

The Western History Association

Review: Review

Author(s): Donald L. Fixico

Review by: Donald L. Fixico

Source: *The Western Historical Quarterly*, Vol. 41, No. 3 (Autumn 2010), p. 381

Published by: [Western Historical Quarterly, Utah State University](#) on behalf of [The Western History Association](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/westhistquar.41.3.0381>

Accessed: 17-07-2015 19:33 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Western Historical Quarterly, Utah State University and The Western History Association are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Western Historical Quarterly*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Broken Treaties: United States and Canadian Relations with the Lakotas and the Plains Cree, 1868–1885. By Jill St. Germain. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2009. xxvi + 450 pp. Illustration, maps, appendices, notes, bibliography, index. \$50.00, CAN\$66.00, £41.00.)

This book follows on the heels of Jill St. Germain's equally impressive first book, *Indian Treaty-Making in the United States and Canada, 1867–1877*. Focusing more on the governmental relations of the United States with the Lakota and of Canada with the Plains Cree, St. Germain argues that historians have not challenged the "broken treaties" presumption about Indian-government agreements. By doing much more than this, St. Germain provides a comparative study of the failings of the Treaty 6 and the Treaty of 1868, more commonly known as the Fort Laramie Treaty.

Organized into eight chapters with an introduction and a conclusion, this major study also includes appendices of all treaties. Five useful maps supply a visual examination of the regions and geographic references to important posts, rivers, and tribal lands belonging to forty-nine First Nations groups, three Sioux groups, and the Arapaho.

The author achieves the tall task of comparing two case histories during roughly the same years, a daunting challenge considering this was a doctoral dissertation that has been revised for publication. St. Germain has addressed all concerns with careful organization. Her analytical foundation considers similarities that included the broken treaties presumption, the westward expansion of two countries, and Native responses to that expansion and in corresponding western regions in the United States and Canada.

A scholar could easily fall into the trap of writing two separate histories, but St. Germain holds a steady course of drawing parallels in

the first and second chapters according to historical backgrounds and what was promised in the two agreements. However, the distinct circumstances of each case convinced St. Germain to use a technique that weaves together the cases in alternating chapters.

St. Germain has achieved a full treatment of a comparative study. Providing the necessary background histories, she substantiated the meaning of broken treaties in two significant accords that aimed at the heartlands of Indian country in Canada and the United States. The governments' obligations proved overwhelming, as one sought the central areas of Alberta and Saskatchewan and the other seized the Black Hills in response to the failures of indigenous peoples on their parts of the agreements. She has succeeded in making a major contribution to Indian history, Native studies, federal Indian law, federal government policy history, political science, and trans-border studies. This book alerts scholars of Indian history in this country to similarities in Canada-First Nations history. Well written and researched from primary sources in both the United States and Canada, this volume reminds us how significant tribal sovereignty was and how it continues to inform tribal governments today.

DONALD L. FIXICO
Arizona State University

The Indian Commissioners: Agents of the State and Indian Policy in Canada's Prairie West, 1873–1932. By Brian E. Titley. (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2009. xi + 266 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. CAN\$33.95.)

Brian Titley's study of Canadian Indian commissioners is a valuable addition to his earlier works on Superintendent of Indian Affairs Duncan Campbell Scott and Indian