

The Western History Association

Review: Review

Author(s): Ted McCoy

Review by: Ted McCoy

Source: *The Western Historical Quarterly*, Vol. 41, No. 3 (Autumn 2010), pp. 381-382

Published by: [Western Historical Quarterly, Utah State University](#) on behalf of [The Western History Association](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/westhistquar.41.3.0381a>

Accessed: 16-07-2015 20:09 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Western Historical Quarterly, Utah State University and The Western History Association are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Western Historical Quarterly*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Broken Treaties: United States and Canadian Relations with the Lakotas and the Plains Cree, 1868–1885. By Jill St. Germain. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2009. xxvi + 450 pp. Illustration, maps, appendices, notes, bibliography, index. \$50.00, CAN\$66.00, £41.00.)

This book follows on the heels of Jill St. Germain's equally impressive first book, *Indian Treaty-Making in the United States and Canada, 1867–1877*. Focusing more on the governmental relations of the United States with the Lakota and of Canada with the Plains Cree, St. Germain argues that historians have not challenged the "broken treaties" presumption about Indian-government agreements. By doing much more than this, St. Germain provides a comparative study of the failings of the Treaty 6 and the Treaty of 1868, more commonly known as the Fort Laramie Treaty.

Organized into eight chapters with an introduction and a conclusion, this major study also includes appendices of all treaties. Five useful maps supply a visual examination of the regions and geographic references to important posts, rivers, and tribal lands belonging to forty-nine First Nations groups, three Sioux groups, and the Arapaho.

The author achieves the tall task of comparing two case histories during roughly the same years, a daunting challenge considering this was a doctoral dissertation that has been revised for publication. St. Germain has addressed all concerns with careful organization. Her analytical foundation considers similarities that included the broken treaties presumption, the westward expansion of two countries, and Native responses to that expansion and in corresponding western regions in the United States and Canada.

A scholar could easily fall into the trap of writing two separate histories, but St. Germain holds a steady course of drawing parallels in

the first and second chapters according to historical backgrounds and what was promised in the two agreements. However, the distinct circumstances of each case convinced St. Germain to use a technique that weaves together the cases in alternating chapters.

St. Germain has achieved a full treatment of a comparative study. Providing the necessary background histories, she substantiated the meaning of broken treaties in two significant accords that aimed at the heartlands of Indian country in Canada and the United States. The governments' obligations proved overwhelming, as one sought the central areas of Alberta and Saskatchewan and the other seized the Black Hills in response to the failures of indigenous peoples on their parts of the agreements. She has succeeded in making a major contribution to Indian history, Native studies, federal Indian law, federal government policy history, political science, and trans-border studies. This book alerts scholars of Indian history in this country to similarities in Canada-First Nations history. Well written and researched from primary sources in both the United States and Canada, this volume reminds us how significant tribal sovereignty was and how it continues to inform tribal governments today.

DONALD L. FIXICO
Arizona State University

The Indian Commissioners: Agents of the State and Indian Policy in Canada's Prairie West, 1873–1932. By Brian E. Titley. (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2009. xi + 266 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. CAN\$33.95.)

Brian Titley's study of Canadian Indian commissioners is a valuable addition to his earlier works on Superintendent of Indian Affairs Duncan Campbell Scott and Indian

Commissioner Edgar Dewdney. Taking a broader perspective on the Department of Indian Affairs (DIA) in its formative years, Titley examines the position of Indian commissioner as it was held by six men from 1873 until 1932, when the position was abolished. As a federal appointee, the commissioner was responsible for directing policy in the Canadian North-West, a position which carried considerable latitude and authority in the governance of First Nations populations.

J. A. N. Provencher (1873–1878) and David Laird (1876–1879) presided over the DIA in the North-West during the crucial years when Treaties 3 through 7 were signed between First Nations peoples and the Canadian government. Provencher and Laird were responsible for implementing the signed treaties, a task which repeatedly ran headlong into poor organization and departmental parsimony. This lack of foresight led to the tumultuous decade under Edgar Dewdney (1879–1888), which witnessed the end of the buffalo, widespread starvation, rising First Nations discontent, and the North-West Rebellion in 1885. At the end of Dewdney's tenure, the DIA exercised much greater control over First Nations people. Hayter Reed (1888–1893) further consolidated government authority at the expense of First Nations autonomy, most notably represented by the Pass System, which restricted movement throughout the North-West. The next two Indian commissioners, A. E. Forget (1893–1898) and David Laird, in his second tenure (1898–1909), led during an era of explosive European settlement in the region. During these years, government policies aimed at assimilating First Nations people to the emerging industrial capitalist order, attempted largely through the expansion of residential and industrial schools. William Morris Graham (1920–1932) presided over the failed outcome of these earlier policies, administering an education system which neither educated nor assimilated its young subjects.

One constant throughout Titley's book is the central importance of assimilation to Indian affairs policy. Titley portrays a great historical irony by showing how this goal was pursued through policies which were almost entirely steeped in segregation and marginalization. He also takes care to place these policies in their proper colonial context. Measures of segregation, such as residential schools and reserves, made First Nations people colonial subjects of a larger imperial project. *The Indian Commissioners* helps to illustrate an important element of how Canada's officials contributed to this project in the shaping of the North-West.

TED MCCOY
Trent University

We Are All Treaty People: Prairie Essays.

By Roger Epp. (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2008. xii + 235 pp. Notes, index. CAN\$26.95.)

Most American readers interested in rural issues will have at least a passing familiarity with Wendell Berry, Wes Jackson of The Land Institute, the Center for Rural Affairs in Nebraska, or Thomas Frank's *What's the Matter with Kansas*. Canadian readers may also know of Stan Rowe. Roger Epp shares the concerns of these writers but is arguably the most intellectually complex and provocative. In *We Are All Treaty People*, Epp provides a powerful narrative development of these concerns.

In the title essay, subtitled "History, Reconciliation, and the 'Settler Problem,'" Epp argues that the numbered treaties of the 1870s and later, on the prairies, still define the relationships of all prairie peoples to the land and to each other, not just as individuals but as communities with communal responsibilities. Epp traces his family's histories in Oklahoma and Saskatchewan and his