notes, it was a French emigrant in the mid-nineteenth century in the United States, François Edmé Rameau de Saint-Père, who most vigorously advanced the critique of the United States for its adherence to the 'cult of money.' That strong Catholic nationalism was also embodied in the anti-English and anti-American thought of Lionel Groulx in the twentieth century, even if his disciple André Laurendeau was more inclined to accept the realities of Quebec's geographic location in North America. On balance, what has characterized French-Canadian thought has been the sense that they were not French, British, or American, but, as Lamonde cites Robert Charlebois in 1975, 'almost American.'

Granatstein's volume is provocative intellectually, well researched in the secondary literature and in Canadian and us archival collections, and engagingly written. The book will be widely read and cited for the foreseeable future as the definitive historical account of Canadian anti-Americanism, which, he rightly notes, is the oldest variant of anti-Americanism in the world. The study is comprehensive, ranging from a relatively short account of the United Empire Loyalists through the late nineteenth-century debates over annexation and reciprocity. The bulk of the book deals with the twentieth century, and the majority of that with the years after 1945. There are excellent chapters on the Second World War and the Cold War; the emergence of strong Canadian economic nationalism; the impact of the Vietnam War, including the impact of American academic migration to Canada in the 1960s and 1970s; an insightful discussion of Canadian literature; and a closing section on the free trade debate. Comprehensive as the volume is, there remains room for additional work. The author is most comfortable and effective in his analysis of political, military/diplomatic, and economic relations and with a focus on élite thought pertaining to those issues. There needs to be a good deal more analysis of what 'American' means before one can effectively dissect anti-Americanism. Even when the author turns to culture more broadly, he analyses only élite and not popular culture. This is not a limitation, but it does provide opportunity for further study. So does the author's perspective. His critique of anti-Americanism is bound to evoke a strong reaction.

The volume is provocative and will make some readers genuinely angry. It will also prompt further reflection of the depth of passion

in Canadian circles on the issues addressed. Granatstein indicates that he began the volume as an anti-American and changed his mind in the course of the research and writing. What appears to have caused this intellectual transformation was his growing conviction that anti-American sentiments in Canadian society had been exploited historically by business, political, and cultural groups for their own ends, and the study documents such exploitation historically, from John A. Macdonald's opposition to reciprocity in 1891 to the free trade debate a century later. For the author, anti-Americanism is dead in Canada, save for a few misguided intellectuals, academics, and those self-interested employees of Canadian cultural industries. Anti-Americanism is seen to derive from little more than 'envy of the greatness and wealth of the U.S. and discomfort at the excesses of American life.' Anti-Americanism was an 'unworthy attitude, a barren, soul-destroying conceit that Canadians employed to explain to themselves their slower growth and lesser power.' Since Canadians 'are Americans in all but name,' it would be difficult to avoid the conclusion that anti-Americanism must have derived from some perverse form of self-loathing on the part of Canadians over the past two hundred years.

stephen j. randall University of Calgary

Sir Wilfrid Laurier and the Romance of Canada. laurier l. lapierre. Toronto: Stoddart 1996. Pp. 514, illus. \$35.00 cloth, \$24.95 paper

Deux interrogations principales surgissent à la lecture de cette nouvelle biographie de sir Wilfrid Laurier, cet immense personnage politique qui dirigea le Canada de 1896 à 1911. La première touche au type d'œuvre qu'a voulu écrire l'auteur, ce qui soulève plusieurs sous-questions. L'historien-journaliste Laurier L. LaPierre a-t-il désiré produire une biographie historique avec ses exigences scientifiques et méthodologiques? Une biographie vulgarisée dédiée au grand public? Un écrit hybride liant biographie vulgarisée au roman historique avec sa belle part de liberté et d'imaginaire? Force m'est d'admettre, finalement, que LaPierre a plutôt opté pour la troisième catégorie, comme il le laisse sous-entendre. Il souligne, en effet, à la page xiv, qu'il s'est résolu à explorer le « personal times » de Laurier, « the intimacy of his soul » et que, pour ce faire, « [he] must read between the lines to reconstruct the main relationships, events, circumstances, and moments that marked his life ». La deuxième interrogation concerne l'objectif fondamental de ce livre. L'historien LaPierre a-t-il vraiment souhaité brosse, avec toutes les nuances et les exigences qu'impose son métier, le portrait le plus juste possible de Laurier? Ou, parce que trop chevillé à son œuvre hybride et trop traumatisé par l'état lamentable actuel de l'unité canadienne, a-t-il cherché, plutôt, à faire étalage de la gloire de

Laurier auprès de laquelle, espérait-il, les Canadiens pourraient puiser l'inspiration qui leur permettrait de mieux affronter leur difficile avenir? Sans hésiter, j'estime que l'auteur a allègrement embrassé la deuxième voie, comme le suggère l'épilogue de son livre. De ces choix émane une œuvre vivante, merveilleusement écrite, et attrayante dans sa facture physique, qui mérite considération. Mais elle ne peut toutefois pas satisfaire la communauté scientifique historique.

LaPierre présente en seize chapitres l'ensemble de la vie privée et de la carrière publique de Laurier dans plusieurs de leurs phases et méandres divers. Mais le plan de l'ouvrage, plutôt déséquilibré, repose sur une chronologie douteuse (des chapitres, par exemple, regroupent les années 1896-8, 1898-1905) et ne rend pas toujours justice à l'œuvre même de Laurier. Soulignons seulement que ses actions et celles de son gouvernement entre 1896 et 1911 n'occupent que 111 pages sur 384 et sont rassemblées dans quatre chapitres. L'auteur aura beau rappeler qu'il désirait aller au-delà des actions politiques de Laurier pour rejoindre son âme et sa vie privée, cette explication ne suffit pas à justifier ce déséquilibre et ce, d'autant moins qu'il ne parvient pas réellement à atteindre cet objectif. En effet, le lecteur ne pénètre pas profondément dans le jardin sacré de Laurier. J'ajouterais même que la plus grande bénéficiaire de cette ambition de l'auteur reste Zoé Lafontaine, la femme de Laurier, dont on connaît désormais mieux l'intimité et le rôle auprès de son mari tel que l'expriment entre autres les pages 286 et 288.

Au-delà du plan, il y a les informations et les interprétations. Ensemble, elles dégagent de Laurier et de son œuvre un portrait insuffisant, aux contours imprécis voire tronqués, fondé sur des analyses et des explications sommaires marquées par l'absence d'esprit critique. En bref, l'ouvrage de LaPierre, plutôt descriptif, n'apporte vraiment rien d'original, ne contribue pas à l'avancement des connaissances sur Laurier, ne renouvelle aucune problématique et, en raison d'une carence totale dans l'appareillage technique, peut créer une suspicion face aux informations présentées. Certes, à part quelques exceptions (entre autres, p. 151, il faut lire 29 juin 1887 ; p. 183, l'abolition du français et des écoles séparées au Manitoba en 1890 s'est concrétisée dans deux lois différentes ; p. 267, Lomer Gouin devint premier ministre du Québec en 1905 ; p. 330, Henri Bourassa fit élire dix-sept de ses partisans à titre de député en 1911), je n'ai pas noté d'erreurs factuelles dans ce livre: l'auteur a travaillé minutieusement dans ses sources. Certes aussi, outre les principaux faits de la vie de Laurier, les présentations de son caractère, de son romantisme, de son réseau de sociabilité, de sa conception générale du Canada, de l'unité nationale et des liens avec l'Empire britannique sont esquissées bien que sans éclairage nouveau. Pour ces points positifs, il faut en savoir gré à l'auteur.

Mais plusieurs des grands moments de la vie publique de Laurier

et la plupart des problèmes auxquels il a été confronté à des moments-clés de sa carrière souffrent des lacunes énumérées ci-haut. À titre d'exemples, je pense à son opposition à la Confédération puis à son ralliement, à ses positions et stratégies sur les écoles du Manitoba entre 1890 et 1897, sur la guerre des Boers entre 1899 et 1902, sur la mise en place du transcontinental à partir de 1903, sur les écoles séparées et la protection du français au moment de la création de l'Alberta et de la Saskatchewan en 1905. Je pense aussi au développement de l'Ouest, l'une des politiques majeures de son gouvernement, aux difficultés rencontrées lors des années 1906-8 assombries par les scandales, à son incapacité, à la longue, à comprendre la société qu'il avait contribué à bâtir, à ses rapports difficiles au monde ouvrier, à l'évolution plutôt conservatrice de son libéralisme, ce qui aurait permis de mieux saisir les réactions de ses collègues canadiens-anglais en 1916-17. Je ne peux passer sous silence que dans plusieurs de ces cas, l'auteur épouse à tel point la position de Laurier qu'il en oublie son rôle critique d'historien. Et gare à ceux qui risquent de contrarier les projets de l'idole. Comme Henri Bourassa, par exemple: le portrait que l'auteur trace du fondateur du Devoir et de son nationalisme frise la caricature (306-8, 323-4, 340). À la décharge de LaPierre, je souligne à nouveau qu'il dit avoir voulu attribuer aux sujets politiques un statut secondaire dans sa biographie. Mais pourquoi traiter ces sujets de la sorte quand ils sont au cœur de ce qui a propulsé Laurier dans l'histoire même de son pays? Quand ils sont le creuset où l'auteur puise lui-même ses leçons pour aujourd'hui? Ne méritent-ils pas un examen approprié à leur importance? Je le crois, et d'autant plus que la recherche en vue de mieux cerner l'intimité de Laurier, si ambitionnée par l'auteur, n'a pas porté ses fruits.

