

The Western History Association

---

Review

Author(s): Susan A. Miller

Review by: Susan A. Miller

Source: *The Western Historical Quarterly*, Vol. 29, No. 4 (Winter, 1998), pp. 534-535

Published by: [Western Historical Quarterly, Utah State University](#) on behalf of [The Western History Association](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/970421>

Accessed: 16-07-2015 20:20 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*Western Historical Quarterly*, Utah State University and The Western History Association are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Western Historical Quarterly*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

convinced Dartmouth College, the University of Oklahoma, and Stanford University to eliminate their Indian nicknames and sports mascots in the early 1970s. Even given its weaknesses, the book is a valuable contribution to twentieth-century Native American history and will be a valuable reference source in the coming years.

STEVEN J. CRUM  
*University of California, Davis*

***Shingwauk's Vision: A History of Native Residential Schools.*** By J. R. Miller. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996. xii + 582 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. £52.00, cloth; £22.00, paper, UK; \$70.00, cloth; \$29.95, paper, North America.)

Historian J. R. Miller examines the history of the Canadian system of residential schooling for indigenous children in this first, book-length study of that topic. His method employs the sources of institutional history as well as a body of testimony by indigenous persons affected by the policy. In its "Canadianness," this book illustrates a clear difference between Canadian and U. S. approaches, not only to the study of the indigenous past, but also to relations with indigenous peoples generally.

The five chapters of part one survey indigenous methods of education—indirect and noncoercive—and then narrate the chronology of Canadian residential schools from the earliest example founded by Recollets in New France in 1620 to the Canadian federal system operated by Christian denominations in the 1920s. Part two comprises seven chapters organized thematically. They examine classroom and class, race and assimilation, gender, work and recreation, childcare, abuse within the schools, and resistance to the system by students, parents, communities, and some members of the schools' staffs. Part three

narrates, in two chapters, the final phase of the schools' history in which the policy was abandoned and, to determine where responsibility lies, assesses the effects of the policy on Native communities, families, and individuals.

This is not the breezy read of David Wallace Adams's cognate work on the United States system of Indian boarding schools (*Education for Extinction*, Lawrence, Kansas, 1995). The narrative's progression from chronology to thematic organization and back to chronology involves much repetition. Further, the amount of examples will discourage a general readership. That copious use of example serves an important purpose, however, as the author builds carefully if tediously toward conclusions that indict the system and determine accountability.

In an analysis resembling John W. Blassingame's application of prisoner-of-war studies to the American slavery institution (*The Slave Community*, New York, 1979), Miller finds the Canadian residential schools coercive and often brutal. They failed to educate their young victims or prepare them for occupations. Ultimately, they disabled individuals and thus contributed to the disruption of entire indigenous communities.

A discussion of vision poses different possibilities than a discussion of extinction. Whereas *Education for Extinction* ends in 1928, *Shingwauk's Vision* carries the analysis into the 1990s. While the United States—government, churches, and people—ignore the consequences of their boarding-school policy, Canada is beginning to address its obligations within the framework of a healing process. This book's title implies hope for realization of the vision of the Anishinabe (Ojibwey) Chief Augustine Shingwauk, who called in 1832 for:

[a] big teaching wigwam . . . where children from the Great Chippewa Lake would be received and clothed, and fed, and taught how to read and how to write; and

also how to farm and build houses, and make clothing so that by[e] and bye they might go back and teach their own people (p. 6).

This book is an important resource on the fate and prognosis of that vision.

SUSAN A. MILLER  
*University of Nebraska-Lincoln*

***The Tutor'd Mind: Indian Missionary-Writers in Antebellum America.*** By Bernd C. Peyer. (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1997. x + 420 pp. Illustrations, notes, index. \$19.95, paper.)

This fine work renders many services. Most importantly, Bernd C. Peyer fulfills the title's promise by providing an excellent analysis of representative American Indian missionary writers from the early seventeenth century to the beginning of the Civil War. In his biographies of four important antebellum Indian writers, Peyer argues that each used literacy and bi- or multi-lingualism to mediate between Indian and European-American societies. As culture brokers or transcultural individuals, these writers gained exceptional influence among both groups. The book's other contributions come from surveys of each writer's tribal history and from a solid survey of antebellum social and religious history.

The action unfolds along the intellectual borderland where Indian and European-American colonial societies met and where transcultural individuals, typically the children of mixed marriages, used their language skills to confront colonial power. Peyer focuses on an era he alternately identifies as antebellum and the salvationist phase of American Indian literature, marked by writers educated by Christian missionaries and trained to become ministers. Peyer builds his study on four case studies, Samson Occom (Mohegan, 1723–1793), William Apess (Pequot-

Mashpee, 1798–1839), Elias Boudinot (Cherokee, 1804–1839), and George Copway (Canadian Anishinabe, 1818–1869), each of whom saw in Christianity and European-American society not only spiritual elements to supplement his original beliefs, but also means for responding to the colonial situation. Occom became a well-traveled, well-connected ordained minister and a respected elder in his community. Apess, after an angel appeared to him in a dream or vision, became a Methodist preacher and also helped organize a Mashpee revolt against the Massachusetts government, which included a Mashpee "Declaration of Independence" (p. 143). After a Moravian mission school education, Boudinot edited the *Cherokee Phoenix* and used it to promote Protestant ideals among the Cherokees." Copway became a Methodist and traveled widely throughout North America and Europe before returning to Michigan, then Canada, where he converted to Roman Catholicism and worked as a healer among the Algonquians and Iroquois.

Peyer covers an astonishing range of material and reveals in lucid prose the fruits of extensive research. The book's greatest shortcoming is Peyer's total reliance on English-language materials, which limits his analysis. Learning each author's native language and finding documents for a more complete study might be prohibitive, or even impossible, but this weakness suggests the need for further research into what transcultural individuals said to their people in their own language, which, in turn, will promote a richer understanding of these important cultural borderlands. Peyer compensates by comparing, when possible, documents produced expressly for publication to oral presentations, typically transcribed sermons or speeches. All told, the resulting study makes an outstanding contribution to the history of antebellum Indians and their America.

TODD M. KERSTETTER  
*Texas Christian University*