Je me permets d'ajouter en terminant que LaPierre a raison de croire que Laurier peut, par sa pensée et son œuvre, inspirer les Canadiens d'aujourd'hui à mieux définir leur pays. Mais j'estime que c'est par la recherche constante de la vérité historique que l'historien contribuera le mieux à rendre encore plus pertinente de nos jours l'œuvre de Wilfrid Laurier.

réal bélanger Université Laval

Lord Strathcona: A Biography of Donald Alexander Smith. donna mcdonald. Toronto: Dundurn Press 1996. Pp. 600, illus. \$34.99

The life of Donald Smith has long fascinated and also frustrated prospective biographers. Smith was one of those rare individuals who apparently did not seek the limelight, but became the central figure in several crucial events in Canadian history. After spending the first half of his long life in distinguished but relatively obscure service with the Hudson's Bay Company in Labrador, he burst on

the Canadian political scene as an emissary of the federal government and agent of the company who refused to defuse the crisis of the 1869 Red River resistance. A few years later his role in the Pacific Scandal sealed the fate of Sir John A. Macdonald's government. As a result, his name had to be withheld when the syndicate of which he was a member negotiated to build the Canadian Pacific Railway, but in 1885 Smith was the central figure in what is perhaps Canada's best-known photograph – the driving of the last spike of the Canadian Pacific Railway. He gained further notoriety during the South African War when he financed the equipping and transportation of élite Canadian cavalry troops.

Smith made much of his money promoting American railroads, but he became an ardent supporter of British imperialism. In later life he became a generous philanthropist who often suggested that his gifts remain anonymous, but who also kept records so detailed that the biographer was able to compile an appendix of twenty pages of fine print identifying his various benefactions and bequests.

This biography offers a well-documented and convincing portrait of a man and his times. Readers can identify with Donald Smith, later Lord Strathcona, his controversial marriage, personal traits, foibles, ambitions, and frustrations. There is colour and life in the story of this charmed, seemingly magical life. McDonald argues that Smith's career 'closely mirrors Canada's passage to nationhood,' suggesting that he played 'a significant and sometimes decisive role in the progress from colonial dependency to full nationhood' (7). The evidence provided in support of that argument is persuasive, and the manner of presentation is both interesting and colourful.

This biography is based on extensive research in several large and important collections of private, company, and government papers. The most notable are the records of the Hudson's Bay Company, the J.J. Hill Papers, the letter-books of William C. Van Horne, and the papers of numerous Canadian and British politicians. Remarkably, the vast collection of Canadian Pacific Railway records, other than the Van Horne letter-books, was apparently not used, nor were the large collections of federal government railway and canal records, or the huge Canadian National Railways collection available at the National Archives of Canada listed in the bibliography. The Gaspard Farrer Papers, used extensively by Heather Gilbert in her biography of George Stephen, Donald Smith's cousin and close business associate, are also missing from the bibliography. The bibliography and the narrative indicate that McDonald also made good use of the work of other historians who did use these collections.

Smith was involved in numerous controversial issues that have been interpreted quite differently by other authors. McDonald offers her own versions of many of these events, but without references to the differing interpretations in the secondary literature. Perhaps the publisher, in its zeal for economy, persuaded her to delete most

footnote references to secondary sources. Unfortunately, the references to primary sources that remain often do not provide the necessary information to show why she opted for one rather than another interpretation. She seems to accept some very dubious interpretations offered by pop historians while ignoring or contradicting others offered by established scholars.

The biography of any entrepreneur inevitably involves a discussion of complex financial transactions. McDonald's handling of Smith's financial transactions is, on the one hand, very clear and concise. Specific transactions, specific sums, and specific securities are clearly identified. But the manner in which this is done is reminiscent of a description of a circus clown juggling too many balloons. Before the reader can fully grasp the significance of one specific transaction, it sinks out of sight and another looms into view.

There are three specific problems in the discussion of financial transactions in this biography. First, the author does not explain the difference between the par value, the market value, and whatever Smith actually paid for particular securities bought, pledged, or sold in various transactions. Second, there is no attempt to distinguish clearly between cash and securities of, at best, uncertain value offered in various efforts to save the Canadian Pacific Railway. Third, the author provides no reliable information to show how many Canadian Pacific Railway stocks and bonds syndicate members owned or controlled at various times, what they actually paid for them, or the amount for which they sold those stock and bonds. McDonald indicates that Lady Macdonald, acting on the advice of George Stephen, sold her deceased husband's Canadian Pacific Railway shares too early, thereby forgoing a substantial profit. Stephen and Smith apparently did the same: Their complaint that they would have been better off if they had never become involved with the Canadian Pacific Railway is repeated in this biography without further comment or analysis (387), as is Smith's apparently flippant remark, to Lady Aberdeen over cocktails that the Saint Paul, Minneapolis and Manitoba Railway paid a dividend of more than 80 per cent in one year and more than 170 per cent in another. That clearly leaves the impression that the cousins invested much of the money they had made in the United States in the Canadian Pacific Railway, from which they derived little or no benefit. If true, they must have sold their cpr stock in the early 1890s, before it began its phenomenal rise in value, paying double-digit dividends all the while. And if, indeed, they lost confidence in Canada and the Canadian Pacific Railway in the 1890s, the entire interpretation of Smith's later career as a mirror of Canada's passage to nationhood must be questioned, unless it is shown that he invested in other, even more lucrative Canadian ventures. Apparently neither Smith nor Stephen held significant numbers of cpr shares at the time of their deaths.

There are also ambiguities about the vulnerability of various cpr creditors. The most important of these was the Bank of Montreal, and there are numerous suggestions that the financial collapse of the cpr would inevitably result in the ruin of all its creditors. Elsewhere, however, it is suggested that in the event of a crash only the Bank of Toronto and the Bank of Montreal would survive (323). No explanation is offered regarding the manner in which those banks had apparently protected themselves.

In short, those who want to understand, rather than marvel at, the financial jugglers' slight of hand will find this work disappointing. They will, however, gain much knowledge and understanding of the life, times, personality, and character of one of Canada's most distinguished businessmen from this colourful, carefully documented, and well-written biography.

t.d. regehr University of Calgary

Propaganda and Censorship during Canada's Great War. jeffrey a. keshen. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press 1996. Pp. xviii, 334, illus. \$29.95

Jeffrey Keshen is interested in the truth about the Canadian state's program of untruth, censorship, and propaganda during the Great War. He notes by way of introduction that the war's historiography on the home front does not contain a systematic examination of the state's campaign of censorship and propaganda and its effects during and after the conflagration. Keshen frames his wide-ranging study as an investigation of the character, effectiveness, and impact of 'information management' in shaping the experience and meaning of the Great War for Canadians who remained by the home fires.

This quest has led Keshen to examine how the liberal state, in a most illiberal manner, suppressed accurate reports of the horror and ineptitude so typical of the war. And, recognizing propaganda as the natural ally of censorship, he has investigated how the state contrived, at the behest of Lieutenant-Colonel Ernest J. Chambers, Canada's chief press censor, to disseminate mostly deceitful reports about the war and the forward march of Canada's heroic armed forces. These reports were circulated through newspapers, posters, sermons, speeches, newsreels, and mostly American movie reels. Chambers's reach extended to the 1000 books published from 1914 to 1918 about the war; none ventured realistic accounts of front-line slaughter.

Indeed, Chambers's shadow hangs over the entire effort of suppression and deception. As chief press censor, a position created by order-in-council in June 1915, Chambers was given authority, subject to the approval of the secretary of state, to prohibit any

report or commentary that might, in his view, hinder the successful prosecution of the war. As well, Chambers had and used the power to censor mail and to eavesdrop on telephone conversations. He encountered little opposition. The intervention of the state in the life of Canada's mass media triggered few objections. Chambers's work in Canada was aided and abetted by the imaginative initiatives of Max Aitken as Canada's official 'eye-witness' to front-line combat, and later in his capacity as director of the Canadian War Records Office in London.

The moral core of Keshen's narrative takes shape on the terrain of necessity. Though he acknowledges that wartime propaganda and censorship were 'among the most brazen affronts to democracy in the country's history,' still, the 'necessity of stamping out information jeopardizing national security or morale' (109) justified the state's campaign. Of course, deception had its costs. Soldiers, victimized by war, returned home to uncomprehending family and friends incapable of understanding the insidious effects of the brutality of war. Keshen argues that similar, though less damaging, collective delusions are reflected in the romantic images of duty, sacrifice, and bravery that dominate the country's collective memory of the war.

Though a vigilant copy editor would have remedied the author's tendency to prolixity, this is a sound book, well researched and informative. Yet Keshen's assessment of Canada's wartime program of misinformation and suppression remains unsatisfying. The Great War, the first total war waged under democratic conditions, triggered a widespread crisis of citizenship that deepened as the carnage was prolonged. The relentless costs of a war of attrition drove participants to impose unprecedented demands for discipline and sacrifice on their citizenry. Propaganda and censorship became essential tools of the state. In Canada, a narrative of solidarity and sacrifice was employed to justify a citizenship of obligation and Anglo-conformity. Yet, ironically, this communitarian vision and the experience of the war also evoked images of a society framed in a citizenship of social equality reaching across gender, class, and ethnicity.

However, Keshen touches on these themes only implicitly, leaving the relationship between censorship, propaganda, and citizenship on the one hand and fundamental moral and political questions at the heart of citizenship on the other largely unconsidered. This silence obscures the profoundly conservative and ideological character of the state's campaign. Similarly, Keshen's handling of the legacy of the war as collective memory is problematic. The struggle to shape popular views of citizenship during wartime was only a prologue to an assiduous postwar campaign to shape the ideological legacy of the war. In 1914 Canadians went to war for empire; in 1919, 60,000 Canadian dead

Book Reviews 397

were commemorated as a sacrifice to an imagined nation. Imagined because, as Benedict Anderson has said of the individuals who compose any nation, only 'in the minds of each lives the image of their communion.'¹ The story of the struggle to shape this image, and the character of citizenship and nationhood it embodied, is only partially disclosed in the pages of Propaganda and Censorship.
tom mitchell Brandon University

¹Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso 1983), p. 16.

The Gallant Cause: Canadians in the Spanish Civil War, 1936-1939. mark zuehlke. Vancouver: Whitecap Books 1996. Pp. 296, illus. \$29.95

In November 1996 a dozen veterans left for Spain to participate in the sixtieth anniversary celebrations to mark the establishment of the International Brigades. Accompanied by friends and relatives, the veterans, who were mostly in their eighties, made perhaps their last trip to Spain, where sixty years before they had volunteered to defend the Republican government against the insurgent military forces led by General Francisco Franco. They went to Spain in 1936-7 to fight against fascism, and their participation in this conflict as members of the Mackenzie-Papineau Battalion contributed to the heroic legends and myths of the International Brigades. The Spanish Civil War and the role of the International Brigades continue to stir deep emotions and passionate debates among surviving veterans and their supporters, including many historians interested in the events leading to the outbreak of the Second World War.

Mark Zuehlke was inspired to write this popular history about Canadians in the Spanish Civil War while visiting the monument to the Mackenzie-Papineau Battalion in Toronto. He states in the introduction that this is 'a work of literary non-fiction' and presents the story from 'the limited point of view of the participants.' He attempts to place the reader 'inside the minds of the participants who lived the events'; however, he cautions that 'no literary licence is taken or assumed.' The author allows the participants to tell their own story and claims that he deliberately withheld his own opinions and commentary on their motives and experiences.

The author builds his story around the experiences of individual volunteers. The first few Canadians made their way to Spain shortly after the attempted military uprising and took part in the early battles that prevented a rapid victory by the Franco forces. By December 1936 the first units of the International Brigades were formed. Canadians began to arrive in small groups and fought in the British and American battalions. Other Canadians - for example, Dr Norman Bethune - assisted the Republican side in medical units. By the summer of 1937 there were enough volunteers to form the Mackenzie-Papineau Battalion. More than 1500 volunteers from Canada served in the 'MacPaps' and other battalions of the International Brigades.

To give credit where it is due, the Communist Party of Canada was directly involved in all aspects of the volunteer movement to Spain. The recruitment and transportation of volunteers was administered by the cpc. The Canadian federal government passed the Foreign Enlistment Act in 1937 to prevent Canadian volunteers from travelling to Spain. This act reduced and eventually limited the number of volunteers. Among those who left for Spain, the large

Book Reviews 399

majority were cpc members, and many of them were recent members who volunteered to test the sincerity of their political convictions. The author traces their labour activism during the Depression in Canada, their decision to volunteer, and the trip to Spain. Their experiences in Spain as members of the International Brigades hardened and deepened their political faith, and there were many casualties among their numbers. But other volunteers failed the test in the face of modern warfare, and the author describes the resulting discipline problems, including attempts to desert. His research leads him to the conclusion that at least one Canadian deserter was executed by the International Brigades. These more controversial aspects of the conflict, including the direct involvement of the international Communist movement, are rarely mentioned and discussed in popular histories of the International Brigades. At the end of 1938, the brigades were withdrawn in the vain hope that the German and Italian units would also be withdrawn from the Franco side. A few hundred survivors, including prisoners of war, returned in 1939, and the MacPap story was soon overshadowed by the outbreak of the Second World War.

Although the author succeeds in presenting an interesting story, his literary style is at times florid and ornate. Historians will be disappointed that he did not include footnotes to historical information. Although there is a bibliography of primary and secondary sources, the absence of notes is perhaps the main weakness of *The Gallant Cause*. One of its great strengths is the selection of interesting photographs.

This episode in Canadian military history is not unique. Canadian volunteers fought in many foreign wars: on both sides in the American Civil War, with the Papal Zouaves in Italy in the 1860s, with the Haller Army in Poland in 1919, with the Israeli military in the War for Independence, and with the United States armed forces during the Vietnamese conflict. These military contributions by individuals, ethnocultural groups, and voluntary organizations are rarely included in Canadian history texts. In *The Gallant Cause*, Zuehlke has succeeded in reawakening interest in a relatively unknown part of Canadian history and in evoking some of the events and political passions that dominated the lives of many Canadians in the 1930s.

myron momryk National Archives of Canada

The Diplomacy of Prudence: Canada and Israel, 1948–1958.
zachariah kay. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1997. Pp. xiv, 135. \$44.95

This book is a continuation of earlier work conducted by Professor Kay on Canada and the Palestine Question. Indeed, he and Anne Trowel Hillmer were the pioneers in examining the roots of Canadian policy in the Middle East. His previous work, *Canada &*

Palestine: The Politics of Non-Commitment, told the story up to mid-January 1949 and Canada's de jure recognition of the State of Israel. The current book adds fresh material to the story of that recognition, and extends the discussion of Canadian-Israeli relations to roughly mid-1957.

The Diplomacy of Prudence is based on exhaustive research in Israeli and Canadian archives and benefits from Kay's extensive knowledge of both the Canadian and the Israeli scenes. Most interesting is his chapter on the aborted Canadian sale of Canadair Sabres to Israel in 1956. This was a sale that Ottawa agreed to after much Israeli beseeching, but only because Washington clearly wanted Israel to have Canadian fighter jets to help offset the MiG 15 fighters that were flowing to Egypt and Syria from the USSR via Czechoslovakia. The sale was immediately cancelled by Ottawa when Israel attacked Egypt on 19 October 1956 to spark off the Sinai campaign.

There has probably been more sheer bunk written about Canada's alleged strong support of the Zionist cause before 1948, and its unwavering backing of Israel after, than on any other single subject in the field of Canadian foreign policy. Kay's book will help set the record straight because it demonstrates conclusively that Canada's position on the Arab-Israeli conflict was finely balanced and, as Kay says, prudent. Canada can be thought of as 'pro-Israeli' only by those who believed that accepting Israel's existence as a fact of life was a policy lacking balance.

Kay's book does suffer, however, from a decided lack of context. And context is precisely what is needed to understand the way Canada approached the Arab-Israeli conflict because, in reality, that conflict was not an important Canadian interest. True, a decided majority of Canadian Jews thought of Israel as very important, and a tiny minority of Canada's other citizens no doubt agreed. But, given the paucity of Canadian commercial or economic relations with the Middle East – Canada bought oil primarily from Venezuela until the late 1960s and almost none from any Arab countries – that was not a view shared by many others.

Israel and the Middle East conflict were important to Canada only as possible irritants to the relationship between the United States and Canada's other major NATO partners. Aside from the understandable Canadian preoccupation with Canada-US relations, Canada's most important other concern in the decade examined in this book was to do whatever it could to ensure that the United States and Britain, and to a lesser degree France, were always on the same side.

That is precisely why the Anglo-French invasion of the Suez Canal zone on 5 November 1956, on the pretext of protecting it from Israeli spearheads then thrusting across the Sinai, was viewed by Ottawa as a NATO disaster in the making. Washington strongly

Book Reviews 401

objected. Lester Pearson's proposed United Nations Emergency Force (unef) was initially intended primarily to replace the Anglo-French invasion forces in this zone. It would give London and Paris a un figleaf by allowing them to claim that the aim of their invasion - protection of the canal - would henceforth be carried out by the United Nations.

Pearson may well not have suspected the Israeli-Anglo-French collusion behind the Sinai-Suez war, but no matter. By helping save Anglo-French face, he helped hurry their departure. Their withdrawal partially placated the United States and allowed a semblance of nato unity to be re-established. Kay says not a word about this key factor when examining Pearson's role in establishing unef.

This book will fill a gap for those who study Canadian foreign policy. Others who have no knowledge of the backdrop for Canada-Israeli relations will probably find it difficult going. Virtually all of what was important in that relationship is described here, but little of it is explained.

david bercuson University of Calgary

Trading Beyond the Mountains: The British Fur Trade on the Pacific, 1793-1843. richard somerset mackie. Vancouver: UBC Press 1997. Pp. xxiv, 420, illus. \$75.00 cloth, \$29.95 paper

The title of this book is actually somewhat misleading because it deals with far more than the fur trade in what after 1821 became the Columbia Department of the Hudson's Bay Company. Mackie traces the history of the notion of a 'British, transcontinental commerce' linking the Canadian colonies with the Pacific. After a short discussion of early attempts to find the Northwest Passage and the operations of various companies in the Pacific, including the North West Company, Mackie focuses on the hbc and how, under the direction of George Simpson from 1821, it succeeded in achieving the transcontinental commerce others had aimed at.

By adapting to the particular conditions of the Pacific coast and applying the skills accumulated in the interior, the hbc was able to achieve a surprising degree of monopoly. Trapping out the southern areas kept American fur traders out, while negotiations with the Russians protected the company in the north. But fur proved to be less important than it was in the East, for the pelts of the West were not as good and the Native peoples were not primarily hunters. They relied on other resources, particularly maritime ones, for their subsistence. As a result, new products, such as lumber, salmon, and flour, became important items of trade in a new western economy that extended along the Pacific coast north to present-day Alaska, south to California, and westward to the Sandwich Islands. Indeed, when the company built Fort Victoria in 1843 and turned its attention northward, it was in the process of transformation. By

1849, when it began the colonization of Vancouver Island, the hbc was no longer, as Mackie puts it, 'the mythical fur trade company' of beaver and canoes, but rather 'a general resource company that had recognized an abundant new environment and a broad commercial opportunity' (182). Mackie succeeds in demonstrating that diversification occurred before 1870 and that the economy of what became British Columbia was too complex to make generalizations about a so-called fur trade era at all appropriate.

This history of the company's operations in the West is based on a thorough examination of company journals, account books, correspondence, and reports, both published and unpublished, and an extensive list of secondary sources. It is therefore extremely detailed – sometimes too detailed – and the reader sometimes loses sight of the train of the argument. Nevertheless, this book will prove extremely useful for anyone seeking information on the hbc's business in the western part of its territory. This study also helps to rescue the hbc from the stereotypes that have hindered examination of the company's history by showing that it was not just a collection of fur traders and picturesque voyageurs, but an enterprise which, like any other, sought out sources of profit wherever it could find them.

Still, this analysis remains very much an examination of the company's operations as they were viewed and carried out by its managers, and it does not entirely escape from older interpretations of the company's history. Mackie does devote a chapter to the significance of the Natives to the company's success. The Aboriginal population was indispensable. It provided provisions, commodities for export, and labour, and all at a cost so low that company officers were regularly moved to comment on what a bargain they were getting. Some of these workers were slaves, who were purchased from local Native populations, among whom slavery was common, or who sometimes came with the wives of company traders. Mackie does not overlook the fact that the country's Aboriginal inhabitants were crucial to the hbc's success and that they were not simply part of the landscape, though his discussion makes clear that the economic partnership that developed in the West was, like the one in Rupert's Land, an unequal one that eventually undermined Native cultures.

Mackie's discussion of the company fails to remedy a common problem among histories of the hbc – the neglect of the hbc's non-Native workers. Mackie does point out that as the company diversified, the 'diverse workforce of a nineteenth-century commercial economy was superimposed on an eighteenth-century fur trade' (317). In fact, except for engineering, the skilled trades Mackie lists as new additions had been performed in the hbc for well over a century. Greater discussion of the hbc's workers, how they fitted into the company's plans and how they responded to

Book Reviews 403

their employer's policies, would have added an important dimension to this otherwise thorough account.

edith i. burley Winnipeg

A Stranger to the Fur Trade: Joseph Wrigley and the Transformation of the Hudson's Bay Company, 1884-1891. eleanor stardom. Winnipeg: Rupert's Land Research Centre 1996. Pp. iv, 109. \$30.00

Over the years the Rupert's Land Research Centre has published a number of useful monographs relating to aspects of fur trade history. It has provided a valuable service in making available to a wider public ma and phd studies that might otherwise have seen only limited circulation. Eleanor Stardom's revised ma thesis is a worthwhile addition to this publication series. Stardom provides a succinct account of Joseph Wrigley's troubled tenure as a high-ranking supervisor of the Hudson's Bay Company's Canadian retail and fur-trading operations in the later 1880s. In a straightforward manner she chronicles the challenges Wrigley faced, his successes, and the circumstances that led to his forced retirement. By the end of this short but packed monograph, the reader has been presented with a detailed look at the inner workings of the hbc's Canadian operations in the waning years of the nineteenth century.

Stardom argues that such an examination is warranted because Wrigley's tenure coincided with a time of major 'transformation' within the company. Historians often use this rationale as a justification for their research and publications. What did this particular transformation consist of? Wrigley was the first high-ranking hbc manager to have a background in general retail operations as opposed to the collection and sale of furs. That appointment marked a major change in emphasis, a dramatic move to diversification of the company's operations. Wrigley worked to effect change not simply by adding new types of business to the company's operations but by 'modernizing' the running of the fur trade itself. In fact, and somewhat ironically, it was in the latter area that he effected his most successful changes. The strong and protracted opposition from the commissioned officers who oversaw the management of the local fur-trading posts provides ample testimony to the fundamental changes Wrigley put forward. First and foremost among those changes was a move to centralize administrative procedures via the introduction of inspectors and the centralization of ordering. He also pushed for a more flexible fur-pricing policy, a thoroughly up-graded accounting system, improved transport arrangements, and the replacement of senior managerial personnel by younger men with modern mercantile experience.

Stardom is correct: these measures represent transformation – even of a dramatic kind. As one high-ranking officer admitted in 1890, 'circs are very different now, as you well know.' But do we know? Even for those who are not specialists in fur trade history, many of the reforms noted above have a familiar ring. Stardom is aware of this complexity and she recognizes that change predated Wrigley's arrival and continued after his departure. As she notes, centralization was the 'dominant theme of the post-1870 period in the company's history.' But surely centralization and diversification predated the 1870s. Work by Richard Mackie and Lorne Hammond, among others, has underlined the degree to which the pre-1870 operations of the Hudson's Bay Company encompassed a wide variety of enterprises. One long-time fur trader reminisced in 1872 that he had 'been Sailor, Farmer, Coal Miner, packer, Salesman, Surveyor, explorer, Fur Trader and Accountant in Your Service.' Retrenchment, personnel up-grading, and centralization had played major roles in the company's managerial strategies since before the amalgamation of the North West Fur Trading Company with the Hudson's Bay Company in 1821, as work by Ann Carlos and others has shown. Moreover, the problem of London board/Canadian manager relations, a problem that receives attention in the short term from Stardom, is also one with a long history within the company and has been the focus of a rich historiography, though it receives scant notice in this monograph.

Stardom could not and did not set out to write an administrative history of anything other than a part of the hbc's past operations. Although her monograph would have been improved by a closer attention to past managerial change and the historiography surrounding those changes, she has provided readers with a useful study of a manager who did more than foreshadow the company's future orientation; he, as Stardom concludes, provided the company with the means to get there.

peter baskerville University of Victoria

The King of Baffin Land: W. Ralph Parsons, Last Fur Trade Commissioner of the Hudson's Bay Company. john parsons and burton k. janes. St John's: Creative Book Publishing 1996. Pp. xx, 234, illus. \$14.95

W. Ralph Parsons holds out considerable promise as the subject of a biography. He had a long career, from 1900 to 1940, as a fur trader with the Hudson's Bay Company, so a study of his life should make a significant contribution to our understandings of the history of the fur trade and the hbc in the first half of the twentieth century. An examination of Parsons's involvement in the northward expansion of the hbc should also illuminate aspects of an important phase in

the life of Canadian Inuit, during the period after whaling declined as a commercial activity and before the wholesale entry of the Canadian government into northern affairs. Unfortunately, and in spite of the desire of John Parsons and Burton K. Janes to establish Ralph Parsons as a significant figure in Newfoundland and Canadian history, this is an opportunity missed.

Organized chronologically, *The King of Baffin Land* begins with Parsons's birth and early years in Bay Roberts, Newfoundland, in 1881 and ends with his death in 1956 (including an entire chapter devoted to his funeral). In between, and befitting the title, are chapters covering Parsons's years with the hbc, centred around the recounting, in heroic terms, of his hardships and adventures. Following his start as an apprentice clerk in northern Labrador, Parsons spent much of his time in the eastern Arctic, where he established a number of posts, including the hbc's first on Baffin Island. Moving up the corporate hierarchy, Parsons became a district manager, and finished his career as fur trade commissioner. One chapter addresses the circumstances surrounding Parsons's conflict with hbc management, which led to his leaving the company. Bypassing a serious discussion of the internal tensions that accompanied the attempt to apply modern management techniques to the fur trade, the authors instead go to great pains to establish the hbc's Canadian general manager as the villain, thereby preserving the dignity and honour of Parsons.

Also included is a foreword by Parsons's son attesting to the integrity of the authors; an introduction by Parsons's nephew which sings the praises of rp (as he was known), and numerous appendices, mostly consisting of further tributes. Several items written by Parsons himself are also thrown in. One of these, an undated newspaper article (subsequently reprinted in Rene Fumoleau's *As Long as This Land Shall Last*) on the differences between Aboriginal and non-Native trappers, is crying out for interpretation: 'The Indian may be lazy, improvident and shiftless, but insofar as the conservation of wildlife is concerned, these failings may be almost regarded as virtues' (192). Throughout the book, the authors refuse to engage with Parsons's assumptions about the 'Native' which are evidenced by this article and in other ways, and, while this absence does not negate claims about Parsons's high moral character, it certainly problematizes them. What were Parsons's social and religious values, and were they characteristic of hbc employees and management? How did they influence company policy? How did Parsons envision the hbc's role and responsibilities towards Native people, and towards the Inuit of the eastern Arctic in particular, who were increasingly drawn into an economic relationship with the company? Parsons and Janes rely on A.J. Ray's *Canadian Fur Trade in the Industrial Age* to shore up their arguments about the importance of Parsons, but they ignore the

questions Ray raises about the role of the hbc in establishing its own welfare system - which, he argues, undermined Native self-sufficiency and cut them out of the developing northern economy.

On one level, *The King of Baffin Land* is impassioned and personal, reflecting the authors' belief in the importance of their subject. Yet despite the involvement and commitment of the biographers, the reader is left with many details and little substance. Little is learned about what motivated Parsons as a fur trader, as an hbc man, and as a human being. We are told what a humanitarian he is, but find out virtually nothing about his attitudes towards the Inuit. We are given endless examples of how others viewed him, but know little about the relationships that Parsons had with these people or what he thought about them. In spite of its claims to make his legacy come to life, and the authors' access to his personal papers, Parsons remains an outsider. Like the poorly reproduced black- and-white photographs that grace its pages, the nature of Parsons's contributions to the hbc and the development of the Canadian North remain shadowy and unsubstantiated.

peter geller Keewatin Community College

Memory is a Fickle Jade: A Collection of Historical Essays about Newfoundland and Her People. raymond w. guy. St. John's: Creative Book Publishing 1996. Pp. viii, 202, illus. \$12.95

This collection of essays by Raymond W. Guy (not the well-known humorist of the same name) can be judged by its cover. The photograph shows an elderly gentleman wearing slippers and seated in a leather chair, unwrapping books on the history of Newfoundland that have been given to him as Christmas presents. This contemplative scene fits the tone of the book, as a man looks back on the events that occurred during his lifetime.

The book deals with many of the more important themes in Newfoundland's early twentieth-century political history, from the early organizational meetings of the Fisherman's Protective Union (fpu) to the era of Commission Government and the Second World War. The author gives us a clear if brief treatment of the political corruption during the 1920s and the resulting Hollis Walker Inquiry. He also provides a good account of the public protest and the riot at the Legislative building in 1932, although his suggestion that Richard Squires may have orchestrated the riot seems far-fetched. There is a treatment of the appalling living conditions of those who cut wood for the paper companies during the 1930s. This chapter, based on the Bradley Report, provides a context for the infamous iwa strike, which falls outside the period covered here. Each of these essays is well written, even if the author was too eager to include long quotations and lists of names. Although these narratives are, for the

most part, interesting stories, the author could have made more of them. As students of Newfoundland's history know, the failure of the fpu to live up to its promise, the corruption of the Squires administration, Hollis Walker's findings, and the destruction at the Colonial Building all contributed to the Commission Government. This thread could have been used to tie these essays together, but in this treatment the author doesn't explain the significance of these events or make clear his reason for selecting these narratives.

Guy's opening essay reveals much about his ideology. It examines the perennial attempts of governments to encourage agriculture. He reaches the sensible conclusion that while subsistence agriculture is feasible, Newfoundland farms will never compete with richer agricultural lands elsewhere. He then departs from this resource-base explanation and blames provincial and municipal government regulations for 'imposing' an urban lifestyle and causing a decline in the number of sheep and cows in the outports. The feeling that government regulation has undermined the independence of rural folk is widespread, and the author goes as far as to suggest that municipal governments in rural areas are the 'trappings of an elephant on the back of a mouse,' a phrase resonant of the Amulree Commission's recommendation to suspend democratic government. This nostalgia for a rural Newfoundland without effective government denies the genuine benefits the state provides to people. It also ignores the fact that a half-million people with modern technology would not be able to sustain an adequate standard of living without quickly destroying their environment. The author should not be under any illusions as to the standard of living possible in a subsistence economy, since he recounts the poverty of the Depression and points out that many people starved to death.

Unfortunately, the author does not incorporate his memories of pre-war Newfoundland into his account, so he has written a book that is of less interest than it might have been. Because most of these essays are based almost entirely on published sources, they add little to what we know of these issues. Guy was either too young to add personal memories, as with the fpu meetings in his area, or because he was recounting events that happened in St John's while he lived in central Newfoundland, he has no personal knowledge to add to accounts that are familiar. An exception is his treatment of the struggle over incorporation of the town of Windsor, which is more original because he lived there during the town's early days. His last two essays depart from the character of the rest of the book and his account becomes personal. He reminisces about his career in the Royal Navy during the Second World War, giving us an amusing illustration of the capriciousness of promotion during wartime, and the story of his epic journey across the island to spend a few days home on shore leave. He was involved in the retail trade in an

outport during the period in which the truck system gave way to 'modern' consumer capitalism, but says nothing of the social and economic changes that he must have witnessed first hand. With only a little reference to original sources, he gives us a book that adds little to the historical literature one can see on his shelves in the cover photograph.

jeff a. webb Memorial University of Newfoundland

River Road: Essays on Manitoba and Prairie History. gerald friesen. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press 1996. Pp. xviii, 246, illus. \$19.95

The publication of Gerald Friesen's *Canadian Prairies* in 1984 marked a high-water mark in prairie historiography. Not only did the book offer a compelling interpretation of the region's history but it brilliantly synthesized the vast literature about the Canadian prairies that had been published after 1970. Since the mid-1980s, however, interest in prairie history has ebbed. Friesen's new book, *River Road*, consisting of a collection of essays most of which were written after 1984, both reflects this malaise and offers suggestions to revitalize this field of study. These essays consider new viewpoints of the prairie past, using the perspectives of ethnic and cultural history, women's history, labour history, and legal history, and re-establish Friesen as the pre-eminent generalist in the field. Interestingly, in a book of essays focused on Manitoba and the prairies, Friesen has a good deal to say about Canada's national history.

Friesen has an ambitious agenda. The book is aimed at an academic audience, but also seeks to engage a 'lay' readership in a discussion of the construction of the dominant culture, the place of Aboriginal people in prairie society, and the interaction between local, regional, national, and global cultures. To this end, Friesen has divided his book into three parts. The first part is directed at the general reader and consists of articles written in response to recent public issues; the second is directed at an academic readership and consists of more detailed historical studies; and the third contains interpretive essays towards a new synthesis of regional and national history.

The first part is the most polemic and, to this reader's mind, the weakest. With the exception of the title piece 'River Road' (co-written with Jean Friesen), these essays examine the issues of bilingualism, the Meech Lake accord, and constitutional politics from a prairie perspective. Friesen goes to some lengths to justify Manitoba's rejection of the accord and argues that it was not primarily a blow directed at Quebec. The West, Friesen argues, is not a monolithic entity and there exists no 'western' vision of the nation.

Rather, the crucial division within the prairies is between 'conservatives' and 'social democrats.' One gets the impression reading these first essays that they represent not so much a 'prairie' perspective as ndp policy positions.

The second part of the book, organized around the theme of the construction of dominant and alternative cultures, includes more detailed essays on the Manitoba Historical Society, J.H. Riddell, and the political thought of Bob Russell. The strongest piece, co-written with Associate Chief Justice A.C. Hamilton and Associate Chief Judge C.M. Sinclair, surveys the interaction of Manitoba's Aboriginal people and 'justice systems' and is a lucid and concise introduction to the topic.

The final part alone is worth the price of the book. Here Friesen not only re-examines the prairies as a region and his own work on the subject but provides some suggestions for a new synthesis of prairie and Canadian history. These last essays give a good indication of his changing interests. Although much of Friesen's past work has been framed by the 'limited identities' of region, class, and ethnicity, here he openly embraces more comparative approaches to correct the tendency of a narrowing vision. He does not jettison the notion of limited identities altogether, but the prospect of Canada's dismemberment seems to have focused more of his attention on the need for a national narrative.

These issues, and the relative importance of a prairie regional identity today, are adroitly analysed in 'The Prairies as Region: The Contemporary Meaning of an Old Idea.' In this vein, Friesen also re-examines the concept of ethnicity and its utility in writing prairie history. Co-written with Royden Loewen, this essay summarizes past approaches to ethnicity and advocates a more instrumentalist approach in which ethnicity is seen to be continuously reinvented in 'response to concerns arising in the everyday.' This notion of the cultural construction of both regionalism and ethnicity are indicative of Friesen's cultural turn. He is no postmodern, though, and he wants to use cultural history as the basis for a new synthesis of prairie and national history. This agenda is clearly on view in the essay on hockey. Ostensibly about the demise of the Winnipeg Jets and prairie cultural history, the discussion is as much about hockey as a national conversation 'which can build a nation.'

Most of the essays in *River Road* meet the test of local relevance and broader context, but the most engaging and interesting are those that focus on new approaches to prairie history and regionalism.

gerhard j. ens University of Alberta

Western Visions: Perspectives on the West in Canada. roger gibbins and sonia arrison. Peterborough, Ont.: Broadview Press 1995. Pp. 154, \$16.95

Roger Gibbins has been preoccupied with western regionalism for a long time. He has analysed it, worried about it, talked about it, and written about it, often and at considerable length. In this new book, with Sonia Arrison, a graduate student colleague, he has elevated his focus to a new level – the evolution and contemporary nature of nationalist sentiment in western Canada. It is not clear whether this approach represents a maturing of regionalism or an alternative to it.

Aside from this question, to which there may not be a completely satisfactory answer, this book should be read by every undergraduate student in western Canadian history, if only to challenge its assumptions. One might also say that every undergraduate in the country should read it, to get something other than a central Canadian view of our history. Canada is a different country when looked at from the western hinterland, rather than the standard survey texts, though several recent ones contradict the old patterns.

Much of the early part of *Western Visions* considers the implications of many of the staple concerns of western historiography – federal-provincial relations, populism, multiculturalism – all within a context that the West has been consistently put upon by central Canada, including the observation that the National Energy Policy cost Alberta \$50 billion. But it also gives much space to more immediate flashpoints, such as bilingualism, the attraction of the Reform Party, and Quebec separatism. The last section of the book is highly speculative yet very contemporary.

The authors take the position that 'western separatism' is frustrated Canadian nationalism, rather than a desire for or commitment to political independence. Its source is the inability of the West to influence national events (for the better, of course), exemplified by the failure to achieve Senate reform (meaning the equality of the provinces) in the face of Ontario intransigence and a more principled resistance by Quebec. They conclude that there is little prospect for meaningful reform except within the resolution of Quebec's constitutional objectives. Thus, the future of the national community depends on future relations between the West and Quebec. (Did not Henri Bourassa say something much like that a hundred years ago?) Western provinces have tried to position themselves relative to Quebec and Quebec's influence in Ottawa. As Quebec goes so go we all. What then of the future? Or what then of regionalism?

Ironically, it is regional pressure that now poses the greatest threat. Radical decentralization, driven by Quebec (but also by Ontario and Alberta), will gut the ability of the central government to provide national leadership and maintain national standards. According to the authors, if Quebec leaves, the West will not remain a unit. It will simply dissolve. Read it and weep.

Book Reviews 411

j.e. rea University of Manitoba

The Politics of Power: Ontario Hydro and Its Government, 1906–1995. neil b. freeman. Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1996. Pp. xii, 252, \$55.00 cloth, \$18.95 paper

Ontario Hydro is a major institutional innovation in Canadian history. It has been, at different times, the largest corporation in Canada, the largest public utility in the world, and the only large, regional public electricity utility in North America. This book by Neil Freeman is an excellent contribution to the governance history of Ontario Hydro, a history where much is known and written. Freeman, however, who first wrote this project as a doctoral dissertation in political science, makes valuable new contributions through detailed historical research and interviews with many key players. He places his findings within the theoretical frameworks of modern political science, focusing mainly on the postwar boom years of 1945–73, but with considerable detail and insight into the earlier years and less on recent times.

The book is important as a case study in the growth of the managerially hierarchical corporation of the twentieth century, and as an examination of a corporation that is woven deeply into the fabric of Ontario society. It is timely, given the two ideologies currently fighting it out on the battlefields of Ontario public policy. On one side, the idea to reintroduce private sector competition in providing electricity in Ontario through privatization of all or part of the corporation, and, on the other, the notion spearheaded by the Ontario Hydro unions that the corporation should complete its monopoly by taking over power distribution from the municipalities.

Freeman's primary thesis is that the history of the governance of Hydro, with its perennially ambiguous relationship with the provincial government, is an example of Carolyn Tuohy's 'institutionalized ambivalence' of Canadian policy and politics. It was founding chairman Adam Beck who almost single-handedly created the corporation's public monopoly by 1925, and, by promoting the notion of the Hydro as a municipal cooperative, secured its corporate autonomy from government. Freeman, however, discovers two perhaps more fundamental organizational innovations at Hydro that stemmed from such institutionalized ambivalence.

The first is what he calls the Ferguson formula on governance appointments. Introduced in the 1920s, this decision stipulated that Hydro would be governed through the appointment of a triad of commission representatives: a non-partisan chairman, a government representative, and a municipal association representative. Freeman sees this élite stakeholder accommodation as a 'masterstroke in

political management.' The second innovation, developed later in the postwar boom years, was the splitting of governance between the non-partisan chairman, as chief executive officer, to look outwards at the big policy pictures in liaison with the government, and a general manager, as chief operating officer, to look inwards at professional, managerial, and technical affairs. With these officers standing back to back and with the commission acting as the non-managerial buffer between the government and the Hydro management, this model allowed government influence in policy decisions without government interference in management affairs. Of course, greater government control in management came later, de facto if not de jure, with the development of the nuclear program and the replacement of the commission by a board of directors reporting to the minister of energy. But the institutionalized ambivalence remained in the relationship between Ontario Hydro and the Ontario Energy Board, a relationship that involves, strangely enough, the external public review of a public corporation.

Freeman provides an excellent examination of the political, statutory, legislative, and personal influences on the evolution of governance at Ontario Hydro, and a complete listing of all major appointments and officers over the corporation's ninety-year history. Mixed in are tales of dirty politics, conflicts of interest, and influence-peddling (for example, Freeman argues, Adam Beck's methods must be distinguished from his more honourable objectives), but this account is no muckraking potboiler. Freeman generally agrees with other writers, such as Viv Nelles and Merrill Denison, that Hydro's main institutional innovation was its organizational form, combining the public purse with managerial efficiency through a public authority 'owned' by the municipalities and responsible to government, but not under its direction.

A remarkable aspect of Ontario Hydro, which set it apart from almost every other public utility in the world, was its unique accounting of each municipality's 'equity' in the corporation, detailing each one's sinking-fund contributions to the retirement of the corporation's debt. A review of the statistical tables in the corporation's annual reports also gives a good indication of the waning influence of the municipalities over the years, despite their being the chief initiators of the institution in 1906. As their representation was progressively diluted from one in three on the commission to one in eleven on the board of directors, their 'equity' stakes were removed from the annual report in 1973 and then purged completely from all financial reporting in 1993.

There are a few shortcomings in Freeman's work. His attempts to place the institutional evolution of Hydro into modern political science interpretations of the evolution of crown corporations is unsuccessful. Better frameworks for analysis are the modern perspectives in corporate and technological history exemplified by

the work of Alfred Chandler and Thomas Hughes, among others. Chandler suggests that organizational and institutional change in corporations, public or private, often followed technological change, in order that new technologies could be introduced and controlled. Hughes argues that the nature of corporate organizational response to new technologies of electricity supply in the twentieth century depended on local economic, geographic, social, legislative, and political factors. The organizational and institutional evolution of Ontario Hydro, as a large-scale, integrated public electric utility, placed within these frameworks, would perhaps be found to have been moulded not just by institutionalized ambivalence but by economic and technological factors such as the nature of the Niagara resource, the two world wars, and the nuclear option and technology.

As a student of economic development, I would have liked to see Freeman discuss what the evolving organizational form of Ontario Hydro meant for social and economic development in the province. Did organizational economies stem from centralized management and control? Did the managerial hierarchy of Ontario Hydro improve the corporation's economic performance and that of the province? Did the organization and governance of the public Ontario Hydro give it significant economic and technological advantages or disadvantages over private utilities? Unfortunately, little is written of the economic and technological history of Ontario Hydro to complement the more extensive record of its institutional and organizational history. It is to the latter that Freeman makes a new and valuable contribution with this book.

peter wylie Trent University and Okanagan University College

Co-operation, Conflict, and Consensus: B.C. Central and the Credit Union Movement to 1994. ian macpherson. Vancouver: BC Central Credit Union 1995. Pp. 294, illus. \$39.95 cloth, \$29.95 paper

Most readers should already be familiar with Ian MacPherson's oeuvre concerning the history of cooperatives in Canada. His latest contribution, a history of credit unions in British Columbia, is a well-produced popular history reflecting his deep scholarly and personal understanding of his subject. This book may draw particular attention outside British Columbia, given the recent entry of VanCity credit union – the nation's largest – into nationwide virtual banking. Co-operation, Conflict, and Consensus offers an opportunity to discover the roots of English Canada's (and possibly North America's) most dynamic popular banking movement, 'a unique and significant experiment in the history of co-operative enterprise' (277).

Nearly twenty years ago, MacPherson produced *Each for All: A History of the Co-operative Movement in English Canada*,

1900–1945, which provided a foundation and a framework for the history of cooperatives outside Quebec. It has been complemented by MacPherson's regional analyses (articles on cooperatives in the Prairie and the Atlantic provinces) and by studies of various cooperative institutions, including books on the Co-operative Union of Canada and national cooperative insurance and trust companies.

In his new book, MacPherson deals with the development of bc credit unions, showing how the issues in the movement related both to the internal dynamics of its growth and diversity and to external forces of change in society. Broadly speaking, he suggests this history can be grouped into three phases. First was the 'emancipatory era' from the 1930s to the 1960s, in which credit unions were a kind of crusade (indeed, were initiated by the Army of the Common Good in Burnaby) to liberate the poor from economic oppression. During this period the concept evolved of credit unions providing small loans for 'provident and productive' purposes, based on the character of the borrower, and usually provided within a tightly knit, 'closed-bond' membership group defined by workplace, ethnicity, or religion. He illustrates that there was a continual tension between this largely American understanding of credit unions and divergent, and in some respects more ambitious, local and Canadian tendencies.

The second era – of entrepreneurship in the 1960s to the early 1980s – was essentially concerned with growth and the development of institutions, including the strengthening of the B.C. Central Credit Union as the leader and 'honest broker' for the movement. This period saw a distinctive change away from the closed bond towards more open, and in some cases vastly larger, 'community' credit unions. As MacPherson observes, some of this entrepreneurship served simply to make big credit unions bigger, while other forms of entrepreneurship were socially motivated and focused on the development of new cooperative enterprises that were conceived to improve members' lives and communities. Since the 1980s, bc credit unions have also been pioneers in developing automated tellers, ethical mutual funds, point-of-sale electronic transactions, and other innovations.

The most recent era, according to MacPherson, is one of 'mainstreaming,' in which credit unions are striving to take their place as the main indigenous financial institutions in British Columbia. He observes that present trends raise the perennial questions of democracy, responsiveness to members, and commitment to communities. His prescription is that credit unions must draw on their best traditions of cooperative entrepreneurship in order to apply the credit union approach to a widening range of activities.

Co-operation, Conflict, and Consensus stands out as MacPherson's best book since *Each for All*. It has four particular strengths. First, it is a study not just of one organization, but of an

entire movement of diverse and often conflicting organizations set in the context of times, places, and social change. Second, it makes full use of region as a tool of analysis: British Columbia as a region, to be sure, but also regions within British Columbia. Although regional culture and politics have been consistent themes in MacPherson's writings, his latest book raises to prominence a new theme: gender. MacPherson highlights the important and changing roles played by women in the development of British Columbia's credit unions. Indeed, though the sources are evidently thin, one is tempted to conclude that this may be one important reason for the movement's distinctive successes. *Co-operation, Conflict, and Consensus* is, finally, a most attractively produced book, accessible to non-scholars. This appeal is ensured by its coffee table format, by numerous illustrations, and by colourful quotations and sidebars. (My favourite is 'Romance in the Credit Union Movement': What do you do when the president and the general manager elope together?)

The text is very clean and there are few infelicities, one of which is the repeated misspelling of the name of Hermann Schulze-Delitzsch, the German founder of credit unions, who is deprived of his second z. And, in an interesting bit of reflexivity, MacPherson, who has been active as a volunteer and leader in bc credit unions as well as in the international cooperative movement, appears a number of times as a character in his own book.

brett fairbairn University of Saskatchewan

The National Album: Collective Biography and the Formation of the Canadian Middle Class. robert lanning. Ottawa: Carleton University Press 1996. Pp. x, 202. \$26.95

Presbyterian minister, principal of a woman's college, and paragon of community respectability, William Cochrane was the type of admirable Canadian whose life would certainly have been profiled in a volume of short biographies in Victorian Canada. Cochrane was himself the principal author of such a series: *The Canadian Album: Men of Canada, or Success by Example*, which featured some 3000 mini-portraits of 'exemplary' Canadians in the late nineteenth century. In an intriguing study directed to both historians and sociologists, Robert Lanning examines the genre of the collective biography. What, he asks, was the 'cultural and intellectual basis of [its] production, [its] formative concepts, and [its] construction of meaning'?

The author argues that the short biography was designed to be instructional, not merely informative, and that it typically embraced and promoted the social values of the emerging middle class. Like 'object lessons' in Canadian schools, which moralized to students by way of real-life examples, *The Canadian Album* and *Celebrated*

Canadians (compiled by civil servant and part-time biographer H.J. Morgan) exalted the life of the well-bred. The successful Canadian, most often a politician, clergyman, militia-man, businessman, or educator, came from humble but respectable roots; was invariably industrious, often prevailing over adversity; served his community selflessly; and contributed to the development of the nation. Women were largely excluded from these tributes, with the exception of their place in Morgan's 1903 volume, *Types of Canadian Women*. Lanning credits Morgan for at least acknowledging the presence of prominent women, but notes that they were frequently praised more for their associations – 'wives of ... etc.' – than for their individual accomplishments. This, too, reflected women's treatment within middle-class society at the turn of the century.

According to Lanning, these hagiographical portraits served a larger, more political purpose in an era of significant, and periodically disruptive, social change. They offered ordinary Canadians the prospect of mobility and success, but within a social structure that still valued hierarchy and deference, and that depended increasingly on the authority of expertise. The moral lesson: Progress in Canada must be accompanied by stability; social change must be partnered with social control.

Lanning has made a perceptive and reasonable reading of the biographies, and the theme will undoubtedly resonate with students of Canadian intellectual history and of the middle class. Many will already have read the sermons, political speeches, and convocation addresses of Canada's leaders, who were forever reminding their audiences of the need to temper ambition with restraint, experience with order, materialism with civility. Whether anyone was listening to these homilies is a question that merits more investigation, including by Lanning. Thus, while the methodology of the book is unusual, its findings are familiar, and historians will uncover few new insights into the social and cultural life of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Given the author's heavy reliance on the work of several social theorists – Philip Abrams, Leo Lowenthal, Georg Simmel, Anthony Giddens – sociologists may find the book more inspiring, and it could well provide a route to their own explorations of Canadian history. All readers are likely to agree on one thing: *The National Album* should not have been published without an index.

paul axelrod York University

For a Working-Class Culture in Canada: A Selection of Colin McKay's Writings on Sociology and Political Economy, 1897–1939. Edited by ian mckay. St John's: Canadian Committee on Labour History 1996. Pp. lii, 615. \$29.95

Book Reviews 417

Ian McKay is a history professor at Queen's University in Ontario who, with the help of Lewis Jackson, has already published a book on Colin McKay's sea stories. According to the book's jacket, Colin McKay (no relation) was a Nova Scotia-born 'seafarer, poet, labour activist, short story writer, Christian, philosopher, journalist, political economist, cultural critic, and socialist' who lived mainly in Canada from 1876 to 1939.

In this book, Ian McKay and Lewis Jackson have again collaborated to produce a compilation of McKay's most interesting articles on economics, sociology, and the Canadian labour movement. Although 'only' 134 of the 952 articles by McKay so far uncovered are presented, that is more than enough to convince anyone that he was one of the most prolific and well-read socialists in Canadian history.

The book is divided into several major parts. It begins with a forty-two-page introduction by Jackson and McKay, which serves as a biography of Colin McKay's working life, first as a sailor, then as a labour journalist. It is followed by a five-part compendium of McKay's various writings, each of them introduced with a lengthy analysis of their contents by Ian McKay. Thus, for the next 488 pages, we are treated to a total of 158 pages of analysis interspersed with 330 pages of Colin McKay's collected articles. Dozens of those pages are also footnoted, providing us with further information about Colin McKay's source references.

Ian McKay has written a Marxist afterword in the form of a ninety-five-page 'open letter to Colin McKay,' which includes thirty-two more pages of footnotes. Finally, we are also treated to a fifteen-page selected bibliography, a name index, and a subject index.

What we have here is nothing less than a labour of love, but Colin McKay certainly seems to deserve it. Here was a genuine, self-taught, mostly working-class intellectual, living and writing in Canada while remaining outside the usual attachment to either the CCF or the Communist Party of Canada. McKay wrote hundreds of articles and letters, long and short, which were published between 1897 and 1939 in such newspapers and union journals as the *Montreal Herald*, the *Shelburne Gazette* and *Coast Guard* (Nova Scotia), the *Eastern Labor News* (Moncton), the *Canadian Railway Employees' Monthly*, *Labor World/Le Monde Ouvrier*, *The One Big Union Bulletin*, and the *Canadian Unionist*. He started out as a left-liberal supporter of the American Federation of Labor in Canada and evolved into an independent Marxist promoting the All-Canadian Congress of Labour.

As Ian McKay points out, Colin McKay's importance to late twentieth-century historians comes from his obstinate refusal to conform to our 'dichotomous categorizations' concerning the history of Canadian socialism or the Canadian labour movement. McKay is not classifiable as either a democratic or a revolutionary socialist, and his

Marxism was always mixed up with a great deal of Christian idealism, Spencerian sociology, and even occasional support (such as during the First World War) for the British Empire.

Knowledge of McKay's contributions to sociology and political economy is of equal importance. As Ian McKay demonstrates, the fact that Colin McKay's writings have mostly been forgotten is a major set-back, since much of his analysis is currently being reproduced by more recent observers. This tendency to repeat someone else's forgotten work is a particularly distressing characteristic of all social science, in Canada and elsewhere. Ian McKay himself, who is at least as well read as was his prolific predecessor, commits a similar (though minor) sin when he fails to note that Colin McKay's 1930s critique of Social Credit and monetary reform made no reference whatever to earlier Canadian promotions of monetary reform, such as that of Isaac Buchanan in the Confederation period.

In fact, much of what Colin McKay did and wrote is surprisingly similar to much of Buchanan's life and work, though Buchanan was a Conservative grain merchant and McKay a Marxist seafarer, and though one died (1883) about the same time as the other was born (1876), both were highly religious, highly prolific, largely forgotten writers on sociology and on political economy who carried on careers in other fields. Both, curiously enough, also favoured versions of the labour theory of value, and wrote hundreds of articles praising 'the labour power' while condemning 'the money power.'

The tragedy of the lives of such writers is that their uncompromising opposition to laissez-faire has relegated their contributions to almost total oblivion. As Ian McKay so eloquently points out in his afterword, 'what passes for advanced political thought today ... [is] a vulgar rehash of the worst banalities of nineteenth-century social thought' (496). Unfortunately, only the fifty or so people currently interested in the history of early Canadian socialism will ever be inclined to read this magnificent book.

kevin henley Université du Québec à Montréal

For the People: A History of St Francis Xavier University. james d. cameron. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1996. Pp. xx, 551, illus. \$39.95

After its initial two-year temporary home in the 'foggy, damp climate' of Acadian Arichat, and partly to bolster Bishop Colin MacKinnon's claim to the seven counties of eastern Nova Scotia, St FX opened its doors in Antigonish in September 1855 with a 'scholarly grace and priestly tone.' At the time there was a 'crying need for a steady supply of dependable and locally trained native

priests' for the Gaels from Scotland, a problem compounded by the presence in the area of 'clerical adventurers.' James Cameron offers up some solid social history in this detailed study of one of the more significant institutions to influence eastern Nova Scotia and Cape Breton Island in the past 140 years. St FX's mission would not alter for generations, and Cameron captures the insular nature of the institution and the individuals who whirled around Antigonish. For Rev. Dr John Cameron, the second rector/president (1855-8) and bishop (1877-1910), 'godless education is a fiendish monster which ought to be exposed in all its hideous and soul-destroying deformity.' Bishop James Morrison's later dealings with the thorny issue of a regional university were guided by his concern with the 'Protestant mentality' and the usual turf considerations. Also, Rev. Dr Patrick J. Nicholson, president of the university from 1944 to 1954, was forthright in his approach: 'We find it more desirable to have poorly qualified men who get along well with us than top notch scholars whose influence might be in the direction of disharmony.' Not until 1969-70 was the intellectual development of students stated to be a 'principal objective.' The last 'priest-professor' retired in 1996.

Cameron traces the history of an institution with few financial resources (the majority of its students were from the diocese and their numerical stronghold was in the battered economic heartland of industrial Cape Breton), its early role in coeducation, the contributions of the nuns - the Sisters of St Martha and the Congregation of Notre Dame - and its thrust beyond its academic walls with the Extension Department and the Antigonish Movement. One of his strengths is to give us a sense of the individuals who contributed to the institution, in his discussion of various ecclesiastical, political, and educational controversies. There was consternation when the first rector, Rev. Dr John Schulte, the 'Prussian priest-professor,' fell into apostasy, and it increased when Bishop MacKinnon failed to 'bring him "back to sanity" and Antigonish,' although this was an exception to an 'otherwise unassailable record of loyalty to Rome by the college's priest-presidents.' Then there was the clash between Bishop Cameron, a staunch Conservative, and university rector Rev. Dr Neil MacNeil, who, as editor of the *Casket*, tried a policy of 'strict neutrality' on political reporting; Cameron's political loyalties 'seduced him into abandoning reason for prejudice,' and the 'gifted' MacNeil lost both positions. Soon thereafter, Rev. Dr Alexander M. Thompson, rector and founder of the School of Applied Science, was described by long-time professor Rev. Dr Alex MacDonald as 'a full-fledged autocrat, arbitrary and whimsical,' in part because of Thompson's innovative approach to coeducation and his inclination to permit the students 'to run rampant through the college buildings at recreation time, and to enter the town at will.' Then there was the 'deadly

proposition' of university federation in the 1920s; for championing that cause, the feisty Jimmy Tompkins found himself transferred to Canso parish.

In his preface, the author assures us that 'a persistent official and actual concern with service to the people of eastern Nova Scotia has characterized St. F.X.' Yet in a work titled *For the People*, the discussion and analysis concerning community, culture, and class is less than complete. Aside from a couple of fleeting references, such as the purchase of a local high school that 'evoked considerable ill will among the townspeople,' there is little treatment of the traditional town/gown tension. Did the local worthies and ordinary Antigonishers simply march to the same tune from the hill? On the cultural front, Cameron argues that Bishop Cameron's approach was a pragmatic one: 'Highland culture and traditions were not a priority; social advancement and integration were'; thus 'Gaelic language and literature were not taught at St. F.X. until 1894, and they always remained an insignificant part of the university's educational program.' The author argues that the Gaels threw off their 'sense of social inferiority' and internalized the 'contemporary social and cultural standards of the dominant culture' in 'exchange for material and social advantage.' When the first course in Gaelic was finally offered, there were an estimated 80,000 Gaelic speakers in Cape Breton, and more than 40,000 of them were members of the diocese. The culture and language of the Gael were flourishing at the time in the deep, rich resource of the Cape Breton Gàidhealtachd. Doubtless the process identified by the author was at work, but this reviewer wonders about the role of institutional and cultural leadership. The language decline continued. More than one hundred years after it was founded, the university hired C.I.N. MacLeod from Scotland. Calling the main reading room in the new library the 'Hall of the Clans' to remember Angus L. Macdonald - 'a champion of Scottish tradition in Nova Scotia' - after the culture had been devastated is a dubious tradeoff. Admittedly there was increased economic and political clout for Catholics in the mainstream society, but if one puts to the side those who left, or were unable to stay, and those who climbed into the professional ranks, there remained considerable numbers in a decaying rural sector holding on to their 'social liabilities.'

There is also St FX's response to the situation in industrial Cape Breton. There is considerable discussion of the much-heralded Extension Department and the Coady Institute. Extension made 'useful contributions to the region's social and economic life,' in part, according to Moses Coady, because of 'its non-alliance with a dominating social and financial elite.' Much was accomplished. Yet what is not explained in this study is the extraordinary amount of energy devoted to targeting the working-class militants in industrial Cape Breton. Rooting out the radicals was a main thrust for decades.

Book Reviews 421

Bishop Morrison 'considered extension the centre of resistance to Communism in the region,' and this work underlines that objective. Coady claimed in 1951 that Extension had 'licked them,' partly because of the efforts of Rev. Michael MacKinnon, who became head of the Extension office in Sydney in 1950 and who was credited with 'routing the Communists.' They remained vigilant; a 1964 pamphlet warned: 'If we don't do it - the communists will!' But what exactly was the threat - and the concern? Since the mid-1920s the left had been unable to win elections in this area and it could not even displace the right wingers from union leadership, although George MacEachern and others (not all of whom were communists or even radicals) were instrumental in the late 1930s in getting the Trade Union Act passed and in organizing the Sydney steelworkers. Thus, this picture is slightly out of focus, especially when the author points out that through much of the period the overwhelming majority of the students were from the diocese, and in 1950 over 70 per cent of that group were from working-class industrial Cape Breton. The picture becomes a bit clearer when one understands that Dosco president H.J. Kelly, known in local lore for his dismissive response - 'No smoke, no bologna' - to a delegation of immigrant women seeking some solution from the constant pollution, became diocesan chairman of the university's fund-raising campaign in the mid-1940s. The Eaton Foundation was the sole patron for this work, which helps explain the curious conclusion to the acknowledgment: 'St Francis Xavier University is proud to be associated with the Eaton Family. Together, we have helped to build Canada.' Neither the retail empire nor the faculty at St FX is unionized. For the People may be inappropriately titled, but it is an excellent beginning for anyone who would like to do additional work on this influential institution.

don macgillivray University College of Cape Breton

Forecasts for Flying: Meteorology in Canada, 1918-1939. morley thomas. Toronto: ECW Press 1996. Pp. 200, illus. \$14.95

This is the second volume of Morley Thomas's historical study of the Canadian Meteorological Service. The first volume, *The Beginnings of Canadian Meteorology*, appeared in 1991 and covered the early developments of the service from its initial organization in the 1870s. That book took the story to 1914, part way through the tenure of Sir Frederic Stupart. The present volume covers the interwar years, into the directorship of John Patterson. The author hints at a third volume - and perhaps more - on the way.

It is astonishing that historians have taken so little note of a scientific service so old and so important as the Meteorological Service - now the Atmospheric Environment Service of Environment Canada

– but then, not even the Geological Survey of Canada has received the attention it deserves. Thomas is not a professional historian, but a former head of the service himself. His full access to the archives, as well as his intimate knowledge of both the organization and the science, allow him to provide a solid account of the service's activities and personalities.

As the title implies, the core of the book is devoted to meteorology in the service of Canadian aviation. Thomas's argument seems to be that without pressure to provide complete and timely meteorological information to flyers, the Meteorological Service might have become increasingly irrelevant. Certainly, the portrait he paints of Stupart suggests that he was more inflexible towards the end of his directorship. The service had other disabilities: it had no serious role in the Great War (unlike the office in Britain), it probably had too many staff with outdated ideas, and it received little support from Ottawa.

Early aviators had quite different needs than the general public from meteorology. Flying at low altitudes, in small planes, with no radio beacons or radar, they required specific, short-term forecasts and information about winds aloft and visibility, along with cloud cover and ceiling. Twice-daily general prognostications from the Toronto office were insufficient. The impecunious service did not face this need squarely until the mid-1920s, although it was already dabbling in 'niche meteorology' for forestry and agricultural interests.

Advances in aviation-oriented meteorology took place in four stages. First, some experimental and small-scale work assisted the early growth of aviation relating to civilian commercial flying and the embryonic rcaf in the 1920s. Second, the impending imperial airship route stimulated the formation of Canada's first national aerodrome at St-Hubert in 1930, replete with a modern aviation forecasting centre. After the r-101 disaster, attention returned to aircraft and the planning of a Trans-Canada airway system for air mail in the early 1930s. This system required a series of stations, many staffed twenty-four hours daily, in many new airports. The Depression curtailed this phase, but by the mid-1930s aviation picked up and the system was revamped for larger-scale commercial flying, culminating in the inauguration of Trans-Canada Airlines in 1937. With a new system in place, the Meteorological Service began extending its scheme to transatlantic flying-boat service just as the Second World War began.

In the background were two other important developments: the adoption, after much hesitation, of the modern Bergen School theory of air masses and frontal systems, and the creation of an MSc meteorology specialist physics stream at the University of Toronto. These changes brought the Canadian system 'up to speed' in international meteorology and secured a source of trained scientific personnel to replace the volunteers on whom the service had relied

for sixty years.

Like the first volume, this book needs serious editing. Chapters read like independent essays, with little reference one to another. Particular factual statements are often repeated, an annoying fault in a short book. Both of the existing volumes, and the third to come, could well have been combined in one, well-illustrated, account. Such a book would attract a wide and grateful readership.

Forecasts for Flying is institutional history, though it does rise above the level of many of that genre, while still falling short of a history that asks more penetrating questions. But that is probably not the author's purpose, for these studies establish an accessible record of a venerable institution. Perhaps he realizes that if no one does the job now, it may not get done in future. A cost-cutting government might find privatizing the service attractive. Once sold to foreign interests, its history would rapidly fade away. Despite its problems, Thomas's book belongs on the bookshelf of everyone interested in the history of Canadian science, aviation, and government institutions.

richard a. jarrell York University

Using Computers in History: A Practical Guide. m.j. lewis and roger lloyd-jones. New York: Routledge 1996. Pp. xiv, 248, \$59.95 cloth, \$18.95 paper

This book grew out of the authors' experience in teaching an introductory course in historical computing to undergraduates at Sheffield Hallam University in the United Kingdom and is intended to serve as a workbook for that course. Its scope is much more modest than the title indicates. It is not a comprehensive introduction to using computers in history, but a guide to two major types of software, spreadsheets and database systems, with how-to instructions for using Microsoft Excel and Access in their Windows 3.1 releases. It is aimed at undergraduates totally unacquainted with computers.

The book begins with instructions for the use of the book and a cursory introduction to the application of computers to historical inquiry. It then turns to a presentation of spreadsheet software, gives step-by-step instructions on data entry and formatting in Excel, and offers a series of exercises designed to teach the construction of graphs and charts. The last section of the book deals with databases. After a rudimentary presentation of the usefulness of databases for historical analysis, the last two chapters provide exercises in database creation and in data analysis. Examples are taken from nineteenth- and twentieth-century British economic and social history. The book includes copious illustrations from screen shots showing software interfaces and final output, as well as appendices listing the data used in the exercises. Within the limited scope given to the book, the authors are fairly successful. The workshops are

easy to follow, well structured pedagogically, and written in a simple style reminiscent of commercial software tutorials.

There are indications that the authors do not completely grasp some of the subject matter they present in the book. The characteristics of relational database systems are not clearly defined and the database examples do not adhere to the rules governing the structure of data in relational database systems. The discussion of the concept of correlation fails to explain the statistical postulates on which correlation is based; it shows only how to use Excel to produce a correlation coefficient. Worse, they fail to state explicitly the models and assumptions on which some of the hypotheses used as examples are based.

It is also unfortunate that the book puts most of its emphasis on the use of spreadsheets rather than on database systems. Database systems allow the manipulation of structured data, whether of a quantitative or a qualitative nature, for a variety of analytical purposes, while spreadsheets are restricted to the quantitative analysis of data. Furthermore, the book fails to introduce an important feature of Access and Excel: the ability to link data easily between the two applications. There are some errors of fact (the first successful commercial pc was not the ibm machine introduced in 1981 but the Apple ii), of definition (psephology is the study of elections, not only of poll book data), and of formulation (economic historians use computers to test hypotheses derived from statistical models, not to formulate their models).

There are also a few lapses in editing that are annoying. The very elementary description of computers in the introduction has superfluous footnotes to other historians' descriptions of hardware or of the Windows environment. We also learn at least five times that spreadsheets are called worksheets in Excel. It may be that students need this repetition in class, but it served no pedagogical purpose in the book.

For professional historians and advanced students, there are more useful books than this one. Daniel I. Greenstein's *Historian's Guide to History and Computing* (Oxford 1994) provides a broad introduction to the breadth of computer applications in historical research and teaching. *Databases in Historical Research* by Jon Press and Charles Harvey (New York 1996) has a strong conceptual presentation of database systems and of their application to historical research. On the whole, historians will find it more rewarding to read these volumes and then turn to the better texts on the nuts and bolts of how to use software. They certainly would do well to follow that route even if they want to use this volume as a workshop study book.

josé e. igartua Université du Québec à Montréal

